



# It takes a village

Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan (Phase 3)

Mid-Term Review November 2019

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to the CARE International in Afghanistan management and staff for their time, patience and honesty in sharing their opinions, challenges and successes with the *Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan (Phase 3) Program*.

Special thanks to Education MEL Supervisor, Naqibullah Danishjow, and Education MEL Officer, Mariam Arian in providing technical support and program insights, the coordination of field visits and providing timely feedback. Thanks also to Education Senior Program Coordinator, Wahidullah Wahid, EEA3 Project Manager, Azizullah Nadiri, and Program Quality Coordinator, Haqmal Munib for their program oversight and contextual guidance, and the EEA3 provincial coordinators and teams who provided both technical and logistical support throughout the fieldwork and analysis.

Finally, many thanks to the students, teachers, parents and communities that gave freely of their time to sit and explain their experiences. Without their generosity in welcoming us into their classrooms and homes and sharing valuable information about their lives, this review could not have happened.

*Josie Huxtable (Independent Consultant – Gender Equality and Social Inclusion)*



Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan (Phase 3) is supported by the Australian Government and implemented by CARE. An Australian aid initiative implemented by CARE on behalf of the Australian Government.

This publication has been funded by the Australian Government through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. The views expressed in this publication are the author's alone and are not necessarily the views of the Australian Government.

## ACRONYMS

<b>CBE</b>	Community-Based Education
<b>DED</b>	District Education Department
<b>ECD</b>	Early Childhood Development
<b>ECE</b>	Early Childhood Education
<b>EEA</b>	Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan
<b>EEA-3</b>	Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan – Phase 3
<b>EMIS</b>	Education Management Information System
<b>EOPO</b>	End of Project Outcomes (EOPO)
<b>INEE</b>	Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies
<b>LSCBE</b>	Lower Secondary Community-Based Education
<b>MEL</b>	Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning
<b>MoE</b>	Ministry of Education
<b>NESP</b>	National Education Strategic Plan for Afghanistan
<b>PCBE</b>	Primary Community-based Education
<b>PED</b>	Provincial Education Department
<b>PTA</b>	Parents and Teachers Association
<b>SIP</b>	School Improvement Plan
<b>VEC</b>	Village Education Committees

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.1 Project Background .....	16
2.0 METHODOLOGY .....	18
2.1 Scope and Purpose.....	18
2.2. Analytical Framework .....	18
2.3 Key Evaluation Questions.....	20
2.4 Review Tools .....	21
2.5 Sampling .....	23
2.6 Review Challenges .....	27
2.7 Structure of findings.....	27
3.0 FINDINGS .....	29
3.1 Effectiveness .....	29
3.2 Impact .....	53
3.3 Sustainability .....	55
3.4 Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning .....	56
4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	57
4.1 Current Programming.....	57
4.2 Future Programming .....	59
ANNEX 1 STORIES OF CHANGE .....	60
ANNEX 2 TERMS OF REFERENCE .....	64
ANNEX 3 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS .....	75
A. PCBE STUDENT SURVEY .....	75
B. LCBE STUDENT SURVEY .....	85
C. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: TEACHERS .....	94

D. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: PARENTS .....	100
E. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: VEC MEMBERS .....	105
F. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: COMMUNITY LEADERS/RELIGIOUS LEADERS .....	110
G: SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: MINISTRY OF EDUCATION PROVINCIAL/DISTRICT .....	114
H. STORIES OF CHANGE GUIDE: COLLECTING STORIES ABOUT SIGNIFICANT CHANGES BY INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEW .....	118
I: EVALUATION PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM .....	122

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Afghanistan illustrates that a country emerging from decades of sustained conflict can follow a path toward development and stabilisation through working on fundamental sectors such as education. There are presently 9.2 million students (39% of which are girls) in primary and secondary schools, an impressive increase from an estimated 1 million students in 2001. Despite this progress, major inequities persist within the Afghan education system, based on gender, economics, geographic location, and language. Afghanistan's government provides fewer schools for girls than boys at both the primary and secondary levels. In half the country's provinces, fewer than 20% of teachers are female – a major barrier for the many girls whose families will not accept their being taught by a man, especially as they become adolescents. Girls are often kept home due to discriminatory attitudes that do not value or permit their education. A third of girls marry before 18, and once engaged or married, many girls are compelled to drop out of school. Further barriers are embodied in long and dangerous routes to schools and about 41% of schools have no buildings, and many lack boundary walls, water, and toilets – all of which disproportionately affect girls. There are also major differences in enrolment between rural and urban areas, with girls from rural poor families being most affected.<sup>1</sup>

Considering these challenges, local and international organizations are working through different initiatives to support the government to make sure all children in Afghanistan can access quality education. CARE International in Afghanistan (CARE Afghanistan) has been implementing the *Empowerment through Education (EEA)* Project in Afghanistan since May 2011 and the project is now in its third phase. EEA works with communities in five Provinces (Ghazni, Kapisa, Khost, Paktia and Parwan) to set up a community-based education (CBE) program in rural and remote communities, where regular public schools are located far from villages and conservative social norms and safety concerns severely restrict girls' mobility and access to schooling. Community-based education is a network of classes, often held in homes, that allow children, particularly girls, to access education in communities far from a government school.

The goal and end-of-project outcomes of EEA- 3 are:

### Goal

Children, particularly girls, in targeted communities of five provinces of Afghanistan will have access to a broader range of opportunities in life after obtaining a quality, empowering education.

### End-of-Project Outcomes

- *EOPO 1:* Increase children's, particularly girls, access to basic education in grades one to nine through community-based education.
- *EOPO 2:* Improve the quality of education through training and coaching of teachers, aligned with Ministry of Education (MoE) policies.
- *EOPO 3:* Increase girls' skills, confidence and abilities to participate in school decision-making structures and technical skills for employment.
- *EOPO 4:* Increase community support for girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education.
- *EOPO 5:* Strengthen stakeholder networks to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice.

---

<sup>1</sup> Human Rights Watch. 2017. 'I won't be a doctor and one-day you'll be sick' Girls Access to Education in Afghanistan'. New York.

Given the growing interest in community-based education within the Afghan context – the Ministry of Education released a Community-based Education Policy and Guidelines in January 2018 – this review is timely.

The overall purpose of this review was to evaluate whether project activities (from 1 January 2018 to 30 June 2019) are on track in terms of achieving the objectives/outcomes that have been set, and to learn and improve the ongoing work for the remaining period of the EEA-3 project (July 2019 - December 2020). The focus of the review was on assessing current project strategies and activities within a longer-term view of expected impact and whether progress appears to be tracking towards intended outcomes. The priority was to understand and improve the quality of implementation, and therefore the emphasis of the review was on effectiveness, impact and sustainability.

The review was mixed-method comprising student surveys with primary (PCBE) and lower-secondary students (LSCBE); semi-structured in-depth interviews with teachers; parents of students; members of male and female VECs; religious/community leaders, Ministry of Education representatives, and program staff; and stories of change with current and graduate lower-secondary CBE girls.

### Key findings

**EOPO 1: Increase children's, particularly girls, access to basic education in grades one to nine through community-based education.**

#### Achievements

*Girls' enrolment is increasing for both primary and secondary levels.* Community-based education is largely designed to benefit girls, who, due to custom and tradition, are often not allowed to go to school, especially if the school in question is too far from home, has male teachers, or is not viewed favourably by the community. The review found that currently girls account for more than 79% of PCBE students and 100% of LSCBE students under EEA3. The increased enrolment of girls is linked to CARE's model of recruiting teaching staff from within communities, almost always female, meaning they are situated within the community and are overseen by a Village Education Committee (VEC), almost made up of local people who are known and trusted within the community. This allows even highly conservative, traditional households to allow their daughters to attend.

*A growing cadre of competent and effective female teachers is increasing girls' enrolment.* The review found the presence of female teachers was one of the determining factors for parents' decision-making on whether to enrol their daughters in school. Under EEA3 there are currently 235 female teachers being supported<sup>2</sup> which is triple the number of female teachers supported under the previous phase. PED/DED officials indicates that this strategy is working, not only within the community-based schooling framework but also the formal MoE system. Parents highlighted significant benefits to having female students with female teachers, such that they could more readily communicate with another female and that girls were often less shy to discuss issues with teachers about school or challenges outside school.

*Girls are increasingly furthering their education and skill-base following graduation.* The review found that both PCBE and LSCBE female students are continuing their education and progressively graduating. Previous research found that that 90% of the girls who completed LSCBE in 2009-2013 were able to transition into high school and complete their education.<sup>3</sup> The review found that LSCBE girls that graduate are increasingly taking up opportunities in further education enrolling at high school and universities (engineering, literature, teacher training, medicine, information technology) and/or seeking employment opportunities outside the home such as contract teaching at both MoE and CBE schools or working as nurses and midwives. In this way, LSCBE graduates are supporting a shift in perceptions of

---

<sup>2</sup> EEA3 Project 17<sup>th</sup> Interim Report for DFAT June 2019

<sup>3</sup> CARE International in Afghanistan (2016) Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan – 2 Mid-Term Evaluation Report, p.15

acceptable educational and vocational pathways and role for women and contributing to longer-term changes in social norms.

*Parents are encouraged to prioritise girls' school attendance through active Village Education Committees.*

The review found that VECs have been influential and active in their support for classes, ensuring that classes are monitored and parents are notified when girls are absent from classes. Currently, attendance rates for PCBE girls is a remarkable 94% and for LSCBE girls 99%. In order to encourage attendance, VEC members referred to various methods including contacting families should a student not come to class for a couple of days and following up with families to provide them with support to manage any particular issues that cause absence from school, such as economic constraints, household responsibilities or illness. Teachers also make a concerted effort to follow up with absent students when they return to class.

*Girls view community-based education schools as accessible, respectful and safe learning environments.*

The review found that teachers work towards creating a safe and respectful learning environment for students through consistently praising student's performance, using alternative approaches to discipline and addressing any harassment issues. The majority of teachers and students perceive a high level of safety within and outside of schools. Teachers and parents pointed to the close proximity of the school to home, supportive community leaders and community ownership of the school, to explain the improved safety children feel in school, as well as walking to school.

## Challenges

*Low but continued dropout rates for economic reasons.* Although respondents did not raise retention and drop-outs as an issue, project monitoring data shows that EEA3 throughout its implementation has experienced low but continued dropout and transfer rates for PCBE students across all five districts, mainly due to relocation of families to other areas within provinces to seek better job opportunities. All transferred students have been provided with formal documents to continue their further education in any MoE or CBE school in their new home locations. The relocation of families for economic reasons is beyond the control of the project itself, and the project has taken all necessary steps to ensure smooth transition of students to MoE schools.

*Teacher and VEC communication with parents is on administration rather than learning.* Teachers and VECs rarely discuss learning outcomes with parents, and focus predominately on issues of administration or attendance. Teachers should be supported on how they communicate academic performance to parents who are not familiar with the system, so that their children's futures and potential can be recognised and encouraged as they transition between primary and lower-secondary, or as young adolescent women graduating from LSCBE begin to advocate for enrolment at high school/training institutes/universities.

## **EOPO 2: Improve the quality of education through training and coaching of teachers, aligned with Ministry of Education (MoE) policies.**

## Achievements

*Effective competency-based teacher training and mentoring is supporting girls learning outcomes.* EEA3 has developed teacher-training modules for novice teachers with limited formal teaching experience. The majority of teachers interviewed suggesting trainings have widened their skills sets and increased not only their subject-specific knowledge, but also their confidence to teach and apply learnings. This finding is supported by project monitoring data, for example, data from pre and post-testing during the most recent round of training for PCBE teachers revealed significant improvements in knowledge and capacity with scores improving, on average, by 40%.<sup>4</sup> Teachers also indicate that trainings have helped to develop their capacity to engage students – exposure to new teaching methodologies has improved their understanding of how to engage both boy and girl students in a more participatory way.

---

<sup>4</sup> EEA-3 Project 17<sup>th</sup> Interim Report for DFAT (January-June 2019).

*Teachers are perceived to be professional and highly qualified by VECs and parents.* Parents are satisfied with and have a great deal of confidence in the teaching and quality of education being delivered through the PCBE and LSCBE classes under EEA3. Across all provinces, parents referred to role of VECs in monitoring and assessing the performance of teachers and ensuring the quality of classes, as a strategy which instilled confidence. VEC members are confident their monitoring and observations of teachers in the classroom is leading to better quality teaching and learning outcomes for students.

*Teachers are using girl/child-centred approaches that allow children to learn through interaction, asking questions, participating in discussions and debates and engaging in pair and group work.* The review findings suggest that girls and boys are being treated equally by teachers in the classroom when classes are mixed, and that there are opportunities for discussion and debate and engaging in group work in culturally appropriate ways.

*Community-based education schools and classrooms are well-resourced with adequate facilities.* Overall teachers, students and parents indicated they were satisfied with the educational resources and facilities available to them. As CBE classes are typically held in community member's homes or a shared community space, the availability of sanitation facilities varies. At the time of the review 188 refurbishment activities in CBE/LSCBE classrooms had been undertaken across the target provinces. While classrooms are provided by the community, EEA3 provides the necessary education resources for teachers and students. Students receive school supplies twice a year (stationery set including notebooks, pens, pencils, bags, erasers, pencil sharpeners, crayons, calligraphy pens) and project monitoring data indicates that all CBE supported students have received stationery sets for this year. Teachers receive material annually (textbooks for respective grades and training manuals and guidelines as well as items such as blackboards, blackboard erasers, chalk, markers and attendance books). In addition, the project has ensured that all CBE classes are equipped with up to date library materials that can be used by students, teachers and community members for educational and recreational purposes.

## Challenges

*Provision of adequate infrastructure and access to sanitation facilities.* The only notable issue raised by teachers, parents and VEC members in relation to the quality of education or educational environment, were regarding the adequacy of the infrastructure available to them. In these instances, teachers, parents and VEC members reported that either classrooms were inadequate *but* are currently under refurbishment, or that toilets were not available or not suitable. EEA3 supports provides small classroom improvement grants to VECs to identify and oversee refurbishment activities (including improving access to sanitation facilities) however due to the two-month long office closure following the tragic security incident in Kabul in May 2019, this activity was postponed. However, this activity has recently recommenced and 52 classroom grants have now been provided to CBE schools.

**EOPO 3: Increase girls' skills, confidence and abilities to participate in school decision-making structures and technical skills for employment.**

## Achievements

*Girls are increasing their leadership and voice through active peer groups and life skills development.* EEA3's CBE model provides different pathways for adolescent girls to develop and practice their leadership competencies, confidence and life skills through the participation in peer groups and membership of VECs. Currently there are 450 peer groups (180 primary, 270 lower-secondary) and all are active, meeting monthly or more, in Parwan, Kapisa, Ghazni and Khost provinces. Lower-secondary peer group members also have the opportunities to be part of VECs to develop their confidence, capabilities and their leadership skills, by participating in school management and decision-making. One to two girls are currently serving on 137 VECs on a rotational system that changes monthly. Over the course of 2019, 70% girls have had the opportunity to input peer perspectives into VECs and feedback VECs actions to peers. The review found that girls in both PCBE and LSCBE are increasing their leadership skills and voice through active peer groups and life skills development. Data for current and

graduate LSCBE students highlighted that most girls feel confident and valued within their families and enjoyed sharing their thoughts and opinions with their families. Data suggests that parents and caregivers are indeed engaged with their daughter's experiences in school and listen to their opinions (though they remain almost always more engaged with their sons by comparison).

*LSCBE graduates have increased employment options outside the home and are moving towards economic independence.* EEA-3 provides ninth-grade LSCBE students with para-professional training in teaching and health education as well as extra-curricular activities such as computer skills. The review found current and graduate LSCBE students are taking up these options with commitment and enthusiasm, and are experiencing economic independence due to the skills they have gained during paraprofessional training. Young women graduates are mentoring their younger peers and challenging the status quo of 'you can't be what you can't see' through modelling examples of future career and educational possibilities.

*Girls have increased exposure to women in non-traditional roles through female teachers and VEC members.* The review found that both male and female teachers consider the recruitment of female teachers as important, not only as way to facilitate girl's enrolment and continued attendance but also to provide consistent and valuable role models for female students and the wider community. These perspectives are also shared by LSCBE students who report looking to female teachers and their abilities, ethics and characteristics as important role models and possible roadmaps in their own futures and development.

#### **EPO 4: Increase community support for girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education.**

##### **Achievements**

*Girls' education is increasingly valued and supported by the wider community.* The review found that parents' and caregivers' attitudes towards girls' education are largely supportive – many parents and caregivers noted that they recognised the value of girls receiving an education and supported efforts to ensure their daughters attended class – but highlighted that the proximity of CBE schools is the primary reason that their daughters are now attending class. Qualitative data from community and religious leaders also indicates that they are actively mobilising families to allow their daughters to attend school. There is also substantial support for educated girls to be economically active following graduation, although the support is largely for women to work as teachers within CBE schools or in local medical centres rather than in other types of employment outside the home.

*Women and girls are increasingly represented in decision-making structures and processes for community-based education.* The review found both female and male VECs indicate they have been influential and active in their support for classes, ensuring classes are monitored and by following up with families directly when a girl misses classes. This appears to reflect improved confidence in communicating with families about the value of education. Notably among communities where females appeared to play an active role and hold a leadership position within VECs, their male counterparts recognized and reported their value regularly. This may suggest that greater female participation and engagement is more likely when male VECs have witnessed the value and additional support females can provide.

*Shifting community attitudes towards preventing or delaying early marriage of girls.* The review found that more parents are willing to wait to marry their daughters until they've finished their education. In addition, there seems to be shifting attitudes towards seeing a positive connection between a girl's educational attainment and improvements in their health, skills and employment options, as well as the health and wellbeing of their future family and children her capacities as a wife, a mother and daughter. Families are connecting educational skills such as the ability to read and write to better domestic skills in managing a household budget, medical issues and general well-being of children and the family.

## Challenges

*Early marriage as a barrier to school participation.* The review found that whilst the majority of parents, teachers, community and religious leaders reported positive attitudes towards avoiding marriage at a young age, once married, a girl's opportunity to continue her schooling was a private decision to be taken by her husband and father-in-law. Religious leaders and VEC members indicated that whilst they felt capable of approaching a girl's own family *prior* to marriage to discuss the possibility of delaying marriage and the importance of education, *once married* their advocacy role was more challenging and the decision was ultimately out of their hands. Many noted that while theoretically a girl could still continue her education after marriage, she was likely to face considerably more barriers as a young girl then needs to demonstrate their ability to adhere to the social norms of being a wife and the responsibilities that come with that. Whilst the majority of respondents in this review supported delayed marriage, there is plenty of evidence that early marriage persists at rates which suggest one in three young girls will be married before the age of 18. These unions mainly happen in rural and remote areas, including where EEA3 is being implemented<sup>5</sup>.

**EOPO 5: Strengthen stakeholder networks to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice.**

## Achievements

*Strong coordination and linkages between CARE CBE schools and the Ministry of Education.* EEA3 collaborates closely with provincial and district education departments (PED/DED) officials through regular coordination meetings to share results, updates on progress and undertake joint monitoring visits of primary and lower-secondary CBE schools. During the most recent project reporting period 209 joint monitoring visits were conducted with MoE officials across the five project provinces. The review found PED and DED officials report that there is appreciation for the EEA3 program which is seen to be strongly aligned with, and complementing the MoE formal education system which currently does not have the resources and capacity to reach remote and rural areas where EEA3 is being implemented.

*Capacity development of teachers within the formal education system.* EEA3 recognises the importance of increasing the capacity of local MoE teaching counterparts as well as CBE teachers and as such, MoE staff and MoE hub school teachers are invited to participate in CBE teacher training activities. For example, in the most recent round of training, EEA3 provided training opportunities for 182 (91 female) hub school teachers, principals and MoE staff from PED and DED. In addition, to ensure that there is a smooth transition/full integration of CBE classes into the formal education system at the end of the EEA3 project (depending on availability of resources and capacity within local education departments) CBE teachers are being registered with the nearest MoE schools (hub schools identified together with MoE). At the time of the review all CBE/LSCBE teachers had been registered with MoE schools. Interviews with PED/DED officials indicate that this is seen to be strengthening formal system as CARE-trained CBE teachers are consistently regarded as having higher quality teaching skills and methods.

## Challenges

*MoE stakeholders show commitment to supporting CBE components beyond the life of the project but resources are limited to do so.* Qualitative data found that PED/DED officials frequently noted the lack of available resources and capacity within the formal education system to either absorb transitioning

---

<sup>5</sup> MoLSAMD and UNICEF, July 2018. Child Marriage in Afghanistan: Changing the narrative. Kabul, Afghanistan.

CBE students into hub schools or when comparing CBE and MoE equivalent classes within schools. The overall perception is that MoE cannot provide the same level of teacher capacity development, supporting educational materials or infrastructure as CARE. Additionally, no PED/DED mentioned or were able to discuss the feasibility of integration of CBE schools into the formal system. CBE is acknowledged as part of the formal education system under the National Education Strategic Plan, and that the institutionalisation of CBE is recommended by the Plan, with NGOs progressively transitioning into a capacity building role.<sup>6</sup> Parents themselves indicate their reluctance to enrol their children in government schools because the resources did not meet the same standards as those available in their own community through the EEA3 community schooling system. EEA3 recognises the balance required in delivering accessible quality education to a generation of young girls in real time whilst at the same time working to build community demand and supply of quality education through the national formal school system by facilitating School Improvement Planning (SIP). Due to the two-month long office closure following the tragic security incident in Kabul in May 2019, this activity was postponed. However, this activity has recently recommenced and 54 hub schools have been identified for SIPs in 5 target provinces.

## Recommendations

The review findings and recommendations are leading into the winter vacation from January to March 2020, with the project currently ending in December 2020. Whilst all of the recommendations below are considered to ensure project impact and sustainability, in recognition of the remaining timeframes, project implementation schedule, recommendations have been ordered according to the current and future programming.

## Current Programming

*Build capacity of teachers to discuss student learning outcomes and academic achievement with parents.* Teachers should be supported on how they communicate learning outcomes and academic performance to parents who are not familiar with the system, so that their children's futures and potential can be recognised and encouraged as they transition between primary and lower-secondary schools, or as young adolescent women graduating from LSCBE begin to advocate within their families for opportunities such as enrolment at high school/training institutes/universities.

*Showcase successful young women graduates in diverse careers to broaden young girls understanding of employment options.* The awareness of potential employment options appeared to be greatly limited among girls – the majority referred to becoming doctors, teachers or engineers, further reflecting socio-cultural attitudes towards girls' employment. The position of a doctor is widely considered to be pinnacle of success and is generally accepted to be an appropriate role for both males and females. The role of teacher is also noted as a suitable role for girls based on social norms – as long as the teaching role is within the community. Many girls are widely unaware of employment options available to them either in their community or within the country. EEA3 could consider showcasing successful young women graduates in diverse careers, especially among secondary school students, to encourage a broader understanding of potential employment opportunities and the necessary skills sets required to fulfil such positions. Showcasing may involve short radio-style interviews or films that can be played in the classroom and/or peer group sessions. There may also be value in introducing simple small business development and management modules to the existing suite of paraprofessional training for those young girls that are facing early marriage or with

---

<sup>6</sup> Islamic Republic of Afghanistan – Ministry of Education (2017) National Education Strategic Plan 2017-2021, p.47

conservative families that would prefer ‘safe’ options such as tailoring, embroidery or weaving for their daughters.

*Capacity-building to strengthen VEC motivation and advocacy skills for engaging with hub schools beyond the life of the project.* EEA3’s strategy of working in partnership with MoE to integrate community-based schools into the formal system (subject to resource availability) is dependent on the capacity of VECs to leverage the potential value of collaboration with local government schools beyond coordination and reporting and instead, for continuing support and resource mobilisation (particularly in the context of ongoing economic insecurity and hardship for many families). Capacity-building should therefore be provided to VECs to develop their advocacy skills and confidence in approaching PED/DED officials and advocating for future support (beyond the integration of students from primary to secondary or high school).

*Develop strategies that aim to delay early marriage and reach already married girls to keep them in school.* In order to address early marriage effectively, it is necessary to focus on the different players involved and how they can be made agents of positive change in relation to child marriage, without unfairly or impractically placing the entirety of the onus for resisting child marriage entirely on young girls, or their families. This will require programming to develop specific messaging and advocacy around education for girls over the age of 12 – such advocacy work needs to focus on countering existing socio-cultural norms and demonstrating the value of girls’ education at later years through being potential wage earners rather than using marriage as income-generation. Techniques and support should be provided to religious leaders and VECs to engage more directly with both families involved – the bride’s family planning an early marriage *and* the groom’s/husband’s family to try and secure girls’ education before and after marriage. Peer groups when appropriately connected with female VECs could also create safe spaces and channels for them to speak up for what they want and speak out against harmful practices within a supportive environment and with adults that have capacity to respond in a culturally appropriate way. There may also be a need for teachers to provide supplementary teachings or materials for young married girls so that they can catch up on lessons missed due to their domestic responsibilities in their new role and families.

*Leverage the end-of-project evaluation for the design of a fourth phase.* The end-of-project evaluation of EEA3 (scheduled for October 2020) offers the potential to not only capture program outcomes and impact, but it can also provide a baseline for any future phases (assuming the program continues to implement in current districts and provinces). Taking this approach would mean allocating sufficient resources to conduct the CARE’s Common Indicator Framework in its entirety thereby measuring achievements across the four domains related to girls’ education and development (Attainment, Quality, Equality and Empowerment) as well as providing the necessary foundation for comprehensive program design. Using the CIF learning trends are tracked at multiple levels, identifying not only the acquisition of academic skills through standardized assessments but also the development of leadership skills, gender equitable attitudes, and the evolution of the environment within the broader community and school, focusing on the enablers for future usage of knowledge and skills. The importance of a multi-layered approach is particularly important in the Afghan context where hard data largely emerging from development projects can complement data collected at the national level, moving from simple tracking of average progress in the acquisition of basic literacy and numeracy to a sophisticated analysis of the broader progress at the individual and contextual levels.

### **Future Programming**

*Community financing for sustainability.* The current reliance on implementing partners for sustainability of the community-based schooling system needs to be recognised in future programming, with a focus on piloting different advocacy and resource mobilisation strategies and

models beyond that of integration with hub schools. Engaging parents and communities in dialogue and potentially expanding programming to create income-generation opportunities (or creating synergies with other livelihood programming) will be key to generating support and resources for education at the local level. Mobilising Community Development Councils (CDCs) to incorporate education into their development plans and proposals could be a more realistic option (noting there are limited roles for women to advocate within current CDC structures and ways of decision-making) and there are learnings from other program such as the Steps Towards Afghan Girls Educational Success II (STAGES) program that could inform the design of such interventions.

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

Afghanistan illustrates that a country emerging from decades of sustained conflict can follow a path toward development and stabilisation through working on fundamental sectors such as education. Afghanistan is a success story in increased availability of education and in the number of children attending school, girls included. Building up a management structure to handle such a rapid expansion of the education system, while simultaneously improving and maintaining quality, is a massive challenge. At the same time, the government and the international community are faced with tasks of ensuring the collection of accurate data for reporting and planning, the training and development of a sufficient number of qualified teachers, and the provision of a monitoring, evaluation, and assessment system for education quality.

The Afghan Ministry of Education (MoE) estimates that there are presently 9.2 million students (39% of which are girls) in primary and secondary schools, an impressive increase from an estimated 1 million students in 2001. However, around 3.5 million children (about 32% of the school-age population), the majority of which are girls (85%), remain out of school.<sup>7</sup> Only 37% of adolescent girls are literate, compared to 66% of adolescent boys. Limited education among adults in Afghanistan poses a significant challenge—the share of the population over 25 years that has completed any level of formal education is less than 7% for men and just 3% for women.

Major inequities persist within the Afghan education system, based on gender, economics, geographic location, and language. Afghanistan's government provides fewer schools for girls than boys at both the primary and secondary levels. In half the country's provinces, fewer than 20% of teachers are female – a major barrier for the many girls whose families will not accept their being taught by a man, especially as they become adolescents. Girls are often kept home due to discriminatory attitudes that do not value or permit their education. A third of girls marry before 18, and once engaged or married, many girls are compelled to drop out of school. Further barriers are embodied in long and dangerous routes to schools and about 41% of schools have no buildings, and many lack boundary walls, water, and toilets – all of which disproportionately affect girls. There are also major differences in enrolment between rural and urban areas, with girls from rural poor families being most affected.<sup>8</sup>

The Afghan education sector is confronted with numerous bottlenecks in its efforts to improve education. “Supply side” issues include the government's inability to provide security, limited human resources, poor infrastructure, and lack of trained teachers and teaching materials. On the demand side, economic factors and cultural barriers limit improvement. It is estimated that more than 10% of the schools are closed due to insecurity, warfare, and targeted destruction. Despite a lack of infrastructure, classes are held outdoors or in other venues, but more than half of schools are in tents, mosques, and private homes.

Considering these challenges, local and international organizations are working through different initiatives to support the government to make sure all children in Afghanistan can access quality education. CARE International in Afghanistan (CARE Afghanistan) has initiated several community-based education programs to promote educational access and quality learning opportunities for all children, particularly girls. Community-based education is a network of classes, often held in homes, that allow children, particularly girls, to access education in communities far from a government school.

---

<sup>7</sup> Ministry of Education. 2016. National Education Plan (NESP) III 2017-2021. Islamic Republic of Afghanistan.

<sup>8</sup> Human Rights Watch. 2017. ‘I won't be a doctor and one-day you'll be sick’ Girls Access to Education in Afghanistan’. New York.

## 1.1 Project Background

CARE has been implementing the *Empowerment through Education* (EEA) Project in Afghanistan since May 2011 and the project is now in its third phase. EEA works with communities in five Provinces (Ghazni, Kapisa, Khost, Paktia and Parwan) to set up a community-based education (CBE) program in rural and remote communities, where regular public schools are located far from villages and conservative social norms and safety concerns severely restrict girls' mobility and access to schooling.

The second phase of the EEA project (EEA-2) was providing early childhood education (4-6 year-olds) and primary community-based education (PCBE) classes (Grades 1-6) to girls and boys, and lower secondary (Grades 7-9) to girls in targeted communities. Girls attending lower-secondary community-based education classes (LSCBE) were also participating in leadership skills development and paraprofessional trainings in health and teaching, equipping girls for participation in decision-making processes at home and community levels, and for future employment. CARE's lower secondary CBE model is the only non-state lower secondary education program provided for girls in the country.

The third phase of the project (EEA-3) builds upon lessons learned and emerging trends observed in EEA-2 and other CARE projects implementing the CBE/LSCBE approach, in particular the transformative impact that completing LSCBE has on girls' lives. Reaching lower secondary is a breakthrough for girls: 87% of the girls who completed LSCBE (Grade 9) were able to continue their studies in regular government hub schools<sup>9</sup>. LSCBE graduates have been able to obtain gainful employment as teachers, nurses and social workers, and are actively contributing to their families' income. Communities are reportedly delaying girls' marriage to ensure completion of their education. The completion of LSCBE seems to be a game-changer for girls, not only allowing them to pursue expanded life opportunities, increasing their mobility and voice, but also enhancing their social status at home and community levels. It is clear that the benefits of education increase exponentially once girls have opportunities to attend CBE beyond Grade 6; these benefits also seem to expand into a broader shift in gender norms affecting girls.

For this reason, EEA-3 focuses on LSCBE (G7-9) and PCBE (G1-6) rather than Early Childhood Education services. This prioritises resources for LSCBE with significant impact for girls' education. The focus of EEA-3 is on transition from CBE to post-primary opportunities, particularly through LSCBE and shifts in community norms in order to allow adolescent girls to transition to secondary school and employment. All CBE schools under EEA-3 use the national MoE curriculum to strengthen sustainability, and improve integration. CARE encourages 100% of school-aged children from target communities to enrol in CBE classes<sup>10</sup>. Due to cultural barriers, low economic situation of communities and lack of awareness amongst communities about education, particularly girls' education, not all of those eligible to enrol in CBE do so.

The goal and end-of-project outcomes of EEA-3 are:

### Goal

Children, particularly girls, in targeted communities of five provinces of Afghanistan will have access to a broader range of opportunities in life after obtaining a quality, empowering education.

### End-of-Project Outcomes

---

<sup>9</sup> CARE Afghanistan. 2017. Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan Mid-Term Evaluation Report.

<sup>10</sup> Based on MOE's CBE policy, the size of CBE schools for primary classes is 35 students per class, whilst for lower secondary classes is 25 students per class. However, CBE providers are allowed to increase the enrolment of students based on the needs of the community. For example, some communities have up to 45 students per CBE class.

- *EOPO 1:* Increase children's, particularly girls, access to basic education in grades one to nine through community-based education.
- *EOPO 2:* Improve the quality of education through training and coaching of teachers, aligned with Ministry of Education (MoE) policies.
- *EOPO 3:* Increase girls' skills, confidence and abilities to participate in school decision-making structures and technical skills for employment.
- *EOPO 4:* Increase community support for girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education.
- *EOPO 5:* Strengthen stakeholder networks to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice.

CARE is seeking to strengthen its overall CBE program to meet the fundamental human rights and basic needs of a quality basic education for 7,586 <sup>11</sup> students (83% female for primary and 100% for lower secondary)<sup>12</sup> in 255 CBE primary and lower secondary community based classes taught by 421 schoolteachers (56% female), and managed by 252 Village Education Committees (58% female) in 158 rural and remote communities across the five target provinces.

EEA-3 is being implemented over the period January 2018-December 2020.

---

<sup>11</sup> These students will be supported over three-year period of this project.

<sup>12</sup> 2018 Annual Report

## 2.0 METHODOLOGY

### 2.1 Scope and Purpose

The mid-term review terms of reference states that the purpose of the review is to ‘*evaluate whether project activities (from 1 January 2018 to 30 June 2019) are on track in terms of achieving the objectives/outcomes that have been set, and to learn and improve the ongoing work for the remaining period of the EEA-3 project (July 2019 - December 2020). The midterm evaluation should lay the ground for the final evaluation of the Project*’.

Specific objectives include:

- Validate project theory of change and project assumptions, and make recommendations for adapting and streamlining the MEL frameworks.
- Provide recommendations to inform the future direction of the EEA project.
- Identify constraints/challenges/issues affecting progress and provide recommendations to address them.
- Identify opportunities to increase impact and enhance the implementation and management of the project.
- Assess the mainstreaming of cross cutting issues including Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment and Disability Inclusion.
- Provide CARE with recommendations to address any implementation challenges in the remainder of the program.
- Provide evidence of how the project intervention (including teachers stipend, female teacher/SMCs training and capacity building and supporting women’s decision-making in management of community-based education) whether indirectly or directly contributing to women economic empowerment.
- Provide baseline evidence for CARE’s global supplementary indicators for Education to measure change including:
  - ✓ EDU4: Communities’ Educational Opportunity Perception
  - ✓ EDU5: Teacher’s Gender Sensitivity
  - ✓ EDU6: Children’s Perception of Educational Equity and Equality
  - ✓ EDU7: Suitable Educational Environment
  - ✓ EDU9: Girl/child centred processes

### 2.2. Analytical Framework

The review analytical framework was based on 1) CARE International’s *Gender Equality Framework*<sup>13</sup> (GEF) and 2) CARE USA’s *Common Indicator Framework (CIF)*<sup>14</sup> on dimensions of girls’ empowerment through quality education. These two frameworks are complementary – the Common Indicator Framework can be used to mark progress through making tangible the specific dimensions of girls empowerment in education across four related domains – attainment, equality, quality and empowerment; while CARE’s framework for achieving gender equality, whether in economic, political or social spheres, requires change at both the individual level (agency) as well as systemic levels with

---

<sup>13</sup> CARE International, 2018. Gender Equality and Women’s Voice Guidance Note.

<sup>14</sup> CARE USA, 2014. Common Indicator Framework (CIF) Toolkit.

change required at both the informal level in relationships (relations) and the formal level in terms of institutional rules, laws and governmental policies (structures).

The combination of these two frameworks also supports the measurement of CARE's Global Supplementary Indicators on Education, particularly EDU4: Communities' Educational Opportunity Perception; EDU5: Teacher's Gender Sensitivity; EDU6: Children's Perception of Educational Equity and Equality; EDU7: Suitable Educational Environment and EDU9: Girl/child centred processes.

The alignment of these frameworks resulted in the framework below, and the review has used this to identify and analyse the interrelationships between gender equality and education outcomes under EEA-3.

ATTAINMENT	EQUALITY	QUALITY	EMPOWERMENT
<b>Completion</b> is defined as the degree to which enrollees that start an educational program finish based on a set of pre-determined requirements for the program.	<b>Communities' educational opportunity perception</b> is defined as the degree to which community members believe girls and boys have equal opportunities to participate in and benefit from education in the program area.	<b>Suitable educational environment</b> is defined as the degree to which schools and classrooms in target areas demonstrate social and physical learning environments that are gender-sensitive, healthy, safe, protective, and include adequate facilities (adapted from UNICEF).	<b>Supportive strategic relations</b> are defined as the degree to which formal and informal decision makers exercise their ability to make decisions in favour of girls' right to development.
<b>Persistence/retention</b> is defined as the degree to which beneficiaries that are enrolled in an educational program that continue to subsequent years, periods and/or levels.	<b>Teachers' gender sensitivity</b> is defined as the degree to which teachers are observed to be facilitating equal conditions for girls' and boys' learning using a standardized instrument.	<b>Relevant educational content</b> is defined as the degree to which innovations are able to promote regular use of curriculum and learning materials that cover basic skills with pertinent, gender-sensitive and contextually appropriate subject matter (adapted from UNICEF).	<b>Girls' agency</b> is expressed in the frequency with which girls exercise their rights and/or their rights are recognized in the law.
<b>Achievement</b> is defined as the degree to which direct beneficiaries demonstrate attainment and practical application of new skills as a result of the program.	<b>Children's perception of educational equity and equality</b> is defined as the degree to which children in the impact area believe girls and boys have equal opportunities to participate in and benefit from education in the program area.	<b>Girl/child-centred processes</b> are defined as the degree to which girl/child centred pedagogies and methodologies are evidenced in practice in the educational environment.	<b>Structural environment for girls</b> is expressed in whether girls have equitable access to basic human services.

## 2.3 Key Evaluation Questions

The key evaluation questions addressed during the review were taken from both the terms of reference and the EEA3 monitoring, evaluation and learning (MEL) plan, and are outlined in the table below. The focus of the review was on assessing the degree to which current project strategies and activities are understood within a longer-term view of expected impact and whether progress appears to be tracking towards intended outcomes. The priority at this stage is to understand and improve the quality of implementation, and therefore the emphasis of the evaluation is on effectiveness, impact and sustainability.

CRITERIA	KEY EVALUATION QUESTION	SUB- EVALUATION QUESTIONS
EFFECTIVENESS	How effective was the project in achieving its intended outcomes to date?	To what extent are children, particularly girls and students with disabilities, attending CARE's CBE/LSCBE classes?
		To what extent are children, particularly girls and students with disabilities, continuing their secondary education after completing CARE's CBE/LSCBE classes?
		To what extent do communities support girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education?
IMPACT	What were the expected/unexpected impacts on target communities (boys, girls, students with disabilities, mothers, fathers, families, female teachers, male teachers, VEC members, community leaders)?	What have been the expected/unexpected impacts on students, with and without disabilities (particularly girls)?
		To what extent have we seen changes in gender norms and behaviours (e.g. changes to recognition of women and girls' rights, changes to women and girls' mobility, changes to rates of early marriage, changes to women/girls decision-making, changes to women's opportunities for employment outside the home)?
		What has been the impact on Ministry of Education policy and practice? Is this change likely to be sustainable?
SUSTAINABILITY	What do we need to focus on over the next 18 months to ensure the project's interventions are sustainable?	Are changes we have seen to community attitudes (e.g. to the role of women, girls education, early marriage) likely to be sustainable? What more can CARE do to support the sustainability of this intervention?
		Are changes experienced by girls themselves likely to be sustainable? To what extent have we seen sustainable and enduring changes that will affect girls' future lives, and the lives of girls who come behind them? What more can CARE do to support the sustainability of this intervention?

## 2.4 Review Tools

Research was conducted using a combination of quantitative and qualitative research tools, and data was collected utilising paper surveys by external enumerators and entered by provincial monitoring and reporting officers into Microsoft Access for analysis, which was undertaken remotely by the external consultant.

QUANTITATIVE TOOLS	
Student Survey	Survey questionnaires were conducted with both male and female students in G4-9 in order to assess the integrated dimensions of educational quality and attainment with equality and empowerment.
QUALITATIVE TOOLS	
Semi-Structured in-depth Interviews (SII)	SSIs with parents, teachers, VEC members, community/religious leaders and PED/DED representatives were intended to draw out greater detail on learning behaviours and environments at home and in the classroom, and along with a broader picture of local attitudes to, and support for, CBE programmes, provided context to the programme's impacts and outcomes.
Stories of Change (SoC)	SoCs with LSCBE students (current and graduate) explored what is valued from the student perspective and any changes in knowledge, behaviour and/or attitudes at an individual level as a result of participation in the program. The stories provide a way of sharing information that might otherwise be missed and of giving voice to program impacts.

**Student survey:** two surveys were developed for students and conducted with grades 4-6 (PCBE) and grades 7-9 (LSCBE). The CIF toolkit consists of a comprehensive collection of 167 primarily quantitative questions across the domains of equality, quality and empowerment, plus an additional eight demographic questions. Questions from this toolkit were selected to fit the EEA-3 project theory of change and end-of-project outcomes, and contextualised for the five provinces where EEA-3 is being implemented. However, questions to measure the concept of attainment were not included in the survey – the completion, persistence/retention indicators were assessed primarily using project tracking data on program attendance and completion. The achievement indicator is measured by program participants' demonstration of attainment or application of skills – something that schools or program offices assess with their graduates.

In addition, Washington Group Short Set of Questions (WGQs) were used to identify students living with disabilities. The WGQs are a validated and endorsed tool developed to collect data on the functional difficulties, so as to avoid under-reporting due to, for example, stigma. The WGQs used to capture information on prevalence by using the "functional difficulty" approach, which asks respondents if they have any "difficulties doing certain activities because of a 'HEALTH PROBLEM'". The cut-off for identification of persons with disabilities, using the Washington Group Questions are:

- When survey participants state 'some difficulty' in 2 or more functional areas, and/or
- When survey participants state 'a lot of difficulty' or 'cannot do at all' in at least one area.

**Semi-structured in-depth interviews (SII):** SIs guides were developed to enable the review team to gain an understanding of the perspectives, behaviour and motivations of project participants/partners in order to identify the challenges and successes of activities and opportunities going forward. SIs were held with the following categories of respondents: teachers; parents of students; members of male and female VECs; religious/community leaders, Provincial and District Department of Education representatives, DFAT and CARE program staff ensuring a diversity of informed perspectives on different aspects of the project.

**Stories of Change (SoCs):** a SoC guide was developed to capture and demonstrate what is valued through the use of specific individual narratives. Structured with a beginning, middle and end, the guides focussed on the change that has taken place for individuals due to program activities and any unintended changes. SoCs were conducted with LSCBE current and graduate students - interviewing older students who have been in school for longer enabled a greater understanding of how education access and quality has changed over time and a more sophisticated understanding of the challenges.

The table below outlines the data collection tools as they apply to each category of respondent for the review.

TARGET GROUP	RESEARCH TOOL		
	Survey	SII	SoC
PCBE Students	✓		
LSCBE students (current)	✓		✓
LSCBE girls –(graduate)			✓
Teachers		✓	
Parents of students		✓	
VEC members		✓	
Religious/Community Leaders		✓	
CARE Staff/ DFAT staff		✓	
MoE		✓	

The mid-term review was also committed to ensuring ethical processes were used throughout the planning, implementation, and reporting of this review consistent with best-practice ethical approaches to gathering information for children and adolescents in international settings<sup>15</sup> and the *Australian Council for International Development's Guidelines for Ethical Research and Evaluation in Development*<sup>16</sup>.

Review ethics strategies applied during the review included:

- **Informed Consent:** during data collection included participant information forms, verbal consent processes, and media consent forms.
- **Ethical standards for research with children:** the research adhered to a best-practice set of standards for research with children in relation to their participation and consent with special consideration given to children who are in especially vulnerable positions (standards can be found in the evaluation plan). All research enumerators received training in these standards and practical skills development in how to apply them in advance of conducting interviews/survey data collection with children and youth. These standards were followed when interviewing children and adolescents under age 18 in order to ensure that interviews were a respectful and positive experience for all involved.

<sup>15</sup> Guidance is taken from: Horizons Population Council, IMPACT, and Family Health International. Ethical Approaches to Gathering Information for Children and Adolescents in International Settings: Guidelines and Resources. Section 2.

<sup>16</sup> Australian Council for International Development, *Guidelines for Ethical Research and Evaluation in Development*, 2015.

## 2.5 Sampling

### *Selection of evaluation sites*

EEA-3 is being implemented across five provinces (Ghazni, Kapisa, Paktya, Khost and Parwan Provinces) though not all five provinces have both primary and lower-secondary CBE. Primary CBE classes are being implemented across Ghazni, Kapisa, Paktya and Parwan provinces whilst lower-secondary CBE is being implemented in Ghazni, Kapisa, Khost, and Parwan Provinces.

To make the most effective use of limited resources, the mid-term review applied a random sampling approach across all five provinces for the quantitative methods (questionnaires with PCBE and LSCBE students) and a purposeful sampling approach for the qualitative methods (SSIs and SoCs). Purposive sampling was done across the three provinces where both PCBE and LSCBE are being implemented (Ghazni Province); where PCBE is being implemented (Paktya Province); and where the LSCBE program has been implemented the longest (Khost Province). Random sampling for the questionnaire will ensure the generalizability of findings by minimising the potential for bias in selection. Purposeful sampling is widely used in qualitative research and involves identifying and selecting individuals or groups of individuals that are especially knowledgeable about or experienced in the research areas of interest and/or information-rich cases. Combining these two sampling approaches is intended to achieve both a depth of understanding (from the qualitative data) and a breadth of understanding (from the quantitative data).

The final selection of districts and villages was based on logistical considerations including: security, travel and time constraints, ease of access, and available transportation and lodging options.

### *Survey Sample size*

As of June 2019 – EEA-3 had reached 7,132 (6,076 girls) CBE students. The breakdown information includes 4,946 (3,890 girls) at CBE primary level and 2,186 (100% girls) students at LSCBE level.

Taking the student population of 7,132 and using a confidence level of 95%; a 5% margin of error; standard deviation of 0.5 – the sample size for the review was determined to be 390 randomly selected students (114 of which must proportionally be LSCBE). To allow for non-response rate a total of 406 were interviewed. Given the complexity of some of the concepts covered in the student survey the sample is drawn from students in Grades 4-9 only.

The table below outlines the selected provinces and districts, target groups and the actual sample size numbers for each.

PROVINCE	DISTRICT	CLASSTYPE	TARGET SAMPLE		
			STUDENTS SURVEY TOOL	SSI TOOL	SOC
GHAZNI	Ghazni Center	Primary	a. 10 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls (2 per class if possible) b. 202 PCBE students interviewed (G4-6). 160 girls; 42 boys	a. Teachers: 2 (1 PCBE, 1 LSCBE both female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male) e.PED/DED 2 (1 district level, male or female, 1 provincial level, male or female)	2 LSCBE students current (both female) - consult CARE story development template + informed consent
		LSCBE			
KAPISA	Hesa Awal Kohestan	LSCBE	13 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls	No Qualitative data collection in this province	

PROVINCE	DISTRICT	CLASSTYPE	TARGET SAMPLE		
			STUDENTS SURVEY TOOL	SSI TOOL	SOC
	<i>Hesa Dowom Kohestan</i>		14 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls		
	<i>Mahmood Raqi</i>		13 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls		
KHOST	<i>Matun</i>	LSCBE	16 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls	a. Teachers: 2 (One male, one female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male) e. PED/DED 2 (1 district level, male or female, 1 provincial level, male or female) for overall khost province	2 LSCBE students graduate (both female)
	<i>Mando zai</i>		17 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls	a. Teachers: 2 (One male, one female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male)	2 LSCBE students graduate (both female)

PROVINCE	DISTRICT	CLASSTYPE	TARGET SAMPLE		
			STUDENTS SURVEY TOOL	SSI TOOL	SOC
	<i>Tani</i>		17 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls	a. Teachers: 2 (One male, one female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male)	2 LSCBE students graduate (both female)
PAKTYA	<i>Gardez Center</i>	<i>Primary</i>	74 PCBE G4-6 (58 girls; 16 boys) interviewed	a. Teachers: Teachers: 2 (One male, one female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male) e. PED/DED 2 (1 district level, male or female, 1 provincial level, male or female)	Only Quantitative Survey and Qualitative SSI in this province, no SoC
PARWAN	<i>Bagram</i>	<i>LSCBE</i>	10 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls	a. Teachers: Teachers: 2 (One male, one female) b. Parents: 2 (one mother; one father) c. VEC members: 2 (one male; one female) d. Religious/ Community leaders: 1 (male) e. PED/DED 2 (1 district level, male or female, 1 provincial level, male or female)	2 LSCBE students current (both female)
	<i>Charikar</i>		10 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls		2 LSCBE students current (both female)
	<i>Jabalusaraj</i>		10 LSCBE students interviewed (G7-9) all girls		
			<b>406</b> Student surveys	<b>50</b> Semi-structured interviews	<b>12</b> Stories of Change

## 2.6 Review Challenges

The CARE Afghanistan team was very responsive and supportive throughout the review process. Whilst there were challenges during the course of the review, the extent to which they limit the ability to comprehensively address key review questions is minimal. Challenges were identified by the field coordinators and project team included:

<b>ACCESSIBILITY</b>	Accessing PED/DED officials for interviews presented challenges and was time-consuming for the field teams, despite arranging appointments in advance. This had implications for the data collection timeframes, though ultimately the team was able to meet SII targets.
<b>TIMING</b>	The Afghanistan Presidential elections were held during the review and the fieldwork needed to be scheduled accordingly to minimise delays during data collection and potential security risks.
<b>LOCATING PARENTS</b>	Unlike students who could be located through schools, locating parents required the field coordinators to look beyond school locations taking additional time.
<b>CONNECTIVITY</b>	Particularly in remote provinces, regular and reliable internet can be difficult to access meaning that the proposed online data entry was not an option and Microsoft Access was used instead.
<b>WORKING WITH CHILDREN</b>	Student surveys were conducted with a range of age groups (G4-9) and careful balance between gathering sufficient, good quality data, and the shorter attention span and vulnerability of children, needed to be considered by enumerators. In addition to the ethical measures and processes noted Section 2.4 all enumerators were required to sign CARE's Child Protection Policy and confidentiality and data protection measures were implemented (e.g. raw data password protected and only anonymized data was made available both within/outside the project except for SoCs which required additional informed consent processes).
<b>PRESENCE OF ADULTS</b>	Some children felt more comfortable with teachers/parents present in the room during surveys. Teachers/parents generally observed but on rare occasions made attempts to guide answers and enumerators were required to manage this.
<b>TRAVEL</b>	Due to security constraints for the consultant and operational constraints for the Program Quality team only the provincial monitoring and reporting officers and enumerators were able to travel to the communities surveyed and survey work could only be monitored remotely. However, strong remote monitoring processes were put place, with MEL officers reviewing forms on daily basis prior to data entry. In addition, the Education Program Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Supervisor visited Khost province for the first round of data collection to provide guidance and, the project MEL officer visited Parwan and Kapisa provinces and monitored the assessment process. Findings from these visits were shared with other provinces to be used as lessons learned and guide.

## 2.7 Structure of findings

The purpose of a formative review such as this is to serve as a management tool, where input from independent reviewers provides an opportunity for project staff to reflect upon implementation of activities, expected impacts, and ways of enhancing the effectiveness of project activities and management strategies. In the following sections, achievements are highlighted. At the same time, the report points to areas where project effectiveness might be improved, where activities and implementation strategies may need to be reassessed, and where other innovations might be explored.

Section 3.0 presents review findings using the over-arching criteria of effectiveness, impact, sustainability, and monitoring and evaluation. It should be noted for the criteria of effectiveness, based on the Washington Questions, only three PCBE students and two LSCBE students surveyed identified as living with disabilities and disaggregation did not reveal any significant difference to their peers. For qualitative data out of 12 teachers only 2 reported having a single student with disabilities in their class. Therefore, findings are only disaggregated by sex.

Section 4.0, presents recommendations for CARE Afghanistan's consideration relative to the final year of the EEA3 project and possible future programming.

## 3.0 FINDINGS

### 3.1 Effectiveness

**EOPO 1: Increase children's, particularly girls, access to basic education in grades one to nine through community-based education.**

#### Outcome 1 Achievements

*Girls' enrolment is increasing for both primary and secondary levels*

Community-based education is largely designed to benefit girls, who, due to custom and tradition, are often not allowed to go to school, especially if the school in question is too far from home, has male teachers, or is not viewed favourably by the community. The strength of CARE's CBE model, lies in approaches that directly address these issues such as locating CBE schools within or in close proximity to communities, recruiting female teachers from within the community and CBE school alumni, and working in partnership with community and religious leaders for social norms change and supportive attitudes towards girls' education. As a result, the review found that currently **girls account for more than 79% of PCBE students and 100% of LSCBE students under EEA3**. This represents an increase from the baseline where 57% of school-age girls were enrolled for target provinces. Overall, EEA3 has exceeded its intended enrolment rates – the program has succeeded in enrolling 4203 girls in PCBE (rather than the planned 3564) and enrolling 2126 girls in LSCBE (rather than the planned 2043).

Qualitative data indicates that **the increased enrolment of girls is linked to CARE's model of recruiting teaching staff from within communities, almost always female, meaning they are situated within in the community and are overseen by a Village Education Committee (VEC), made up of local people who are known and trusted within the community**. This allows even highly conservative, traditional households to allow their daughters to attend.

*A growing cadre of competent and effective female teachers is increasing girls' enrolment*

Qualitative data indicates that **the presence of female teachers was one of the determining factors for parents' decision-making on whether to enrol their daughters in school**. Many communities consider it inappropriate for girls to have contact with men/boys outside of the family, including with male teachers and peer students. This is particularly true for adolescent girls, for whom continuing their education beyond Grade 6 is dependent on the availability of female teachers within the school system due to cultural norms that place greater importance on virtue and honour and the economic value of girls (bride price). A girl's bride price depends on her ability to fulfil social norms for a reputation of modesty, purity and integrity – these values can be seen to be compromised by contact with outsiders, especially males such as teachers and fellow students. The shortage of female teachers (only 20% of teachers are female in areas where EEA3 is being implemented<sup>17</sup>) is therefore a significant barrier to girls' school enrolment and retention, particularly for higher grades.

Recruiting qualified female teachers remains a challenge in the remote and rural provinces where EEA3 is implemented – in response **the project works to encourage young women within villages who have completed their high school or college education, but who may have never taught in a classroom to consider participating in CBE classrooms**. CARE supports female teachers with limited formal teaching experience to develop their capacity through tailored training modules, mentorship, performance monitoring and monthly stipends. **Under EEA3 there are currently 235 female teachers being supported<sup>18</sup> which is triple the number of female teachers supported under the previous phase.**

Qualitative data from PED/DED officials indicates that **this strategy is working, not only within the**

<sup>17</sup> Human Rights Watch. 2017. 'I won't be a doctor and one-day you'll be sick' Girls Access to Education in Afghanistan'. New York.

<sup>18</sup> EEA3 Project 17<sup>th</sup> Interim Report for DFAT June 2019

### community-based schooling framework but also the formal MoE system:

*‘CARE and MoE has a strong working relationship – we have the same purpose – to educate the people. One important point is that CARE is improving availability of female teachers – last year in Khost we announced 400 female teacher positions – after taking the exam the result showed that the majority were actually graduates of the CARE’s LSCBE schools! But in other districts where we made the same announcement and CARE was not in operation, we faced a big challenge of finding qualified female teachers’* Male PED official, Khost Province.

Qualitative data found that **parents highlighted significant benefits to having female students with female teachers, such that they could more readily communicate with another female and that girls were often less shy to discuss issues with teachers about school or challenges outside school:**

*‘Initially we were all concerned about the teachers to be hired – we were thinking will he or she be a good person? But after sharing our concerns we realised that CARE would be selecting teachers from within our village which is acceptable, not just to me, but for all parents. It is important to have a female teacher for girls – girl students can relax and share their challenges without any fear and the parents are also comfortable if the teacher is female’* Mother of LSCBE student, Khost Province.

*‘We have female teachers for our CBE classes, parents prefer a female teacher and will only send their girls to school when there is a female teacher. Culturally female teachers are more acceptable for girls than a male teacher’* Father LSCBE student, Khost Province.

*‘My daughter has a female teacher – the presence of female teachers is good – they motivate our children and it’s good for the children because their teacher and mentor are the same gender as them. Parents also prefer to have female teachers and will send their daughters if the teacher is a female and a good role model. Girls can be inspired by their female teacher’* Father of PCBE student, Ghazni Province.

*‘At the present time we do not have a female teacher for the CBE class, absolutely if there is a female teacher it would be more positive and the girls would be more motivated....also it will mean some more girls can go to the class that do not attend at the moment’* Father of PCBE student; Paktia Province.

### *Girls are increasingly furthering their education and skill-base following graduation*

The review found that both **PCBE and LSCBE female students are continuing their education and progressively graduating**. For, example under EEA 2 the number of girls graduating from PCBE schools by project end was 1,439 girls<sup>19</sup>. EEA3 looks set to continue this trend of increasing graduation rates with 2,094 girls set to graduate from 83 LSCBE classes and 1,585 girls set to graduate from 84 PCBE classes over the remainder of the project.

**Previous research found that that 90% of the girls who completed LSCBE in 2009-2013 were able to transition into high school and complete their education.**<sup>20</sup> The review found that LSCBE girls that graduates are increasingly taking up opportunities in further education enrolling at high school and universities (engineering, literature, teacher training, medicine, information technology) and/or seeking employment opportunities outside the home such as contract teaching at both MoE and CBE schools or working as nurses and midwives. In this way, LSCBE graduates are supporting a shift in perceptions of acceptable educational and vocational pathways and role for women and contributing to longer-term changes in social norms (see EOPO3 for more detail).

---

<sup>19</sup> EEAI Final Report

<sup>20</sup> CARE International in Afghanistan (2016) Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan – 2 Mid-Term Evaluation Report, p.15

### *Parents are encouraged to prioritise girls' school attendance through active Village Education Committees*

VEC members and local community/religious leaders play a foundational role in encouraging parents to allow girls to attend school. They are also responsible for supporting girls who may have dropped out of school or be at risk of barriers such as early child marriage or domestic responsibilities. The review found that **VECs have been influential and active in their support for classes, ensuring that classes are monitored and parents are notified when girls are absent from classes.** Currently, **attendance rates for PCBE girls is a remarkable 94% and for LSCBE girls 99%.**

Poor attendance for PCBE and LSCBE classes was not raised as an immediate concern by parents, teachers or VEC members however, **in order to encourage attendance, VEC members referred to various methods including contacting families should a student not come to class for a couple of days and following up with families to provide them with support** to manage any particular issues that cause absence from school, such as economic constraints, household responsibilities or illness. **Teachers also make a concerted effort to follow up with absent students when they return to class** with 82% of LSCBE students and 99% of PCBE students reporting that when they are absent, their teacher asks them the reason why all or most of the time (98% boys; 99% girls).

*'Over the past three months our VEC has been very active going to student's homes to encourage parents to send their daughters to school regularly and not miss class. Three months ago, the challenge was having a classroom with good infrastructure but we have a safe venue now, so the challenge over the last three months has been to encourage parents and share the value of education...and the VEC has done this'* Male LSCBE teacher, Khost.

*'Our male and female VEC is so active in supporting teachers – they oversee our classes twice a month and support us to attract students. Our female VECs go to the homes of those girls who have been absent for some days and speak with the parents to convince them to send their girls to school regularly and problem-solve any issues'* Female PCBE teacher, Paktia Province.

*'The VEC is a bridge between the CBE school, the community, CARE and MoE. They have a positive role and support the school through monitoring the quality of our teachers, and checking lesson materials. They represent the interests of the community about the CBE school and at the same time they share the importance of education and convince the community people to send their children to school'* Father of PCBE students, Ghazni Province.

*'Three times in a month we have discussed the school issues with the VEC and the most important is that they address absent students from class and speak with the families that prevent their children from going to school – they motivate those families and find solutions so the children can go to school'* Father of LSCBE students, Parwan Province.

**Parents also highlighted various methods and activities to ensure their daughters did not miss classes. These include mothers taking responsibility for domestic chores to provide their daughters more time to complete their studies and do their homework.** Quantitative data from students support this, for example, PCBE students indicate that someone at home is willing to help them with their chores when they need to study for an exam – though boys are notably more confident that this is the case – students indicated someone helps them almost always (G:48% B:65%); most of the time (G:47% B:33%) or sometimes (G:4%; B:2%). For LSCBE students, this is also the case with someone willing to help them almost always (67%) or most of the time (25%) and sometimes (8%).

### *Girls view community-based education schools as accessible, respectful and safe learning environments*

The review found that teachers work towards creating a safe and respectful learning environment for students through consistently praising student's performance, using alternative approaches to discipline and addressing any harassment issues. In mixed PCBE classes, overall 98% of students report

that girl's performance in class is praised almost always or most of the time. It is similar for boys, with 97% of students reporting that boy's performance in class is praised almost always or most of the time. Similarly, 100% of female LSCBE students report that their performance is praised almost always or most of the time. 99% of LSCBE students report that their teacher encourages them all or most of the time and 99% of PCBE report that their teachers encourages them all or most of the time, with no difference between boys and girls.

**Teachers are also pro-active in addressing harassment issues in mixed classes as they arise.** In mixed PCBE classes, students were asked whether teachers resolve conflict when boys tease girls and vice versa – in both instances 99% of students overall strongly agreed that teachers resolved teasing between boys and girls so that they can learn (G:100% B:98%).

Overall, based on qualitative data, **parents, teachers and VEC members report that they do not condone physical punishment.** Within the Afghan context, this goes against a trend where it is socially acceptable to use classroom physical punishment. When asked whether their teacher physically disciplined boy or girls, 100% of both LSCBE and PCBE students reported that their teachers did not physically discipline boy or girls. When asked whether their teacher verbally disciplined boys or girls 99% of students reported that their teacher did not verbally discipline them and 1% indicated that if they did it was for boys and girls equally. **This reflects EEA3's commitment to child protection and developing the capacity of teachers to create learning-friendly environments and find alternative means to discipline students if the instance requires. Child Protection training has been conducted for 421 teachers (236 female; 185 male) and 756 VEC members (317 female; 439 male) across all five provinces.** The main purpose of the training is to build the knowledge and capacity of teachers on both CARE and DFAT child protection policies and regulations as well as strengthen their understanding of child rights and different types of discipline, the consequences for the well-being of children and alternatives.

The **majority of teachers and students perceive a high level of safety within and outside of schools.** 92% of female LSCBE students and 85% of PCBE students report that they feel very safe or quite safe travelling to school (notably of the 13% of PCBE students that reported not feeling safe when traveling to school, all of them were girls). Additionally, 90% of female LSCBE students and 85% of PCBE students report feeling very safe or quite safe at school itself (notably of the 14% of PCBE students that report not feeling safe at school all were girls).

Qualitative data found that many **teachers and parents pointed to the close proximity of the school to home, supportive community leaders and community ownership of the school, to explain the improved safety children feel in school, as well as walking to school.** Parents and teachers commonly noted that distance raised safety concerns, such that the greater the distance the more likely a girl was to feel unsafe or be at risk when travelling to school. **Parents regularly noted that their concerns over distance had largely been mitigated as a result of CBE classes being present within their community and highlighted the benefits of having a class closer to their homes; suggesting it allowed their daughters to more regularly access classes and reduced security and harassment risks during travel.**

*'When our children are in school, no parent has concerns or are worried about them because the school is within our community – the children have easy access to class and they are happy'*  
Father of PCBE student, Paktia Province.

*'I can say that we have a safe and secure environment for the students – the class is located in the middle of the village the students are close and do not face transportation risks – the villagers themselves have promised the safety of our students and support them'* LSCBE Male Teacher, Khost Province.

*'Yes, our students are safe in school but the most important reason for this is that the school is within the community and the students do not have to travel over distances to reach us'* LSCBE, Female Teacher, Khost

## Outcome 1 Challenges

### *Low but continued dropout rates for economic reasons*

Although respondents did not raise retention and student drop-out as an issue, project monitoring data shows that EEA3 throughout its implementation has experienced **low but continued dropout and transfer rates for PCBE students across all five districts (overall: 2% G:1% B: 3.7%), mainly due to relocation of families to other areas within provinces to seek better job opportunities.** It should be noted that this drop-out rate is lower than the baseline which, whilst not being able to calculate the actual rate, noted significantly high numbers of children dropping all across all target provinces.<sup>21</sup> All transferred students have been provided with formal documents to continue their further education in any MoE or CBE school in their new home locations. The relocation of families for economic reasons is beyond the control of the project itself, and **the project has taken all necessary steps to ensure smooth transition of students to MoE schools.**

### *Teacher and VEC communication with parents is on administration rather than learning*

Qualitative data reveals that both **teachers and VECs rarely discuss learning outcomes with parents, and focus predominately on issues of administration or attendance.** This may be a result of presumed limited education levels among parents. For example, LSCBE students report that their father received either schooling (38%) or only completed of primary schooling (26%), whilst their mothers had no schooling at all (86%). Nevertheless, **teachers should be supported on how they communicate academic performance to parents who are not familiar with the system, so that their children's futures and potential can be recognised and encouraged** as they transition between primary and lower-secondary, or as young adolescent women graduating from LSCBE begin to advocate for enrolment at high school/training institutes/universities.

---

<sup>21</sup> SADEC, 2018. Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan-3 Needs Assessment Report.

## EOP2: Improve the quality of education through training and coaching of teachers, aligned with Ministry of Education (MoE) policies.

### Outcome 2 Achievements

#### *Effective competency-based teacher training and mentoring is supporting girls learning outcomes*

The quality of CBE education depends, amongst other factors, on the quality of teaching and teacher qualifications. **EEA3 implements a number of core activities related to building the capacity and competency of teachers within both primary and lower-secondary CBE schools.** CBE teachers are generally community residents who have completed at least a primary education and are selected by a committee comprised of CARE, MoE and VEC members. Only a minority of teachers will come to a CBE school having already received formal teacher training. In response, **EEA3 has developed teacher-training modules for novice teachers with limited formal teaching experience. The trainings are designed to limit the amount of time the teachers spend out of their classrooms in formal training; the formal trainings are short but supplemented by frequent monitoring and coaching visits to the classrooms** by CARE teacher trainers and VECs.

Qualitative data indicates that **teachers are generally very satisfied with the trainings provided. The majority of teachers interviewed suggesting trainings have widened their skills sets and increased not only their subject-specific knowledge, but also their confidence to teach and apply learnings.** This finding is supported by project monitoring data, for example, data from pre and post-testing during the most recent round of training for PCBE teachers revealed significant improvements in knowledge and capacity with scores improving, on average, by 40% across topics such as child protection; reading; all core subjects including math and language; creating learning friendly environments; and education and child psychology.<sup>22</sup>

Teachers also indicate that **trainings have helped to develop their capacity to engage students – exposure to new teaching methodologies has improved their understanding of how to engage both boy and girl students in a more participatory way.** This is reflected in the fact that 94% of PCBE students and 95% of LSCBE students report working in small groups or pairs during class almost always or most of the time. Further, 99% of PCBE students and 98% of LSCBE students report that their teachers welcome their questions and ideas almost always or most of the time.

*‘I have done a number of subject-specific trainings and refreshers – all of them has their own importance – but for me the most beneficial has been how to create the learning friendly environment, child protection and maths and biology and social sciences. These trainings had a significant impact on the quality of my teaching and how to engage students – I am using the skills to conduct student group and pair work and effective learning and also in the laboratory to demonstrate experiments’* LSCBE Male Teacher, Parwan Province.

*‘I have received training on maths, physics, chemistry and biology – such trainings have enhanced my capacity greatly and now I have more confidence teaching in class’* LSCBE Female Teacher, Khost Province.

#### *Teachers are perceived to be professional and highly qualified by VECs and parents*

Qualitative data indicates that **parents are satisfied with and have a great deal of confidence in the teaching and quality of education being delivered through the PCBE and LSCBE classes under EEA3.** Across all provinces, parents referred to role of VECs in monitoring and assessing the performance of teachers and ensuring the quality of classes, as a strategy which instilled confidence:

*‘Our village CBE class teaching quality is better than other schools including government schools –*

<sup>22</sup> EEA-3 Project 17<sup>th</sup> Interim Report for DFAT (January-June 2019).

*my two daughters are going to CBE but my boys are going to the government school. Currently we don't have a female teacher because here there is no woman to be selected or hired as a teacher – but the current teacher is from the community and he has good skills – student's knowledge has increased as a result and he motivates all students'* Father of PCBE students, Paktia Province.

*'Education quality is very good in our CBE school – all students and parents are happy with the quality of the education and the VEC does regular monitoring also which gives confidence. We have both male and female teachers and they are qualified and teach with loyalty and energy'* Father of PCBE Ghazni Province.

*'The teaching in our CBE school is very good – the teacher is qualified and she motivates our children very much. The VEC is observing and monitoring classes and we meet regularly to discuss any issues'* Mother of PCBE students, Ghazni Province.

Qualitative data also indicates that **VEC members are confident their monitoring and observations of teachers in the classroom is leading to better quality teaching and learning outcomes for students:**

*'Our main tasks are to monitor the CBE classes and the teacher – usually three times a month – we do focus on attendance but also look at the teachers attitudes to students and the participation of students in the classroom – if issues arise we can address them through meetings with parents and community elders as well'* Female VEC member, Paktia Province.

*'The VEC plays a central role in the CBE class activities and are the direct bridge between the classroom, CARE and parents - if there are issues such as attendance or the quality and motivation of the teacher and the students – it's through the VEC that the solutions can be found'* Male VEC member, Parwan Province

*'We observe the teachers and see how they are impacting the participation and learning of the students and we use specific monitoring tools during these visits so we are checking the same things and we report on that'. Female VEC member, Parwan Province.*

Quantitative data from project monitoring supports the finding that students learning outcomes are improving. For example, CBE student performance assessments (based on MoE standards) reveals that the average score for mid-term and final exams (2018) was 80%.<sup>23</sup> The consistent performance of students and teachers is likely to contribute to the high pass rate.

While no standardised reading or numeracy assessments have been conducted under the scope of this evaluation, a sister project – Steps Towards Afghan Girls' Educational Success II (STAGES II) – carried out a quasi-experimental evaluation of CBE and LSCBE classes implemented by CARE (using the same teacher training methodology and curriculum) in 2017-2019. Results from the 2018 evaluation round indicate that LSCBE students (grade 7) achieved average literacy scores<sup>24</sup> of 46%, while the comparison group lagged behind at 40%.<sup>25</sup> Findings from the 2019 evaluation indicate that in a period of 12 months, the average proportion of LSCBE students proficient in advanced numeracy skills had increased from 5% to 32%, compared to 0% among students from the same grades in comparison (public) schools.<sup>26</sup>

*Teachers are using girl/child-centred approaches that allow children to learn through interaction, asking questions, participating in discussions and debates and engaging in pair and group work.*

The review findings suggest that **girls and boys are being treated equally by teachers in the classroom when classes are mixed, and that there are opportunities for discussion and debate and engaging in**

<sup>23</sup> Based on MoE policy, the average for both Midterm and Final Exam are reported at the end of academic year after confirmation from PED and DED in each December and therefore 2019 results were not available at the time of the review.

<sup>24</sup> Measured through an advanced version of EGRA (SEGRA), developed by STAGES

<sup>25</sup> Corboz, J. (2018) STAGES II Baseline Report, p. 46

<sup>26</sup> Wang, J. & McAneney, L. (2019) GEC-T Midline Report – Steps Towards Afghan Girls' Educational Success II, p.74

### **group work in culturally appropriate ways.**

Student survey data indicates that **PCBE girls and boys both agree that their teachers treat them equally** with no significant differences between the sexes. For example:

- 93% agree that teachers ask questions equally of boys and girls
- 94% agree that teachers encourage boys and girls to participate equally in classroom activities
- 97% agree that teachers encourage boys and girls equally to ask questions during class
- 98% agree that when students do good work, the teacher rewards and praises boys and girls equally
- 98% agree that teachers tell positive stories about girls almost always or most of the time and 93% agree that teachers tell positive stories about boys almost always or most of the time.
- 95% strongly agree that teachers pay attention to the specific needs of girls in the classroom
- 83% agree that teachers assign classroom chores to boys and girls equally (although notably of the 16% who said chores were assigned to girls more than boys, all were girls).
- 99% agree that if required, teachers will verbally discipline both boys and girls equally and 100% agree that they will not physically discipline either boys or girls.

**Whilst LSCBE classes are comprised entirely of female students, they also indicate they receive equal treatment within the schooling environment** with 86% strongly agreeing that teachers pay attention to the specific needs of girls within class.

Qualitative **findings amongst teachers and VEC members strengthen the data above, with the majority commenting that they aim to create inclusive learning environments:**

*‘The classes have activities where students work in a group, but the leader of the group changes regularly and so I see each one taking advantage of each other’s skills and talents – this is very effective for knowledge sharing and development’* Female VEC member, Khost Province.

*‘There is no difference between the support given to boys and girls in the classroom – they are supported equally by the teachers. Girls and boys are both getting homework and being asked questions and speaking up the same – the teacher here has a good attitude and boys and girls have a bright future’* Female VEC member, Ghazni Province.

*‘I am able to teach classes with the skills and methods I learnt in the training – I ensure that there is group work and even though they work separately, boys and girls can hear each other’s questions and answers and I mix the strong and weak students for study within the groups as well’* Male PCBE teacher, Ghazni Province.

*‘I have learnt the skills and methods by which I can manage the lessons so that both girls and boys are equally participating – I plan my lesson to reflect the diversity in my class and make sure learning materials are adapted and do not discriminate – my students learn actively through group work’.* Male LSCBE teacher, Parwan Province.

### **Community-based education schools and classrooms are well-resourced with adequate facilities**

Overall **teachers, students and parents indicated they were relatively content with the educational resources and facilities available to them.** As CBE classes are typically held in community member’s homes or a shared community space, the availability of sanitation facilities varies. EEA3 conducts **rapid assessments in all new communities to assess the availability and access of students, particularly girls, to safe and clean toilet and sanitary facilities. Some classrooms require maintenance or refurbishment to ensure a safe learning environment for students and teachers** – this includes installation of windows, doors, roof maintenance, adequate lighting, cross ventilation and heating.

**Students and teachers are generally satisfied with the facilities available.** For example, student survey data demonstrates that:

- 79% of PCBE students agree that there is enough space in the classroom and 19% agree there is lots of space, with no significant difference between girls and boys.
- 79% of LSCBE students agree that there is enough space in the classroom and 21% believe there is lots of space.
- 67% of PCBE schools have separate toilets for girls and boys and 33% are unisex but operate at different times for boys and girls.
- 99% of PCBE students agree that both the girls' and boys' toilets are always open and accessible during the school day. 93% believe that girls' and boys' toilets are always clean and 7% believe they are only sometimes clean, with no significant differences between girls and boys.
- 83% of LSCBE students agree that the girls' toilets are always open and accessible during the school day and 7% say they are open sometimes. Notably 8% indicate there are no toilets.
- 74% of LSCBE students agree that the girl's toilets are always clean; 13% agree that they are sometimes clean and 5% agree that they are dirty.

Qualitative data from teachers supports these findings noting:

*'Our classroom is a safe and secure environment for the students – support from CARE has meant that our class now has solar system energy and lighting – we are able to use fans in hot weather and hot wood stoves in the winter meaning students can concentrate. CARE has also given us a health kit for first aid – our class is also now under refurbishment and it will be even better for students'* Male LSCBE teacher, Khost Province.

*'Yes, our school has a safe environment for learning – in the summer we use metallic net for the windows and in winter we use a wood burning stove for heating the class. The classroom has space and lighting and is free from noise. Through support from CARE we have good sanitation facilities that are well ventilated as well'* Female LSCBE teacher, Parwan Province.

*'Our CBE classroom is safe and clean for students – there is enough space and lighting – with CARE we refurbished and fixed the doors and windows and we now have access to drinking water and sanitation facilities. The students feel good while being here'* Female PCBE teacher, Paktia Province.

**While classrooms are provided by the community, EEA3 provides the necessary education resources for teachers and students.** Students receive school supplies twice a year (stationery set including notebooks, pens, pencils, bags, erasers, pencil sharpeners, crayons, calligraphy pens) and project monitoring data indicates that **all CBE supported students have received stationery sets for this year.** Teachers receive material annually (textbooks for respective grades and training manuals and guidelines as well as items such as blackboards, blackboard erasers, chalk, markers and attendance books). In addition, the project has ensured that **all CBE classes are equipped with up to date library materials that can be used by students, teachers and community members for educational and recreational purposes.** LSCBE classes also receive laboratory materials.

**Overall teachers and students are satisfied with the learning materials provided, reporting that they contribute to the learning environment.** For example, student survey data demonstrates that:

- 87% of LSCBE students agree there are enough books in their classroom for all students and 10% believe there are more than enough books.
- 81% of PCBE students agree there are enough books in their classroom for all students and 18%

believe there is more than enough books, with no difference between girls and boys<sup>27</sup>.

Qualitative data from teachers indicated:

*'We receive training materials, a computer lab and a good library from CARE – without this we would not have resources to support us and to teach the students properly. The resources have been very useful because after the teacher training, we can continue to refer to them. Our students have been using the library which is a good source of free study for everyone in the community – students are mainly using it to solve lessons'* Male LSCBE teacher, Khost Province.

*'We have all kinds of teaching materials, a library and a laboratory which is very useful and makes teaching more effective. When I need additional information on a subject, I refer to the library books, collect the information and then plan my class. Our library is used by everyone – parents, teachers, students and the community people as well – people take books and read them in their free time. I can say these books are a good friend in free time'* Female LSCBE teacher, Khost Province.

*'I have enough resources and materials for my classes – when I study these resources my own teaching skills have changed and I can teach according to the student's level of understanding - the books have improved the skills of students too. The students are using our library and enjoy it very much – they like the stories the most'* Female PCBE teacher, Ghazni Province.

## Outcome 2 Challenges

### *Provision of adequate infrastructure and access to sanitation facilities*

The only notable issue raised by teachers, parents and VEC members in relation to the quality of education or educational environment, were regarding the adequacy of the infrastructure available to them. In these instances, **teachers, parents and VEC members reported that either classrooms were inadequate but are currently under refurbishment, or that toilets were not available or not suitable.** EEA3 supports provides **small classroom improvement grants to VECs to identify and oversee refurbishment activities (including improving access to sanitation facilities)** however due to the two-month long office closure following the tragic security incident in Kabul in May 2019, this activity was postponed. However, this activity has recently recommenced and 52 classroom grants have now been provided to CBE schools.

---

<sup>27</sup> 100% of PSCBE/LSCBE students have received textbooks so this finding may reflect that students were thinking of library books rather than textbooks.

### **EOP3: Increase girls' skills, confidence and abilities to participate in school decision-making structures and technical skills for employment.**

#### **Outcome 3 Achievements**

*Girls are increasing their leadership and voice through active peer groups and life skills development*

EEA3's CBE model provides different pathways for adolescent girls to develop and practice their leadership competencies, confidence and life skills through the participation in peer groups and membership of VECs. Peer groups begin in G4 through to G9, and provide a connection with other girls and a "safe space," where girls have an opportunity to learn by taking on leadership roles themselves and observing peers. Peer networks can reduce social isolation and teach girls how to resolve conflict, and deal with setbacks. Peer group activities focus on the development of five core competencies: voice, self-confidence, vision, decision-making and organisation. These competencies boost girls' participation in class, with a positive effect on learning outcomes and more importantly, equip adolescent girls with skills to take an active role in decision-making processes, bringing up issues related to women's and girls' needs, and participating in the development of solutions for addressing those. Currently **there are 450 peer groups (180 primary, 270 lower-secondary) and all are active, meeting monthly or more, in Parwan, Kapisa, Ghazni and Khost provinces.**

**Lower-secondary peer group members also have the opportunities to be part of VECs to develop their confidence, capabilities and their leadership skills, by participating in school management and decision-making.** One to two girls are currently serving on 137 VECs on a rotational system that changes monthly. Over the course of 2019, 70% girls have had the opportunity to input peer perspectives into VECs and feedback VECs actions to peers.

The review found that **girls in both PCBE and LSCBE are increasing their leadership skills and voice through active peer groups and life skills development. LSCBE girls suggested that their participation in peer groups has helped to increase their individual confidence, as they were required to speak in front of groups** on various occasions.

*'I'm part of a peer group – we have three in our class – and we rotate the group leader regularly. We discuss topics together and I'm learning how to share my ideas with others. Our self-confidence is increased and we're becoming more social, learning how to meet and talk with people and present an idea. We're also making decisions together and I use those ways of speaking and presenting at home as well'* Current LSCBE student, Parwan.

*'I'm part of a peer group but also a member of the VEC and I participate in their monthly meetings – we mostly share issues in these meetings from the student's thinking regarding attendance and any social problems – we then discuss and make decisions to solve these problems – I have learned a lot of decision-making and problem-solving skills in these meetings and by being a VEC member'* Current LSCBE student, Parwan.

*'The first time, I could not speak in front of the class, but working in the peer group and presenting different topics to the class I learned new skills and had fun as well. I learned a lot in the peer group such as how to collect information and lead in a group. I can say I gained courage and now I am fluent in group situations and can speak confidently in front of an audience. Now I use these skills to encourage other girls and to convince their parents to allow them to continue to secondary education'* LSCBE female graduate, Khost Province.

Quantitative data supports the finding that **LSCBE girls are developing their voice, self-confidence, decision-making** with:

- 99% of LSCBE students report feeling confident when their teacher calls on them to answer a question almost always or most of the time

- 87% of LSCBE students report they like sharing their ideas in small groups almost always or most of the time
- 88% of LSCBE students report that girls act as leaders in classes and group work almost always or most of the time
- 79% of LSCBE students believe what they learn in school helps in daily life very much and 20% believe it helps quite a bit.

Although qualitative data is not available for female PCBE students, quantitative data seems to indicate that **peer groups are also contributing to the confidence and leadership and equal experiences of PCBE girls to those of boys:**

- 65% of PCBE students report that girls and boys equally act as leaders group work (G: 63% B:66%) or girls act as leaders more than boys (G: 35% B: 32%). Only 2% of girls and boys said boys act as leaders more than girls.
- 97% of PCBE students report that when their teacher calls on girls to answer questions, they seem confident almost always or most of the time. 95% of PCBE students report that boys seem confident answering almost always or most of the time. There were no significant differences between girls and boys.
- 50% of PCBE students report feeling confident when their teacher calls on them to answer a question though boys feel more confident than girls almost always, (G:46% B:65%) while girls are more likely to feel confident most of the time (G:52% B:32%).
- 95% of PCBE students report they like sharing their ideas in small groups almost always (G:40% B: 44%) or most of the time (G:55%; B:51%).
- 57% of PCBE students believe that what they learn in school helps in daily life very much, though girls are much less confident that this is the case (G:49% B:86%); 39% believes it helps quite a bit (G: 46%; B: 14%). The 4% who believe it only helps somewhat are all girls. The difference between PCBE and LSCBE girls in this case may be related to whether or not the PCBE girls have had the chance to actively participate in peer groups (which enable them to envisage future possibilities and to advocate for their choices) at this point in their schooling.

Qualitative data for **current and graduate LSCBE students highlighted that most girls feel confident and valued within their families** and enjoyed sharing their thoughts and opinions with their families. Supporting, quantitative data suggests that **parents and caregivers are indeed engaged with their daughter's experiences in school and listen to their opinions** (though they remain almost always more engaged with their sons by comparison):

- 87% of PCBE students report that someone within the family helps them with their homework, though this is more likely to be the case for boys than girls with 36% of girls and 61% of boys reporting someone helps them almost always; most of the time (G:50% B:30%); rarely (G:2% B:5%).
- LSCBE students report that someone within the family helps them with their homework almost always (35%); most of the time (46%); sometimes (17%) rarely (5%).
- 90% of PCBE students strongly agree that parents listen to boys and girls equally within the family (G:89%; B:93%); agree somewhat (G:11% B:4%) or disagree somewhat (B:4%).
- 92% of LSCBE students strongly agree that parents listen to boys and girls equally within the family; 5% agree somewhat and 3% disagree somewhat.

**Parents of both PCBE and LSCBE girls also noted changes they have observed in their daughter's characters or behaviours since starting school and participating in the peer groups:**

*‘All my children (three boys and one girl) are going to the CBE school – the MoE school is too far from our village. My daughter is changing daily since she started at the CBE school – her self-confidence is growing and she has much better Dare now. She has abilities she did not have before – she has the ability to share her ideas and think about the future and make decisions. She is now taking part in family decisions and sharing her opinion. My daughter wants to be a doctor in the future’* Father of female PCBE student, Ghazni Province.

*‘My two daughters are going to the LSCBE school and are in G8. They are changing a lot – they have learnt reading and writing and have learnt a lot about women’s rights – they are always telling me a lot of things and want to learn more so they can have a bright future and support people in the community. They are also part of the VEC and actively motivate other families to send their daughters to school’.* Father of current LSCBE students, Parwan Province.

*‘Since our girls are enrolled in the CBE school they have changed positively – they have self-confidence and a positive attitude, they pay attention to health and hygiene and have increased their knowledge about women’s rights and ethics of children and education. I often see them talking with friends about the future now – they want to be health workers or teachers to provide services for our community people’* Mother of female PCBE students, Paktia Province.

**Girls also reported that because their family members and community members such as community or religious leaders – listened to them and they now feel more confident sharing their ideas.** They were as such more confident to communicate in classes, in home and in public.

*‘In the peer group I learned how to lead and how to talk and facilitate discussion in front of a group – this led me to become part of the VEC and I learned more about management and problem-solving in a group. Now I am studying law and I speak about the importance and defence of human rights’.* LSCBE female graduate, Khost Province.

*‘The peer group gave me the skills to communicate, to talk in front of an audience and how to fight against life’s obstacles. My grandfather was not supportive of me attending the LSCBE school but my uncle who had lived in other Gulf countries convinced him – but I had to always keep making the case for why I should continue – it’s the skills from the peer group that gave me hope for the future and the energy to struggle with parents for education. Even after school the skills I learnt in the peer group have been effective in university where I am in medical school and when I present to others in an audience’.* LSCBE female graduate, Khost Province.

### *LSCBE graduates have increased employment options outside the home and are moving towards economic independence*

The shortage of female teachers in rural areas prevents many parents from sending their daughters to school. In response, **EEA3’s CBE model integrates an innovative approach by working to provide a pathway for secondary school graduates to become teachers themselves, particularly as primary school teachers in community schools.** EEA-3 provides ninth-grade LSCBE students with **para-professional training in teaching and health education as well as extra-curricular activities such as computer skills.** The training programs prepare the female graduates to continue their education and further advance their skills and knowledge within the formal midwifery and teacher-training institutes of the country. Computer skills training in project-established computer labs, alongside the teacher, supports girls to acquire basic digital literacy in Microsoft Office. The computers have software and training materials supporting para-professional health and teacher training.

After graduating from ninth grade, **LSCBE girls have the opportunity to consider the following professional and academic options:**

- Working as **teachers** or administrators in community-based or government schools
- Working as **health educators** in their communities

- Continuing their education by enrolling in 10<sup>th</sup> grade government schools

Qualitative findings from current and graduate LSCBE students indicates that **students are taking up these options with commitment and enthusiasm, and are experiencing economic independence due to the skills they have gained during paraprofessional training:**

*'I can say through the LSCBE school my mind came alive and I discovered my courage. I heard about women and girls' rights for the first time in my peer group at the LSCBE school – this awareness is what led me to study law at a government university and learn more about human rights specifically women and girls. I received teacher training at the LSCBE school and because of this I am now a teacher at the CBE school in my community, while I continue studying at the university. Because of this I can afford my university textbooks and transportation costs myself – I support my family with expenses as well – but I rely on myself – I am self-sufficient financially'* Female LSCBE graduate, Khost Province.

*'LSCBE is the best experience of my life – besides school subjects I learned teacher and community health worker skills and when I completed the CARE secondary school, I went to the MoE high school for admission in the 10<sup>th</sup> Grade. The principal of the school interviewed me and asked me a lot of subject questions and I surprised him by answering them all correctly! As a result, he hired me as a part-time primary teacher in the school which was a golden chance for me because aside from the chance to study, I also had an income, I could afford my own books and stationery and transport and also support my family. That was time ago – now I have completed my studies as a midwife and I am working in my community'* Female LSCBE graduate, Khost Province.

*'Without LSCBE I would not have continued my studies beyond primary education – but today I am studying mathematics and engineering at the government university – there are 7 girls and 98 boys in my class! I love maths because you will find most of the world improvements are using it. I am using the skills I learnt in computers and laboratories and libraries during LSCBE in my studies at university today. I also learned teaching skills which I am now using a contract teacher in the government school – this income has contributed greatly to my university costs (my family was not with me for my studies)'. Female LSCBE graduate, Khost Province.*

Quantitative data also indicates that **young women graduates are mentoring their younger peers and challenging the status quo of 'you can't be what you can't see' through modelling examples of future career and educational possibilities.** Indeed, 49% of LSCBE students believe girls have a better chance than boys of securing well-respected jobs after completing school whilst 28% believe that boys and girls have an equal chance and 28% believe boys have a better chance than girls. Similarly, 67% of PCBE students believe that boys and girls have an equal chance of securing well-respected jobs after completing school (G: 67%; B:68%); and 22% believe girls have a better chance (G:26%; B:7%) compared to 11% who think boys have a better chance (G:7%; B: 25%).

*'I used to see girls on TV going to school or hear about it on the radio but I didn't think that could be me – my parents said that I am not young anymore and primary school was enough for me. I cried and tried to convince them but because the MoE school was a long way away and there are security concerns they did not allow me. Then CARE opened a LSCBE school in our village and it was my chance to become one of those girls that go to secondary school. Now I see myself as a mentor to those younger girls and I transfer my education to them and encourage them to also enrol and have a chance'* Current LSCBE student, Ghazni Province.

*'There was no one in my village to inspire me but when I sat in class and women would come from outside and visit and monitor the class – I was thinking to myself – the day will come when I have the chance to work and earn a good salary and serve my family and other girls in the community. Today I am studying computer science at university – there are 24 females and 118 male students! My interest in computers came from my time in LSCBE and that is why I am studying IT. Now we are inspiration to other young girls in our village, they speak with us and share their challenges and we*

*give good advice. In fact, some mothers will show me as an example when their daughters don't study their homework!*' Graduate LSCBE student, Khost Province.

### *Girls have increased exposure to women in non-traditional roles through female teachers and VEC members*

One of the barriers for leadership skills development is the lack of non-traditional local role models for girls, particularly given the scarcity of female teachers. The majority of the women living in rural and remote areas, in the targeted provinces, do not work outside the home or take part in community-level decision-making processes. **Strategies to increase girls' exposure to non-traditional role models includes 1) increasing the number of female teachers; 2) support to female members of VECs to engage in more visible decision-making processes; 3) engagement of students with LSCBE graduates who have succeeded in moving forward with their education; and 4) enriching libraries with content portraying female role models.**

Qualitative data shows that **both male and female teachers consider the recruitment of female teachers as important, not only as way to facilitate girl's enrolment and continued attendance but also to provide consistent and valuable role models for female students and the wider community:**

*'Female teachers have a lot of benefits not just for students but for the whole community – female teachers will give encouragement and inspiration to girl students – they will become hopeful about their future and imagine they want to be just like their teacher or a nurse or a doctor. Women who are educated can gain more respect and people will listen because they have knowledge – such women have a lot of influence on students – that is what happened for me and my sister – we followed our teachers example and now we are both studying medicine but I am also teaching here in CBE'* Female LSCBE Teacher, Khost Province.

*'If we have female teachers who are good leaders then our community's misunderstanding about girls' education can be removed and people can return from the dark to the light especially about girls' education. One of our female primary school teachers has been influential and a leader convincing parents to send their girls to school, many girls are receiving an education and a future because of her role model'* Male LSCBE Teacher, Khost Province.

*'We have many female teachers at the school of our village – they are a symbol in communities. It's an example for young girls and young girls will be inspired to develop the same skills of these leaders'* Male PCBE teacher, Ghazni Province.

*'Female teachers contribute to building positive attitudes in our community towards women and girls' education. Female teachers have good leadership skills, honesty and behaviour that can be a role model for other women and girls and build community trust'* Male LSCBE teacher, Parwan Province.

These perspectives are also shared by **LSCBE students who report looking to female teachers and their abilities, ethics and characteristics as important role models and possible roadmaps in their own futures and development:**

*'My teacher has been a good example and role model for me, she is hardworking and has respect in the community. I was hoping that I would be like her and then.... she became the high school principal! I had the idea that a school principle and a leader can also be a woman – can be someone like me! She taught me that if one tries hard and works hard then you can reach your desired goal'* Graduate LSCBE student, Khost Province.

*'My teacher – she inspires and guides me very much- she has completed her higher education and now she is a teacher and taking a salary – she is having a good life and community people respect her'* Current LSCBE student, Parwan Province.

#### EOP4: Increase community support for girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education.

### Outcome 4 Achievements

#### *Girls' education is increasingly valued and supported by the wider community*

Community-based attitudes and behaviours towards girls' education are a foundational component of ensuring girls are supported to begin, and continue, along their educational path. In order to engage communities and influence their overall attitudes and behaviours, **EEA3 works with female members of Village Education Committees (VECs) to develop their capacity to raise issues related to girls' education and engage in decision-making processes.** Acknowledging the traditions of the provinces where EEA3 is taking place, the project works with women and men to identify culturally acceptable opportunities for women's participation, and progressively expand women's self-confidence and male acceptance. **EEA3 also involves religious scholars in relevant project activities to enhance public awareness of Islam's support for girls' education and women's participation in society.** Awareness raising is conducted through verbal messaging as well as through brochures with relevant quotes from the Holy Quran.

Overall qualitative data indicates **parents' and caregivers' attitudes towards girls' education are largely supportive – many parents and caregivers noted that they recognised the value of girls receiving an education and supported efforts to ensure their daughters attended class – but highlighted that the proximity of CBE schools is the primary reason that their daughters are now attending class.** The evidence suggests that the dominant barrier to girls attending schools is not negative perceptions of girls' education but rather proximity of schools and level of security. However, the inherent bias of this data should be noted, that is, the sample was derived from communities where CARE already has an intervention and has garnered the support of community and religious leaders for the CBE school which in turn lends itself to more positive community attitudes.

*'In our community the attitude towards girls' education is positive – we believe that boys and girls should learn how to read and write and that girls have the same right to attend schools and boys. Our problem was that we did not have a girls' school so when the CBE school opened here all our daughters came out of the home and into the school – the community people were happy because the school is short distance, is safe, has female teachers and is easy access for the girls'* Father of LSCBE students, Parwan Province.

*'Men and women in this village support girls' education and we have come from the darkness into the lightness. Under Islam, education is obligated for boys and girls and we know that education will lead to the progress of the girls and therefore the family, and from there the community and eventually education will lead to the progress of our country. Our community believes girls must learn to read and write because they will be mothers in the future – an educated mother can educate her sons and daughters. We will send our girls to primary and secondary – that is not the issue – the issue is for secondary school there are challenges - the government school is far away and there are security and custom concerns'* Father of PCBE students, Ghazni Province.

*'Attitudes have changed in recent years, the black curtain has been removed from our eyes and we now know the value of education. According to Islam and the saying of our prophet (PBUH) 'getting an education is obligatory for every male and female' so it is not a problem'* Father of both PCBE and LSCBE students, Khost Province.

*'Attitudes of men and women in our community are positively changing regarding girls education – before they did not concern themselves with a girls education but now they think that all girls and boys should have the same chance of education – this change is because of the CBE school – they see their girls busy learning and they can see a bright future for their children so parents are motivated and strongly support their girls to attend. We are all concerned for secondary-level*

*education because we cannot access the government secondary school – we are hoping our girls may have the same chance with a community secondary school as they had with primary – the issue is access and facilities’* Mother of PCBE students, Paktia province.

**Quantitative evidence from the student survey supports the finding that parents and caregivers hold supportive attitudes:**

- 95% of PCBE students report that their parents or caregivers ask about their schoolwork, though parents are more likely to enquire after their sons with parents asking 42% of girls and 75% of boys almost always or most of the time (G:51%; B:25%); only girls report being asked sometimes (4%) or rarely (3%).
- 92% of LSCBE students report that their parents or caregivers ask about their schoolwork almost always (55%); most of the time (37%) or sometimes (8%).
- 95% of LSCBE students report that their parents or family members consider their opinions when making decisions about their schooling almost always (46%) or most of the time (48%).
- 90% of PCBE students report that their parents or family members consider their opinions when making decisions about their schooling, though boys opinions are more likely to be taken into account almost always (G:25% B:37%) compared to girls whose opinions are considered most of the time (G:66%; 54%).

**Qualitative data from community and religious leaders also indicates that they are actively mobilising families to allow their daughters to attend school:**

*‘In the past people were thinking that only boys should be educated but under Islam it is an obligation for girls and boys to become educated and once people understand this – we see that they are sending their daughters to school. People are also seeing the attitudes and abilities of educated girls and now we know every girl should be educated – because girls will become mothers and make decisions for their children. We (scholars) have been discussing with people the value of education and changing their minds – for example I visited my neighbours who kept their girls at home and sat with them and encouraged their parents – luckily we convinced them and girls are now at the CBE school. I also go to classes and meet with students and teachers to share my experiences as a religious leader – I teach religious subjects alongside the sciences which make me happy. I would like to say though that we have concerns what will happen after LSCBE – the distance of the high school, economic reasons and cultural issues means that the girls will once again stay at home’* Male Religious leader, Khost Province.

*‘The CBE school has played a vital role in changing community attitudes and we as leaders will speak at any community gathering or event about the value of education and convince community people to send their girls to school’.* Male community leader, Ghazni Province.

*‘I remember when the CBE school was established in our community – we were so happy about that and our wish was to enrol all our school age students, mostly girls, because there are no other sources for girls’ education in our community. As community elders we meet regularly with the VEC and if there are any issues with students being absent, especially girls, we will jointly discuss and work to find a solution. For example, as a community elder we will meet with parents and discuss the value of education and the importance of supporting their daughters to attend CBE classes – we say do not miss this chance because the chance for education may not always be here’* Male Community Leader, Paktia Province.

**As noted above, qualitative data indicates that all community and religious leaders interviewed state they are supporting girls to pursue educational pathways. Quantitative evidence from the student survey supports this:**

- 71% of LSCBE students strongly agree that when making decisions about the local school,

community leaders consider the needs of girls and 27% agree somewhat.

- 73% of PCBE students strongly agree that when making decisions about the local school, community leaders consider the needs of girls and 26% agree somewhat, with no significant difference between girls and boys.
- 65% of LSCBE students strongly agree that in their community boys and girls have an equal opportunity to attend school; 28% agree somewhat; 5% disagree somewhat and 2% disagree strongly.
- 66% of PCBE students strongly agree that in their community boys and girls have an equal opportunity to attend school (G:67% B:65%); agree somewhat (G:24%; B:30%); disagree somewhat (G:3% B:5%) and notably those who disagree strongly are all girls (7%).
- 83% of PCBE students agree strongly that is normal for girls to complete primary school in their community but notably even more agree that it's the case for boys (93%), with no significant difference between boys and girls.
- 70% of LSCBE students agree strongly that is normal for girls to complete primary school in their community but notably even more agree that it's the case for boys (98%).

There is also **substantial support for educated girls to be economically active following graduation, although the support is largely for women to work as teachers within CBE schools** or in local medical centres rather than in other types of employment outside the home (see EOPO2 for more detail).

*Women and girls are increasingly represented in decision-making structures and processes for community-based education*

**EEA3 has focused on building the capacity of VECs to support girls' education in their communities.**

This includes the provision of training on child protection and how to conduct monitoring of classes, assessing teacher behaviour, monitoring students' attendance, and following up with parents whose children have poor attendance/have dropped out and conducting advocacy and community mobilization activities to promote girls' education. **VECs have been highlighted in qualitative data as being the most active source of support to prevent or reduce absenteeism by parents, teachers and community leaders.** All VECs interviewed were meeting three to four times monthly to discuss CBE issues and follow up any absenteeism.

Qualitative data from **both female and male VECs indicate they have been influential and active in their support for classes**, ensuring classes are monitored and by following up with families directly when a girl misses classes. This appears to **reflect improved confidence in communicating with families about the value of education**:

*'Most of the time we meet with student's parents if girls have missed classes or if a girl is prevented from attending school by her family. For example, one girl's father did not allow her to come to school so when we were made aware of this issue, we met with her parents and we convince her father that you must let her have an education and a bright future. We convinced him by raising the value of education and by referring to the most popular people in our community and their relationship with education – if your daughter is educated like them she will have a bright future as well and manage her life and make good decisions'* Female VEC member, all female VEC LSCBE, Parwan Province.

*'I would like to say that parents are encouraged and motivated and proud of their girls – and to say the VEC is the only source of education for parents and families and awareness-raising on the value of girls education – it is important to continue'* Male member of a mixed VEC LSCBE, Parwan Province.

*‘One of the great achievements of the VEC is sharing the message on the value of education and encouraging the community people to send their girls to school. The monitoring of classes is very important – because through monitoring the teachers and students and parents all feel accountable to that message’* Female VEC LSCBE member, Khost Province.

The EEA3 CBE model identifies female VEC members as an integral part of advocacy for girls’ education, building on their status within the community to support girls to continue their education. EEA2 demonstrated that **female members, when integrated appropriately into VECs, are valuable to girls’ education within communities acting as a bridge between the school and families and a point of communication for all community members.** They are able to engage with households more closely, in particular with other female care givers to promote education. Furthermore, they are a culturally acceptable point of contact for girls to report any challenges or troubles with school (particularly at the primary-level where female teachers may not be available). At the time of the review there were 137 all female VECs and 97 all male VECs.

Notably **among communities where females appeared to play an active role and hold a leadership position, their male counterparts recognized and reported their value regularly.** This may suggest that **greater female participation and engagement is more likely when male VECs have witnessed the value and additional support females can provide.**

*‘The head of our VEC is a woman and she is a good symbol for girls and even other women – she speaks well with the community, girls can share their emotions with her and she shows leadership in celebration days at the school’* Male member of mixed PCBE VEC, Ghazni Province.

*‘In our village we have separate male and female VECs – we visit the primary CBE but the female VEC visits both the primary and the secondary CBE which is useful for the girls to express themselves. The head of the female VEC is well-respected and listened to in the community and has good communication and leadership skills – she is solving the girls problems and advocating for their right to be part of decision-making’* Male member all-male PCBE VEC, Parwan Province.

Quantitative data from the student survey supports the finding that through active VECs with female membership and participation, girls’ voices are increasingly represented and heard:

- 61% of LSCBE students strongly agree that in their community adults listen to the voices of boys and girls equally and 37% agree somewhat.
- 73% of PCBE students strongly agree that in their community adults listen to the voices of boys and girls equally and 25% agree somewhat, with no significant differences between boys and girls.
- 36% of LSCBE students believe that in their community adults make decisions that helps girls become leaders almost always; 42% most of time; 13% sometimes and 2% rarely. The perceived situation for boys is, as expected, more positive where 62% of LSCBE believe adults make decisions that help boys become leaders almost always; 29% most of the time and 9% rarely.

### *Shifting community attitudes towards preventing or delaying early marriage of girls*

Qualitative data indicates that **more parents are waiting to marry their daughters until they’ve finished their education.** In addition, there seems to be **shifting attitudes towards seeing a positive connection between a girl’s educational attainment and improvements in their health, skills and employment options, as well as the health and wellbeing of their future family and children.** Families are connecting educational skills such as the ability to read and write to better domestic skills in managing a household budget, medical issues and general well-being of children and the family.

*‘In our village most of the girls are usually married at the age of 18. This has changed dramatically*

*in recent years – there is a difference between girls who are going to school and those who are not – those who are going to school are getting married later. But even in some families’ marriage does not become an excuse to stop going to school and in our village, it has changed so that now, most girls who get married still continue their schooling’. Father of LSCBE students, Parwan Province.*

*‘Now they are married between 18-26 years, but before most of the marriage was done at the age of 14-16 years old. At that time people had less awareness about the value and importance of girls’ education. If someone gets married it depends on her husband and father-in-law and whether she will continue or be prevented from attending school’ Male Community Leader, Parwan Province*

*‘Before the girls married at the age 13-15 and now the community people are sending the girls to school so they are waiting for 18-25. There are many differences between girls who go to school and those who do not – girls who go have a good and bright future and can educate their families – those who do not cannot. After marriage the permission of the family is important if they want to go to school, some can but some do not get permission and they must perform home activities and not go to school’ Male member of a mixed VEC, Ghazni, Province.*

*‘In our community the marriage age is between 15-25 years old and it has not changed because that is our custom. However, girls going to school are better with their skills and better economically in terms of supporting the family. People want to marry educated girls’ Male Community Leader, Ghazni Province.*

**Quantitative data from the student survey would seem to support the finding that early marriage is being delayed:**

- 70% of LSCBE students strongly agree that they are able to decide how many years they will go to school; 27% agree somewhat and 3% disagree somewhat
- 68% of PCBE students strongly agree that they are able to decide how many years they will go to school (G:71% B:58%); 28% agree somewhat (G:26% B:35%) and 4% disagree somewhat (G:3% B:7%).
- 50% of LSCBE students strongly agree that in their community girls are able to influence the decision on when they will marry; 39% agree somewhat; 6% disagree somewhat and 5% disagree strongly.
- PCBE girls and boys however, have very different opinions on whether girls are able to influence the decision on when they will marry. 38% of girls strongly agree that girls can influence the decision and 40% of boys strongly disagree that this is the case; 39% of girls and 33% of boys agree somewhat; and 6% of girls and 14% of boys disagree somewhat. This is an interesting finding and may point to the need to work more intentionally with not just parents, but also boys for social norms change.

## **Outcome 4 Challenges**

### *Early marriage as a barrier to school participation*

Qualitative data indicates that whilst the majority of parents, teachers, community and religious leaders reported positive attitudes towards avoiding marriage at a young age, once married, a girl’s opportunity to continue her schooling was a private decision to be taken by her husband and father-in-law. **Religious leaders and VEC members indicated that whilst they felt capable of approaching a girl’s own family prior to marriage to discuss the possibility of delaying marriage and the importance of education, once married their advocacy role was more challenging and the decision was ultimately out of their hands.** Many noted that while theoretically a girl could still continue her education after marriage, she was likely to face considerably more barriers as a young girl then needs to demonstrate their ability to adhere to the social norms of being a wife and the responsibilities that come with that. Whilst the majority of

respondents in this review supported delayed marriage, **there is plenty of evidence that early marriage persists at rates which suggest one in three young girls will be married before the age of 18.** These unions mainly happen in rural and remote areas, including where EEA3 is being implemented<sup>28</sup>. Child marriage in Afghanistan is a complex phenomenon with diverse contextual economic, religious and cultural drivers intersecting with a variety of players, most of whom are constrained by their own set of cultural and social norms. As such, **EEA3 should consider in future phases possible strategies targeted at supporting this especially vulnerable sub-set of girls (young married girls) to also have an opportunity to continue their schooling.**

---

<sup>28</sup> MoLSAMD and UNICEF, July 2018. Child Marriage in Afghanistan: Changing the narrative. Kabul, Afghanistan.

## EOP5: Strengthen stakeholder networks to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice.

### Outcome 5 Achievements

#### *Strong coordination and linkages between CARE CBE schools and the Ministry of Education*

EEA3 collaborates closely with provincial and district education departments (PED/DED) officials through regular coordination meetings to share results, updates on progress and undertake joint **monitoring visits** of primary and lower-secondary CBE schools. During the most recent project reporting period 209 joint monitoring visits were conducted with MoE officials across the five project provinces

Qualitative data from PED and DED officials revealed that there is appreciation for the EEA3 program which is seen to be strongly aligned with, and complementing the MoE formal education system which currently does not have the resources and capacity to reach remote and rural areas where EEA3 is being implemented:

*'CARE and MoE has a good working relationship and excellent cooperation with each other – we work together with CARE to survey areas for the establishment of schools following which CARE will share their proposed plan with us – PED/DED then nominates where classes should be established with full cooperation and subsequent joint monitoring of CBE schools. These CBE schools play a very important role in communities – firstly, CARE is establishing classes where MoE is unable to reach and secondly the classes are delivering quality education combined with activities to change the people's perception and attitudes towards girls education - this is not easy after several decades of war but the CARE projects are having a positive impact'* Male DED official, Parwan Province.

*'The EEA3 project is one of the best educational projects of which I have participated in over the last 12 years – and it is providing quality education with effectiveness and efficiency in Ghazni province without any doubt or problem. The CBE system covers areas where MoE cannot reach due to limited resources – and the quality of education is very good – they have very skilled and professional teachers. CARE has complete cooperation with PED and provides support for PED's own strategic planning and development with regular reporting and information sharing'* Male DED official, Ghazni Province.

#### *Capacity development of teachers within the formal education system*

EEA3 recognises the importance of **increasing the capacity of local MoE teaching counterparts as well as CBE teachers and as such, MoE staff and MoE hub school teachers are invited to participate in CBE teacher training activities.** For example, in the most recent round of training, EEA3 provided training opportunities for 182 (91 female) hub school teachers, principals and MoE staff from PED and DED.

In addition, **to ensure that there is a smooth transition/full integration of CBE classes into the formal education system at the end of the EEA3 project (depending on availability of resources and capacity within local education departments) CBE teachers are being registered with the nearest MoE schools (hub schools identified together with MoE).** At the time of the review all CBE/LSCBE teachers had been registered with MoE schools. Interviews with PED/DED officials indicate that **this is seen to be strengthening formal system as CARE-trained CBE teachers are consistently regarded as having higher quality teaching skills and methods:**

*‘CARE conducts different academic and non-academic workshops and they are improving the professional skills of their teachers which has a positive impact on our schools too – I can even say the CBE teachers have better capabilities than government teachers. The CBE teachers are registering with the government and they are often selected for the government jobs because they have excellent qualities and capabilities’, Male DED official, Parwan Province.*

*CARE has trained many CBE and MoE teachers over time – and nowadays those teachers play a unique role in the MoE school system because they have different skills - they are able to solve students learning problems – they can create strong students. I have been part of these trainings and I believe such trainings can improve the capacity of teachers to be professional and skilled’ Male PED Official Khost Province.*

*‘CARE is providing different workshops to the MoE teachers and building the capacity of our teachers as well as the CBE teachers – it is a very beneficial activity and the MoE is able to make good use of those skills’ Female, PED official, Parwan Province.*

*‘The workshops which CARE conducts for hub school teachers are very important and useful – teachers have learnt not just subject matter but also different methods and skills for teaching knowledge to students – the students can remember the lessons very well after teachers have this kind of training’ Male DED official, Ghazni Province.*

## Outcome 5 Challenges

*MoE stakeholders show commitment to supporting CBE components beyond the life of the project but resources are limited to do so*

Qualitative data found that **PED/DED officials frequently noted the lack of available resources and capacity within the formal education system to either absorb transitioning CBE students into hub schools or when comparing CBE and MoE equivalent classes within schools.** The overall perception is that MoE cannot provide the same level of teacher capacity development, supporting educational materials or infrastructure as CARE. Additionally, **no PED/DED mentioned or were able to discuss the feasibility of integration of CBE schools into the formal system.** CBE is acknowledged as part of the formal education system under the National Education Strategic Plan, and that the institutionalisation of CBE is recommended by the Plan, with NGOs progressively transitioning into a capacity building role.<sup>29</sup>

*‘CARE’s CBE system is more effective than our own system, they have more resources and have more involvement and community regularly with the community people, therefore they have made much more improvements and increased the number of families sending their girls to school. CARE has many resources like school materials, textbooks, libraries, computer labs and so on. One day I visited a CBE class and saw students operating on a frog to learn its structure – I was really amazed. Compared to CARE’s facilities, such chances are not available for MoE students’. Male DED official, Khost Province.*

*‘Compared to MoE, CARE has lots of materials and required items for students and teacher – MoE is not in the position to provide such kinds of materials to all its school students. CARE is wealthier than the MoE so we request CARE to support hub schools also and provide them with stationery and help with improvement under its school improvement project’ Male PED official, Khost Province.*

---

<sup>29</sup> Islamic Republic of Afghanistan – Ministry of Education (2017) National Education Strategic Plan 2017–2021, p.47

*‘CARE provides quality school materials and equipment and play a positive role in capacity building of CBE teachers – they provide important materials for teachers that they can use of teaching like maths kits. If we compare CBE schools with our government schools, then government school students and teachers do not have access to those same materials. Sadly, these materials have a direct effect on student learnings and outcomes’* Male DED official, Paktia Province.

Parents themselves indicate their reluctance to enrol their children in government schools because the resources did not meet the same standards as those available in their own community through the EEA3 community schooling system.

**EEA3 recognises the balance required in delivering accessible quality education to a generation of young girls in real time whilst at the same time working to build community demand and supply of quality education through the national formal school system by facilitating School Improvement Planning (SIP).** School Improvement Planning in hub schools, aims to enable MoE hub-schools to self-assess and develop quality improvement plans using Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) standards as guidelines. **SIP is expected to improve school conditions and quality of education ensuring that girls and boys who complete CBE have a successful transition into formal education.** CARE is working to advocate that the MoE incorporate the SIP process into its education quality improvement strategy.

The project is **in the process of identifying appropriate hub-schools to demonstrate how an annual SIP planning process- guided by INEE standards - can lead toward sustained quality improvements in schools.** CARE will work with MoE school principals, teachers, students, and Parent- Teacher Association (PTA) members and community leaders to assess targeted hub schools and develop a School Improvement Plan. EEA3 will then provide a level of match funding to support the implementation of the SIP. It is expected schools and principals will then use the SIP process to work toward improving three priority areas: improving the teaching/learning process, school environment and parental involvement. However, **due to the two-month long office closure following the tragic security incident in Kabul in May 2019, this activity was postponed. However, this activity has recently recommenced and 54 hub schools have been identified for SIPs in 5 target provinces.**

### 3.2 Impact

Using the analytical framework introduced in section 2.2 **the review considers whether there is potential for the progress and intermediate outcomes achieved to translate into longer-term impacts.** The review has also sought to consider potential impacts with an understanding of the contextual challenges the project faces including issues of security, the rural and remote regions involved, the low literacy levels of parents and the lack of resources available both in the household and educational contexts.

The **framework presented below highlights those intermediate outcomes that show potential for longer-term impacts and should be explored further during the final evaluation.**

ATTAINMENT	EQUALITY	QUALITY	EMPOWERMENT
<p><b>Completion</b> PCBE/LSCBE girls are progressing through subsequent grades and progressively graduating. Graduation rates under EEA3 are increasing, compared to EEA2, with 6076 girls set to graduate by project end.</p> <p>Graduate girls are successfully transitioning and supporting themselves financially through contract teaching to MoE high-schools (G10), universities (engineering, medicine, IT) and pre-degree/vocational work (nursing, mid-wifery).</p> <p>However, the issue of proximity and the perceived risk and security concerns for girls attending hub schools, continue to be a barrier with many parents unwilling to send their girls to MoE school suggesting that the perceived risks facing girls outweigh the perceived educational benefits.</p>	<p><b>Communities' educational opportunity perception</b> Parents, teachers, village education committees and religious leaders hold views that support equal opportunities for girls and boys to participate in and benefit from education.</p> <p>Support is reduced however once a girl is married, with priority often given to her new responsibilities and the required virtues and behaviours as a wife. The issue of marriage continues to be a sensitive and private matter within families. When a girl discontinues school as a result of marriage, VECs and religious leaders are reluctant to become involved. Nevertheless, religious leaders report engaging with families to <i>delay</i> early marriage.</p> <p>VECs and religious leaders are active in trying to solve barriers to attendance including household poverty levels (bride price and early marriage), domestic responsibilities and socio-cultural gender norms that limit girls public exposure – approaching absenteeism in this way can also be seen as drop-out prevention.</p>	<p><b>Suitable educational environment</b> Students, teachers, students and village education committees are generally satisfied with schools and classrooms in target areas and indicate that they consider them to be: accessible, safe, and with adequate facilities (safe drinking water supplies, heating, cooling, sanitation) in the majority of cases.</p> <p>Teachers are satisfied with educational materials (textbooks, training manuals, library materials, computer labs and basic equipment such as blackboards, chalk and eraser).</p>	<p><b>Supportive strategic relations</b> Village education committees are active and valuable in monitoring classes, and facilitating dialogue with families on the value and importance of education.</p> <p>Religious and community leaders are actively using their unique position as leaders and scholars to advocate for families to make decisions in favour of girls' right education.</p>

ATTAINMENT	EQUALITY	QUALITY	EMPOWERMENT
<p><b>Persistence/retention</b></p> <p>Girls enrolment and attendance rates are increasing, and, combined with active village education committees and religious leaders' support of community-based schooling, are likely to be maintained. Mixed PCBE classes are a positive strategy and ensures that more girls are able to learn in situations where fewer teachers or resources are available.</p> <p>Barriers to retention are being addressed effectively such that attendance rates for both PCBE/LSCBE students are likely to be maintained.</p>	<p><b>Teachers' gender sensitivity</b></p> <p>Teachers self-report to be facilitating equal conditions for girls' and boys' learning through equal praise and reward, opportunities for learning, addressing harassment issues and alternative approaches to discipline.</p>	<p><b>Relevant educational content</b></p> <p>Teachers are performing at a high standard and are viewed as professional and competent by parents, village education committees and MoE officials.</p> <p>Teacher training is promoting the regular use of a consistent curriculum and supporting learning materials that cover core subject matter and basic skills with pertinent, gender- sensitive and contextually appropriate subject matter.</p> <p>Teachers are very satisfied with training and have widened their skill-sets and increased subject-specific knowledge as well as developed their capacity to engage students through participatory methodologies.</p>	<p><b>Girls' agency</b></p> <p>Girls report that participating in peer groups has developed their self-esteem and self-confidence as well as their group-work, problem-solving, communication and leadership skills. Girls report viewing these skills as tools for daily living and lifetime learning – the developed of these personal competencies combined with educational competencies have led many to voice opinions and make self-protective decisions, advocating for their future education and value within families. Girls also report that they value peer support groups not only because they supported academic performance, but because of the friendship networks and social connectedness gained.</p>
<p><b>Achievement</b></p> <p>Across all grades, girls participating in EEA3 CBE schools have improved their learning outcomes consistently (based on the recent mid-term and final exam score of 80%), indicating that girls are moving towards becoming established students and proficient learners. In parallel, the quasi-experimental study conducted by the STAGES II project indicates that the CBE/LSCBE approach has a significant impact in increasing literacy and numeracy outcomes over and above a comparison group.</p>	<p><b>Children's perception of educational equity and equality</b></p> <p>Students report that girls and boys are treated equal in all aspects of learning including: teachers asking questions equally of girls and boys; providing equal chances to girls and boys to undertake activities; telling positive stories about both girls and boys; resolving teasing between girls and boys immediately and assigning classroom chores equally to girls and boys.</p>	<p><b>Girl/child-centred processes</b></p> <p>Teachers self-report greater awareness of inclusive teaching practices. Teaching methodologies such as interactive learning activities such as group and using simple and engaging materials were often reported to be applied by both teacher and this is supported by monitoring and reporting from village education committee members.</p>	<p><b>Structural environment for girls</b></p> <p>MoE and EEA3 work collaboratively and effectively at district, provincial, and national levels, to ensure that CBE is integrated as an approach to meet education needs across the country. Through SIPs, EEA3 works to ensure that Government is seen as the main provider of education as a public service and that hub schools are a suitable alternative to/transition from CBE schools.</p> <p>The number of female teachers is increasing through the innovative paraprofessional training delivered during G9 and these teachers are being integrated into both the community-based schooling framework and the MoE formal school system with circular benefits for girls enrolment.</p>

### 3.3 Sustainability

Broadly, qualitative and quantitative data from respondents and in documents seen by the review, indicates that **the numbers of girls who enrol, continue to attend schools and graduate sometimes in the most discouraging circumstances, is growing and is linked to the expanding number community-based schools and female teachers**, both of which are significant achievements in the Afghan context. However **the demand for female teachers is high (currently fewer than 20 percent of teachers are female in the provinces where EEA3 is being implemented)<sup>30</sup> and therefore demand continues to outstrip the supply**/number of female teachers recruited by Government, with national budget ceilings also limiting the number of trainees that can be employed outside of donor-funded community-based schooling initiatives. Moreover, **the positive trend is reversible and continued progress is dependent on continued improvement in provision of basic facilities and inclusive resources for female teachers and students, which from interviews with PED/DDED officials are sometimes seriously lacking in the formal system.**

**Sustainable growth in enrolment trends depends on improved education accessibility and quality both within the community-based schooling framework and the formal schooling system, and also on opportunities for graduates to make use of learning when they leave school and seek further studies or employment.** Whilst the review was able to gather data on **shifting community perceptions towards valuing girls' education**, it is harder to say what impact this trend is having on **community perceptions of women's role within the family and their economic independence and empowerment once they complete their education.** By its nature, the momentum generated by women seeking education often as the first females in their families to do so, is likely to grow slowly at first. It will be sustainable once it is a reasonably well established and accepted social norm - this is cannot yet be said to be the case and **progress remains vulnerable to an unstable situation where families face continued economic hardships and embedded traditional and conservative social norms still dictate that a girl's value is through her perceived virtue and subsequent marriage.**

Finally, **whilst community-based education programs such as EEA3 has allowed many girls who could not reach a school to have access to education, without government support, and combined with an overall downward trend in overseas development assistance for Afghanistan, the system itself is at risk of being unsustainable.** Rising expectations regarding increased access and quality that are not met risk undermining past investment by government and donors alike. Although, the review found a strong sense of coordination and collaboration amongst MoE staff for CARE-supported CBE schools which undoubtedly contributes to sustainability and indicates a degree of program success, there remains a need for **longer-term strategic thinking around community financing, advocacy and resource mobilisation to promote ownership and counter the widespread perception amongst VECs and even PED/DED officials that donors and implementing partners are responsible for continuing the community-based schooling framework.**

---

<sup>30</sup> Human Rights Watch. 2017. 'I won't be a doctor and one-day you'll be sick' Girls Access to Education in Afghanistan'. New York.

### 3.4 Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning

The EEA3 project team as a whole are involved with MEL processes (e.g. data collection, data analysis, information management, reflection exercises) in some way. This is **a real strength of the team – everyone from the project manager to field officers understands and is engaged with the project theory of change and how the activities relate to the strategic objectives** and goal of the project.

From reviewing the project documentation, it is clear that **the project has a detailed MEL plan and has been committed to tracking activity/output indicators for reporting purposes, and that this type of information and analysis is readily available as part of the information management system.** The team has also invested in monitoring at the intermediate outcome level through undertaking internal assessments and reflection workshops including to assess progress against the project indicators.

In terms of the MEL system in place, a comprehensive monitoring, evaluation and learning plan was developed and has since been implemented, allowing EEA3 to regularly collect data and monitor and reflect on progress towards and achievement of intermediate and end-of-project outcomes. However, the review found, **indicator under EOPO 4 and 5 could be expanded to include: perception-based indicators on community attitudes in support of girls education particularly in relation to religious leaders and parents; community attitudes in relation to preferential decision-making for transition to lower-secondary CBE and delayed early marriages; and the employment opportunities economic independence of young women graduates/trainee teachers.** Perception-based indicators of self-improvement by project participants can lend great insight into interpretation of project results, however the MEL system must ensure there is clear understanding on what constitutes improvement, so that the definitions are uniformly applied. **Given the time remaining for implementation, these indicators are best explored through the final evaluation, but should be considered for any MEL systems developed under future programming** in this sector (see recommendations for further detail).

## 4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

The timing of the mid-term review coincided with the Afghanistan Presidential elections which required the team to be flexible with the timeframe for the data collection component. This has meant completion of the review and its findings and recommendations are leading into the winter vacation from January to March 2020, with the project currently ending in December 2020. These recommendations are intended to contribute to improved project planning and implementation for EEA3, with the hope that others may find useful lessons as well. Whilst all of the recommendations below are considered to ensure project impact and sustainability, in recognition of the remaining timeframes, project implementation schedule, recommendations have been ordered according to the current and future programming.

### 4.1 Current Programming

#### *Build capacity of teachers to discuss student learning outcomes and academic achievement with parents*

As noted earlier, teachers and VECs rarely discuss learning outcomes with parents, and focus predominately on issues of administration or attendance. Going forward, teachers should be supported on how they communicate learning outcomes and academic performance to parents who are not familiar with the system, so that their children's futures and potential can be recognised and encouraged as they transition between primary and lower-secondary schools, or as young adolescent women graduating from LSCBE begin to advocate within their families for opportunities such as enrolment at high school/training institutes/universities.

#### *Showcase successful young women graduates in diverse careers to broaden young girls understanding of employment options*

Security and safeguarding of girls' will continue to be a primary concern for most families, with parents and students alike considering employment outside of their immediate community unlikely in the future. This safeguarding does not only refer to keeping them physically safe, but also ensuring their character and values are within community standards. Common perceptions among communities are that girls who work outside of their immediate community are more at risk to behave immorally or demonstrate behaviours which may bring shame on a family name. Qualitative data found that the awareness of potential employment options appeared to be greatly limited among girls – the majority referred to becoming doctors, teachers or engineers, further reflecting socio-cultural attitudes towards girls' employment. The position of a doctor is widely considered to be pinnacle of success and is generally accepted to be an appropriate role for both males and females. The role of teacher is also noted as a suitable role for girls based on social norms – as long as the teaching role is within the community. Many girls are widely unaware of employment options available to them either in their community or within the country. EEA3 could consider showcasing successful young women graduates in diverse careers, especially among secondary school students, to encourage a broader understanding of potential employment opportunities and the necessary skills sets required to fulfil such positions. Showcasing may involve short radio-style interviews or films that can be played in the classroom and/or peer group sessions. There may also be value in introducing simple small business development and management modules to the existing suite of paraprofessional training for those young girls that are facing early marriage or with conservative families that would prefer 'safe' options such as tailoring, embroidery or weaving for their daughters.

### *Capacity-building to strengthen VEC motivation and advocacy skills for engaging with hub schools beyond the life of the project*

EEA3 has been successful in ensuring the smooth transition of students from CBE schools to hub schools which is a reflection of the effective relationship between the project and local government. However, EEA3's strategy of working in partnership with MoE to integrate community-based schools into the formal system (subject to resource availability) is dependent on the capacity of VECs to leverage the potential value of collaboration with local government schools beyond coordination and reporting and instead, for continuing support and resource mobilisation (particularly in the context of ongoing economic insecurity and hardship for many families). Capacity-building should therefore be provided to VECs to develop their advocacy skills and confidence in approaching PED/DED officials and advocating for future support (beyond the integration of students from primary to secondary or high school).

### *Develop strategies that aim to delay early marriage and reach already married girls to keep them in school*

In order to address early marriage effectively, it is necessary to focus on the different players involved and how they can be made agents of positive change in relation to child marriage, without unfairly or impractically placing the entirety of the onus for resisting child marriage entirely on young girls, or their families. This will require programming to develop specific messaging and advocacy around education for girls over the age of 12 – such advocacy work needs to focus on countering existing socio-cultural norms and demonstrating the value of girls' education at later years through being potential wage earners rather than using marriage as income-generation. Whilst it may not be feasible during the remainder of EEA3, future programming should also consider ways in which families can be supported to generate additional income where economic insecurity is the primary reason for initiating marriage. Techniques and support should be provided to religious leaders and VECs to engage more directly with both families involved – the bride's family planning an early marriage *and* the groom's/husband's family to try and secure girls' education before and after marriage. Peer groups when appropriately connected with female VECs could also create safe spaces and channels for them to speak up for what they want and speak out against harmful practices within a supportive environment and with adults that have capacity to respond in a culturally appropriate way. There may also be a need for teachers to provide supplementary teachings or materials for young married girls so that they can catch up on lessons missed due to their domestic responsibilities in their new role and families.

### *Leverage the end-of-project evaluation for the design of a fourth phase*

The end-of-project evaluation of EEA3 (scheduled for October 2020) offers the potential to not only capture program outcomes and impact, but it can also provide a baseline for any future phases (assuming the program continues to implement in current districts and provinces). Taking this approach would mean allocating sufficient resources to conduct the CARE's Common Indicator Framework in its entirety thereby measuring achievements across the four domains related to girls' education and development (Attainment, Quality, Equality and Empowerment) as well as providing the necessary foundation for comprehensive program design. Using the CIF learning trends are tracked at multiple levels, identifying not only the acquisition of academic skills through standardized assessments but also the development of leadership skills, gender equitable attitudes, and the evolution of the environment within the broader community and school, focusing on the enablers for future usage of knowledge and skills. The importance of a multi-layered approach is particularly important in the Afghan context where hard data largely emerging from development projects can complement data collected at the

national level, moving from simple tracking of average progress in the acquisition of basic literacy and numeracy to a sophisticated analysis of the broader progress at the individual and contextual levels.

As noted earlier, the review found only a very small number of students identified as living with a disability. This matches the experience of other evaluative studies such as the EEA3 Needs Assessment in 2018 and the STAGES Evaluation. However, according to Accessibility Organisations for Afghan Disabled, 95% of children with disabilities in Afghanistan do not attend schools due to an inaccessible environment.<sup>31</sup> Therefore, for the final evaluation it is recommended to firstly, include the Washington Group of *extended* short set of questions which includes questions on anxiety and depression. The experience of other studies has been that proportionally, a larger number of girls face these issues in contexts similar to that of Afghanistan. Secondly, it is recommended that the standard threshold or cut-off for disability is lowered so that students with mild disabilities ('some difficulty' in the WG scale) are counted and disaggregated for during analysis.

## 4.2 Future Programming

### *Community financing for sustainability*

The current reliance on implementing partners for sustainability of the community-based schooling system needs to be recognised in future programming, with a focus on piloting different advocacy and resource mobilisation strategies and models beyond that of integration with hub schools. Engaging parents and communities in dialogue and potentially expanding programming to create income-generation opportunities (or creating synergies with other livelihood programming) will be key to generating support and resources for education at the local level. Mobilising Community Development Councils (CDCs) to incorporate education into their development plans and proposals could be a more realistic option (noting there are limited roles for women to advocate within current CDC structures and ways of decision-making) and there are learnings from other program such as the Steps Towards Afghan Girls Educational Success II (STAGES) program that could inform the design of such interventions.

---

<sup>31</sup> SADEC, 2018. Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan-3 Needs Assessment Report.

## ANNEX 1 STORIES OF CHANGE



*'I thought this disability of mine would not allow me to study. I thought I will never go forward because I cannot walk like other girls. After being part of LSCBE I earned a scholarship and am studying medicine – I feel like the strongest girl in my family. Now I am hopeful about my future – I want to become a specialized doctor and serve my family and country'*

### Bi Bi Afia, Graduate LSCBE Student, Khost Province

My name is Bi Bi Afia, and I am from Khost Province. I am currently a CARE scholarship recipient and I am studying medicine at university. My favourite subjects are biology and anatomy.

I completed my primary school education and although I wished to continue to through to lower-secondary, I could not because the government school was over four kilometres from my home – the distance meant my family had concerns about my safety and security travelling so far. For these reasons over the next two years I stayed at home.

At this time, my family did not value girls' education, and even today most of the girls in my family are uneducated. In fact, it is only because of my disability that my parents allowed me to be educated as they considered I would need to be independent in the future. Truly I did not believe that I could have a bright future because of my disability, and so my parents encouraged and allowed me to study.

After two years, my parents together with others in our community requested that CARE establish a lower-secondary school in our village and this is how I was able to return to school. Our village is far away from the centre and city, without the LSCBE school there were no other chances for girls like me to continue our education. CARE supported us in a tough time and changed our dreams to reality.

It was through the LSCBE school that I first participated in an equipped biology lab – the learning I experienced in that lab is what led me to me to medical school and to this day it enables me to be more active in the faculty where I receive higher scores for those subjects I studied during my time in secondary and high school. I also became familiar with computers and using libraries and books – all of which helps me in my studies now.

I also learned many skills during my peer group and the village education committee meetings. We had the chance to play an amazing role presenting different topics in the peer group and to the committee. I learned solutions to the problem and techniques of communication. Those skills help me at university to be an active participant in class and to have courage in answering the teacher's question. Now I feel that I can lead a big group of people.

During my time in lower-secondary CARE did a lot of work to change community people's minds and hearts about the importance of girl's education and reversed many people's thinking – when the LSCBE school was established in our village,

our women village education committee and women teachers worked hard to change people's minds, holding meetings with parents and convincing families who were reluctant. Since then our community leaders have also understood the value of girls' education and have also changed the minds of men and women positively. Even in my own family, the minds of my parents changed and when I graduated from LSCBE they supported me and organised transportation to the government high school and in this way, I completed high school.

When I graduated from high school, I thought I will never go forward, because I can't walk as other girls, and my family was facing economic difficulties so they could not support me to continue my studies at university. At that time the CARE female staff were my role models and I wished to become like them, but with my disability I could not see it becoming a reality. Then, when our teacher told us about CARE's scholarship program, I felt hopeful but only for a short time because I did not think they would give a chance to disabled girls like me. I took the exam anyway – when I was invited to the office and they explained I had met all the criteria and that they wanted to include girls like me in the program, I was joyful and I could not stop my tears...I cried for many minutes with joy.

Since I passed the scholarship entrance exam, I have started studying medicine at university. I'm not yet working but the scholarship covers all my university costs (fees, transportation, textbooks and stationery). Without this generous support it would not be possible for me to achieve my wish to study and become a medical professional. I hope I will have a good income one day and will support my family accordingly. In the meantime, when there is a calculation in the family, I am very good at maths and I help them a lot!

Once upon a time people considered me to be a non-valuable girl, but now I feel like the strongest girl in my family. I am a role- model for other younger girls and they share with me their problems and I give them good advice. If I think back to the beginning before I started with LSCBE I was suffering because of my disability, but now I am hopeful about my future and those negative ideas are gone from my mind, instead I know I can work hard and make my future. I want to become a specialised doctor and serve my family and my country.



*‘Through the CBE school my mind came alive. Without CBE I would be illiterate. I heard about women and girls’ rights for the first time in the LSCBE school. This is what led to me to enrol in law at university. I love human beings and I want to learn more about human rights, specifically those of women and girls and to defend those rights.’*

## Hassan Pari, Graduate LSCBE Student, Khost Province

My name is Hassan Pari, and I am from Khost Province. I am an LSCBE graduate and I am studying in law at university. I love human beings and I want to learn more about human rights, especially those of women and girls. Besides this I am learning about politics and good governance.

I completed my primary education and although I wished to continue my studies, I remained at home as the government school was far away and due to traditional custom, it was not acceptable for me to travel outside of the village to attend secondary school. When CARE established a secondary school inside our village it was my chance to complete my secondary school, which I did, but once again I found myself at home after I graduated because the high school was a great distance from our village. After two years of staying at home, a girls’ high school was established near our village, and with a lot of difficulty I convinced my parents to let me attend – it was my mother who made this happen – she came to understand the value of girls education while I was in LSCBE and had many meetings with CARE about my future – in the end she convinced my brother to accompany me every day over the five kilometres to school. It was difficult but we inspired each other and I completed my high school. Without CARE’s support in changing my mother’s mind and gaining her approval, I would not have been able to reach my wish to complete high school.

Through the LSCBE school my mind came alive. Without the LSCBE school, I would be an illiterate girl. I learned how to participate in a laboratory, familiarized myself with different books in the library, and through my peer group I learned how to lead folk, how to talk and facilitate in front of an audience. During that time, I also participated in VEC meetings, and I learned a lot from their management, how to problem-solve and how to encourage others to pursue their education.

Most importantly, I heard about women and girls’ rights for the first time in my LSCBE school. It was this awareness that led me to be admitted to the law faculty and to learn much more about human rights, specifically women and girls. What I have learned during LSCBE is very effective in my life, my courage has increased and I understand my rights of social life and education.

During my final year in LSCBE, I also learned teaching methodology and because of these skills, I am now also teaching in an LSCBE class. My earnings are what allow me to continue my studies at

university. I can afford my university textbooks and transportation costs by myself. I help my family with expenses reimbursement too. Now I am self-sufficient financially.

CARE's school played a unique role in shaping of people's mind about girls' education. Before people were opposed to girls' education, I heard lots of gossip when I was in primary and secondary school. People would call girls who attended school, rude or impudent, but today those same people are calling girls who attend school 'role-models' and everyone hopes for their daughters to receive an education. They struggle to pave the way to education for their girls. The elders of our community are powerful people, and today they do not oppose girls' education. They understand the value of girls' education and they encourage others to allow their girls to go school.

I do like to mentor younger girls; I often share my experience and the knowledge I have gained with them. This is a lesson learned for them, and therefore they follow me. Taking advantage of my experience gives them their own power to struggle with obstacles and reach their dreams.

Today I am in the university and hopeful about my future. I would like to complete my education in law and work in the field, defending people's rights. I would like everyone to understand their rights and gain their rights from society.

## ANNEX 2 TERMS OF REFERENCE

### Terms of Reference (ToR) For Midterm Evaluation of Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan (EEA-III) Project



<b>Project:</b>	<b>Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan (Phase Three)</b>
<b>Position Title:</b>	<b>Consultant for Mid-Term Review</b>
<b>Place of Assignment:</b>	<b>Based remotely or located in Kabul, Afghanistan</b>
<b>Reporting to:</b>	<b>Wahidullah Wahid, Education Program Senior Coordinator and Azizullah Nadiri, Project Manager</b>
<b>Project Duration:</b>	<b>January 2018 – December 2020</b>
<b>Project Start Date:</b>	<b>1 January 2018</b>
<b>Donor:</b>	<b>DFAT (Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade)</b>
<b>Expected Start Date:</b>	<b>Beginning of August 2019</b>
<b>Completion Date:</b>	<b>Mid-October 2019</b>

---

#### 1. Background

##### *CARE International in Afghanistan*

CARE is a humanitarian non-governmental organization committed to working with poor women, men, boys, girls, communities, and institutions to have a significant impact on the underlying causes of poverty. CARE seeks to contribute to economic and social transformation, unleashing the power of the most vulnerable women and girls. CARE has been a major player in the education sector in Afghanistan since 1994. CARE Afghanistan aims to provide greater access to quality basic education for school age children, particularly girls, in the remotest areas where government schools are not accessible. CARE Afghanistan's Education program reaches out to marginalized children in underserved rural and remote areas in five provinces of the country through number of community-based interventions.

Innovation and impact are two driving forces in CARE's education Programme, such as the girls' lower secondary community-based education and scholarship initiative, community libraries, "power within" building girls' leadership potential, and life skills training for employability. CARE has contributed significantly to the shaping of the community-based education policy in Afghanistan through its close collaboration with the Ministry of Education and community-based education consortia working across the country.

##### *Project*

CARE has been implementing the Empowerment through Education Project in Afghanistan (EEA) since May 2011 and the project is now in its third phase. EEA works with communities in five Provinces (Ghazni, Kapisa, Khost, Paktia and Parwan) to set up a community-based education (CBE) program in rural and remote communities, where regular public schools are located far from villages and conservative social norms and safety concerns severely restrict girls' mobility and access to schooling. The second phase of the EEA project (EEA-2) was providing early childhood education (4-6 year-olds) and primary classes (grades 1-6) to girls and boys, and lower secondary (7-9 grades) to girls only in targeted communities. Girls attending Lower Secondary CBE (LSCBE) were also participating in leadership skills development and paraprofessional trainings in health and teaching, equipping girls for participation in decision-making processes at home and community levels, and for future employment. CARE's lower secondary CBE model is the only non-state lower secondary education program provided for girls in the country.

### *EEA-3 (January 2018 – December 2020)*

The goal and objectives of EEA- 3 are:

#### **Goal**

Children, particularly girls, in targeted communities of five provinces of Afghanistan will have access to a broader range of opportunities in life after obtaining a quality, empowering education.

#### **Objectives/End of Project Outcomes**

- *Outcome 1:* Increase children's, particularly girls, access to basic education in grades one to nine through community-based education.
- *Outcome 2:* Improve the quality of education through training and coaching of teachers, aligned with Ministry of Education (MoE) policies.
- *Outcome 3:* Increase girls' skills, confidence and abilities to participate in school decision-making structures and technical skills for employment.
- *Outcome 4:* Increase community support for girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education.
- *Outcome 5:* Strengthen stakeholder networks to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice.

The third phase of the project builds upon lessons learned and emerging trends observed in EEA-2 and other CARE projects implementing the CBE/LSCBE approach, in particular the transformative impact that completing LSCBE has on girls' lives. There are a significant body of lessons learned by CARE through the EEA project and more broadly, by NGOs, Ministry of Education and participating schools and communities involved in community based education. The following are particularly relevant to EEA-3, and have informed this design:

- **Reaching lower secondary is a breakthrough for girls:** 87% of the girls who completed LSCBE (Grade 9) were able to continue their studies in regular government hub schools<sup>32</sup>. LSCBE graduates have been able to obtain gainful employment as teachers, nurses and social workers, and are actively contributing to their families' income. Communities are reportedly delaying girls' marriage to ensure completion of their education. The completion of LSCBE seems to be a game-changer for girls, not only allowing them to pursue expanded life opportunities, increasing their mobility and voice, but also enhancing their social status at home and community levels.

---

<sup>32</sup> Empowerment through Education in Afghanistan Mid-Term Evaluation Report, 2017

On the other hand, students who complete CBE (Grade 6) but do not have access to a LSCBE class in their village, rarely transition into the nearest regular public school. Only 10 percent<sup>33</sup> of the girls graduating from CBE are able to transition into Grade 7 classes in regular public schools, due to the limited availability of girls' schools and the large distances (4km or more) to the nearest hub school. While these girls have acquired basic literacy and numeracy skills, most are not able to find employment or to continue their education, unlike their counterparts who had finished LSCBE, for whom Grade 9 completion opened multiple opportunities in life. Therefore, it is clear that the benefits of education increase exponentially once girls have opportunities to attend CBE beyond Grade 6; these benefits also seem to expand into a broader shift in gender norms affecting girls.

For this reason, EEA-3 is focusing on LSCBE (grade 7-9) and CBE (grade 1-6) rather than include Early Childhood Education services. This will help prioritise resources for LSCBE that has demonstrated significant impact for girls' education. The focus of EEA-3 will be around transition from CBE to post-primary opportunities, particularly through LSCBE and shifts in community norms in order to allow adolescent girls to transition to secondary school and employment.

- **Numeracy skills:** While girls attending CBE/ LSCBE have acquired literacy skills at a faster rate than their counterparts enrolled in regular schools, there is considerable room for improvement in numeracy. Girls in grade 4 have an average score of 58 percent in a test including basic tasks (number recognition, quantity discrimination, addition, subtraction, multiplication and division), while grade 10 students have reached an average of 80 percent<sup>34</sup>. The results indicate that a subgroup of students has not acquired basic competencies in math, particularly in more advanced tasks (subtraction, multiplication and division)<sup>35</sup>. The finding suggests the need to (1) build teacher capacity to teach basic numeracy; and (2) work with teachers to provide coaching on identifying students who are lagging behind in the acquisition of basic skills and addressing their needs.
- **Limited participation of women:** Limited participation of women in decision-making processes in village education committees (VECs/ shuras), linked to traditional gender norms<sup>36</sup> creates challenges for gender inclusion. While women are participating in all-female VECs, there is limited evidence of their input in school governance, and qualitative data suggests that men make the majority of the decisions. Women's low literacy levels, restrictions on female voice in public fora and limited leadership skills/ experience of practice of leadership are potential causes behind this situation. Monitoring efforts to track non-overt women's influence in governance processes should also be made as traditional qualitative interviews may not adequately identify women's influence on male decisions in VECs.

These lessons have influenced CARE's CBE/ LSCBE programming in EEA-3, as well as advocacy approaches on implementation of the National Education Strategic Plan 2017-2021.

---

<sup>33</sup> Ibid

<sup>34</sup> Corboz, J. (2017) Endline GEC Report – Steps Towards Afghan Girls' Educational Success

<sup>35</sup> Ibid

<sup>36</sup> Common finding observed at EEA2's Mid-Term Evaluation Report and at the Endline Study of the STAGES project

This new phase (phase 3) has been developed in response to DFAT's advice and commitment to fund EEA-3 for three more years (January 2018-December 2020, at a cost of AUD10, 000,000), primary CBE classes continued and coverage for the LSCBE expanded to Ghazni, Kapisa and Parwan Provinces. EEA-3 will further refine technical approaches to include a greater focus on (a) boosting numeracy skills, (b) improving women's and girls' active participation in equitable community management of education services, and (c) increasing girls' transition rates into post-primary education. The project will continue to strengthen stakeholder networks, including Ministry of Education (MoE), donors and development partners in country, to advance the rights of girls' and boys' education through policy and practice. Following the updated CBE policy released by the MoE, that now includes lower secondary community-based education, EEA-3 will work to ensure integration of CBE classes into the formal education system by the end of the project (or upon availability of capacity and resources of local education departments). EEA-3's design is closely aligned with the recently launched National Education Strategic Plan 2017-2021 and with the global push for Sustainable Development Goal #4.

CARE is seeking to strengthen its overall Community-Based Education (CBE) program to meet the fundamental human rights and basic needs of a quality basic education for 7,586 <sup>37</sup> students (77% female for primary and 100% for lower secondary) in 255 CBE primary and lower secondary community based classes taught by 421 schoolteachers (56% female), and managed by 247 Village Education Committees (57% female) in 160 rural and remote communities across the five target provinces.

## **2. Rationale, purpose and audience**

The main purpose of the midterm evaluation is to evaluate whether project activities (from 1 January 2018 to 30 June 2019) are on track in terms of achieving the objectives/outcomes that have been set, and to learn and improve the ongoing work for the remaining period of the EEA-3 project (July 2019 - December 2020). The midterm evaluation should lay the ground for the final evaluation of the Project. Sub-purposes:

1. Validate project theory of change and project assumptions, and make recommendations for adapting and streamlining the MEL frameworks
2. Provide recommendations to inform the future direction of the EEA project
3. Identify constraints/challenges/issues affecting progress and provide recommendations to address them
4. Identify opportunities to increase impact and enhance the implementation and management of the project
5. Assess the mainstreaming of cross cutting issues including Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment and Disability Inclusion
6. Provide CARE with recommendations to address any implementation challenges in the remainder of the program.

The findings of this evaluation will contribute to the improvement and development of CARE's education program in Afghanistan. The results of the evaluation will also be made available to the Ministry of Education (MoE), CBE providers, and relevant donors.

## **3. Evaluation questions**

---

<sup>37</sup> These students will be supported over three year period of this project.

Criteria	Key Evaluation Question	Sub Key Evaluation Questions
Effectiveness	How effective was the project in achieving its intended outcomes to date?	To what extent are children, particularly girls and students with disabilities, attending CARE's CBE/LSCBE classes?
		To what extent are children, particularly girls and students with disabilities, continuing their secondary education after completing CARE's CBE/LSCBE classes?
		To what extent do communities support girls' education and women's decision-making in management of community-based education?
Impact	What were the expected/unexpected impacts on target communities (boys, girls, students with disabilities, mothers, fathers, families, female teachers, male teachers, VEC members, community leaders)?	What have been the expected/unexpected impacts on students, with and without disabilities (particularly girls)?
		To what extent have we seen changes in gender norms and behaviours (e.g. changes to recognition of women and girls' rights, changes to women and girls' mobility, changes to rates of early marriage, changes to women/girls decision-making, changes to women's opportunities for employment outside the home)?
		What has been the impact on Ministry of Education policy and practice? Is this change likely to be sustainable?
Sustainability	What do we need to focus on over the next 18 months to ensure the project's interventions are sustainable?	Are changes we have seen to community attitudes (e.g. to the role of women, girls education, early marriage) likely to be sustainable? What more can CARE do to support the sustainability of this intervention?
		Are changes experienced by girls themselves likely to be sustainable? To what extent have we seen sustainable and enduring changes that will affect girls' future lives, and the lives of girls who come behind them? What more can CARE do to support the sustainability of this intervention?

*Note: All data and information must be disaggregated by sex and age (and other factors, if possible, such as disability and ethnicity)*

#### 4. Approach and methods

The consultant is expected to either conduct the work in Kabul, **or** to develop the tools outside the country and share with local enumerators and data clerks<sup>38</sup> for data collection and entry.

Following an initial desk review and briefing, the consultant should propose an appropriate mixed methodology drawing on quantitative and participatory qualitative methods in an Evaluation Plan which will be agreed with CARE before implementing the evaluation. In the Evaluation Plan, the consultant should explicitly describe how their approach will ensure gender sensitivity (such as including mixed-sex enumerators). In addition, the evaluation approaches and tools must consider the

<sup>38</sup> The local enumerator and data entry clerks will be recruited by CARE Afghanistan, Education program and all associated cost of the local enumerators/surveyors and data entry clerks will be covered by CARE Afghanistan.

reasonably high incidence of illiteracy among project participants, and the ability of people living with disabilities to input into the evaluation.

The consultant is expected to define and carry out an evaluation approach that is most appropriate and relevant to the described context. This should include specification of the techniques for data collection and analysis, structured field visits, and interactions with impact populations, the evaluation team, and other stakeholders (including communities, VEC members, teachers, students, relevant MoE staff, and other sector NGOs).

The evaluator will be expected to review all key documentation for the project (backing documentation, proposals, emails, reports, etc), and if located in Afghanistan, visit the project areas (subject to CO security Unit approval and consultant agreement to visit the country) and interview project staff communities, VEC members, teachers, students, relevant MoE staff, and other sector NGOs. The Evaluator will also interview DFAT Canberra and DFAT Post Kabul staff as the project's donor.

The evaluation tools will be developed by the consultant and will be shared with CARE Afghanistan Education and MEL team for review and translation into local language, and then be shared with local enumerator/ surveyors for conducting the evaluation.

If the consultant is located remotely, the local enumerators will collect the data from field and will share with data entry clerk to enter into the system and share with consultant for review and further process. The consultant will need to consider how they will build the capacity of enumerators to undertake the fieldwork in-country. The consultant will also need to consider what level of supervision/de-briefing will be required to ensure that data collection is undertaken as correctly as possible.

The choice of methods will take into consideration:

- Previous use and experience by CARE Afghanistan in prior phases of EEA and related programs
- Consistency with key data required by the Ministry of Education from community based education and formal schools, in relation to enrolment, progression and retention plus test results, including in key areas relating to literacy and numeracy
- Contribution to understanding processes of change – particularly in gender relations, norms and practices - and reasons for changes (or lack of change) from the perspectives of diverse people and groups, particularly women and girls
- Tracking outcomes - including enrolment, attendance, performance, retention and progression by sex (and disability status) - by grade level, class/school and district
- In-depth examination of changes over time of key participants - girls, boys and girls and boys with disability, women and men teachers, parents, community leaders, and other stakeholders
- Processes to engage key stakeholders in sense-making and interpreting data to inform actions/decisions to strengthen outcomes
- Appropriateness for children and people with disabilities (*see section 7: Ethical Protocols for more information*)
- Effective use of evaluation budget and time.

## 5. Schedule, budget and logistics

### *Schedule*

Activity	Tentative Dates*
Signing of contract with successful candidate	TBC, but likely 1 August 2019
Verbal briefing of the key issues and priority information by CARE Afghanistan/CARE Australia	5 August
Review of project documents	6-15 August
Submit midterm Evaluation Plan (methodology, detailed work plan, and risk management plan) to CARE for review and approval	19 August
Submit draft data collection tools for CARE review and approval	21 August
Training of enumerators	August-September
Field work, Interviews, FGDs, etc. (including de-briefing/supervision if the consultant is located remotely)	August-September
Data and information analysis (in coordination with CARE staff)	August-September
Presentation of initial findings to CARE for validation purposes	25 September
Submission of Draft Evaluation Report	2 October
Submission of Final Evaluation Report	21 October
Presentation of findings and recommendations to CARE	21 October

\* Note that there are numerous blackout periods over the next few months, where CARE staff will not be working:

- Eid el Fitr holidays (after the Holy month of Ramadan) June 4 - 8
- Eid al-Qurban holidays August 11 – 13
- Independence Day August 19
- Martyrs and Ahmad Shah Masoud Day September 9
- Ashura September 10
- Presidential elections of Afghanistan: 28 September 2019. There may be some project activity suspension or restriction (on gathering, meetings, visits, group work etc...)

### *Logistics*

CARE Afghanistan Education program will be responsible for provision of overall required logistic facilities including (local enumerators/surveyors workshop venue, food, accommodation, transportation to the project sites in targeted provinces etc...)

Main Responsibilities:

<b>CARE Responsibilities</b>	<b>Consultant Responsibilities</b> <i>(see Section 6 below for more information)</i>
Share evaluator all key documentation including (backing documentation, proposals, emails, reports, etc.), with the consultant	Review all key documentation for the project (backing documentation, proposals, emails, reports, etc.).
Recruitment and Training of local enumerators/surveyors.	Submit midterm Evaluation Plan (methodology, detailed work plan, and risk management plan) to CARE for review and approval.
Translate data collection tools into local languages and share with local enumerators/surveyors for conducting Field work, Interviews, FGDs, etc.	Share draft data collection tools with CARE for review, approval and translation into local languages
Data and information analysis, entry in designed excel formats and share the final entry sheets with Consultant.	Prepare and design excel sheet for data entry and share with CARE for review, data entry and further process
Check and follow up overall process including (field work, data entry and contact with external evaluator etc.)	Presentation of initial findings to CARE for validation purposes
Provide administrative and logistic support to local enumerators/surveyors in data collection process.	Submission of Draft Evaluation Report
Review the draft and final evaluation reports and share feedbacks/comments with evaluator for consideration.	Submission of Final Evaluation Report
Ensure that, the evaluation has been conducted according the designed ToR and donor expectation has been well considered in the evaluation.	Presentation of findings and recommendations to CARE

## 6. Responsibilities and reporting arrangements

The consultant is expected to determine the methodology and tools for data gathering, develop a plan for conducting the midterm evaluation, provide training for local enumerators, analyse data and incorporate findings into a report.

The consultant will work in close collaboration with the staff from CARE Afghanistan designated and/or newly hired (local enumerators specific) to work on the midterm evaluation. CARE Afghanistan Education Program will be the primary contact and will supervise the consultant. The consultant will also be expected to interact with Program Quality (PQ) Unit and share knowledge and findings with the designated staff of above mentioned team.

The overall role and responsibilities of the consultant:

- Draft an Evaluation Plan (in English) to be shared with CARE for 1 round of comments, including:
  - a. the timeline
  - b. support required from CARE
  - c. summary of the terms of reference and proposed approach (including ethical considerations)

- d. detailed methodology
- e. suggested outline for the report
- f. Risk Management Plan<sup>39</sup>
- Draft and final data collection field tools to be shared with CARE for 1 round of comments. CARE must be provided with a final template of any interview guides, or other materials used during data collection. Questions within surveys should be assigned numbers and these should be consistent with any labelling within final datasets
- Review relevant secondary data to be included in midterm evaluation (desk review)
- Facilitate training for evaluation team (CARE Staff) and local enumerators to familiarize them with evaluation process, data collection tools and interview techniques
- Coordinate and oversee field based data collection and management (including data cleaning);
- Develop staff knowledge and understanding of action research protocols, management and analysis of data
- Overall supervision and management midterm evaluation including possibility facilitating of FGDs, data analysis and data cleaning if the consultant is not based remotely
- A workshop with CARE to review and inform the preliminary analysis
- An evaluation report (in English language) of no more than 30 pages, not including annexes (draft and final). Evaluation report should include 2-3 qualitative stories with photos that can be used for CARE/DFAT public affairs products.
- A 4-6 page summary of the report's key learnings and recommendations (Executive Summary) which is written in simple language (in English language) that can be shared widely to inform and influence policy makers, networks and community members
- Presentation by consultant to CARE key findings and recommendations.

## 7. Ethical protocols

The evaluation approach (as articulated in the Evaluation Plan) must consider the safety of participants and especially children at all stages of the evaluation. The evaluation team will need to demonstrate how they have considered the protection of children through the different evaluation stages, including recruitment and training of evaluation staff, data collection and data analysis and report writing. The consultant will be expected to sign a child protection code of conduct.

The consultant is required to set out the approach to ensure complete compliance with international good practice with regards to research and evaluation ethics and protocols particularly with regards to safeguarding children, vulnerable groups (including people with disabilities) and those in fragile and conflict affected states.

Consideration should be given to:

---

<sup>39</sup> It is important that the successful consultant has taken all reasonable measures to mitigate any potential risk to the delivery of the required outputs for this evaluation. Therefore, consultant should submit a comprehensive risk management plan covering:

- The assumptions underpinning the successful completion of the proposals submitted and the anticipated challenges that might be faced;
- Estimates of the level of risk for each risk identified;
- Proposed contingency plans that the consultant will put in place to mitigate against any occurrence of each of the identified risk;
- Specific child protection risks and mitigating strategies, including reference to the child protection policy and procedures that will be in place; and
- Health and safety issues (including sexual harassment, abuse and exploitation) that may require significant duty of care precautions.

- Administrative, technical and physical safeguards to protect the confidentiality of those participating in evaluation
- Physical safeguards for those conducting evaluation
- Data protection and secure maintenance procedures for personal information
- Do No Harm approaches in fragile and conflict affected states
- Parental consent concerning data collection from children or collation of data about children
- Age- and ability-appropriate assent processes based on reasonable assumptions about comprehension for the ages of children and the disabilities they intend to involve in the assessments/evaluations, and
- Age-appropriate participation of children, including in the development of data collection tools.

## **8. Existing Information Sources**

The consultant should refer to the following EEA project documentation that includes:

- EEA-3 Project design documents
- EEA-3 MEL data and tools
- Impact assessment report
- EEA-2 Mid-Term Evaluation Report
- Relevant secondary data as provided by CARE International in Afghanistan

The Consultant should also refer to relevant country data and information that is currently available, as required, to prepare the midterm evaluation report.

## **9. Team composition and selection criteria**

### *Qualifications skills and experience*

#### *Education:*

- Master's Degree in Social Science or a relevant field with a good knowledge of the country and context; experience in education field (preferred)
- Strong knowledge of development issues, especially in the fragile and conflict affected states.
- Knowledge of adolescent girls' leadership approach
- Knowledge of girls and women issues in rural marginalized communities of fragile and conflict affected states
- Excellent report writing skills and effective communication skills in English
- Good interpersonal skills
- Sound knowledge and understanding of design methodologies, community empowerment, gender, participatory research and workshop facilitation

#### *Experience:*

- Experience in conducting evaluation with children, the education sector, disability and gender to ensure that the evaluation design and methods are as relevant and meaningful as possible given the aims and objectives of the project and the context in which it is being delivered;
- Experience in working with international organisations or NGOs, including abiding by their child protection, and prevention of sexual harassment, exploitation and abuse policies.
- Experience in quantitative and qualitative data collection;
- Experience in gender-sensitive and participatory evaluation approaches;
- Experience in training, coaching or capacity building of staff;

*Language:*

- Fluency in spoken and written English.

## **10. Contact and further information**

*Application Procedure and Submission Guideline*

Interested candidates are requested to send the following documents to: CARE Afghanistan Procurement Department Head via [afg.procurement@care.org](mailto:afg.procurement@care.org) or [GhulamMohammad.Khoshal@care.org](mailto:GhulamMohammad.Khoshal@care.org) no later than May 20, 2019 till 4:00pm.

- A letter of intent
- Current Curriculum Vitae
- List of previous relevant experience
- A proposed midterm evaluation methodology, and tentative work plan covering five objectives of the project
- A budget enumerating proposed cost for the evaluation
- Please include any questions or clarifications in the letter of intent.

## ANNEX 3 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS

### A. PCBE STUDENT SURVEY

#### 1.0 INTRODUCTION AND CONSENT

##### Introduction Script

Greetings, my name is \_\_\_\_\_ I am working with CARE Afghanistan, CARE Afghanistan is a non-political, non-religious, non-profit and non-governmental organization.

We would like to learn about your classroom/school and your experience as part of this project. We use a survey paper (show your paper survey) to write down the answer you provide.

It will take about 45 minutes for us to complete together.

Your participation in this study is voluntary meaning that you can stop us anytime or ask us to skip any question you prefer not to respond to. Your responses will be kept confidential. We will not share your responses with your family, friends, or teachers.

**Do you have any questions for me about the interview? Do you agree to participate in the interview?**

**If YES, tick the box below that informed consent has been obtained AND ask them to sign or add fingerprint.**

**If NO, thank them for their time and notify your Field Team Leader immediately so they can suggest another student to interview.**

☐ Informed consent received.

Signature of interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_

Signature of interviewee: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_

##### Survey instructions script

Now I will explain how we will work together to complete this survey. I am going to read you a number of statements and after each one I will ask you choose the response that best matches your learning experiences.

I will read each statement out loud. After the statement I will read four possible responses. You will have time to think about what I have read and choose your response.

Remember: Please respond to the statements as you personally feel, not how your friends or others may respond. If you are unsure or feel confused, please just ask and I will help you understand the statement.

Shall we try an example together?

I will start by reading one practice statement and the response.

For this question, the four possible responses are: “rarely,” “sometimes,” “most of the time,” and “almost always.” *(You can use standardized gestures, agreed upon during training, to help demonstrate the meaning of each response, if appropriate.)*

If you have any questions after I finish reading the practice statement, please ask me.

Practice statement: *“Families in my community send their school-age daughters to school”*

Responses: rarely, sometimes, most of the time, almost always. *(Read practice statement and the responses again. If using gestures, repeat them again here.)*

Now please tell me your response to the practice statement.

**This is how I will read the statements and responses for the entire survey. Are there any questions?**

**Ok now we will begin!**

**BEFORE YOU START PLEASE DOUBLE-CHECK:**

- You have gained informed consent from the respondent.
- Only the data collector should be in the room with those taking the survey (e.g., the teacher, parent, or other community members or children should not be in the room or outside the room within hearing distance while the data collector is administering the survey).
- You have sought to interview the individual in private or where other students, teachers or family members cannot overhear or contribute answers.

## 2.0 DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES

DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES					
DATE: ____/____/____			PROVINCE:		
ENUMERATOR NAME:			DISTRICT:		
			VILLAGE:		
FORM ID					
QUESTION			RESPONSE OPTIONS		
1.	Sex of respondent		Female	Male	
2.	Are you currently enrolled in school?		Yes	No	
	If the answer is Yes go to Q3.				
	If the answer is No go to Q4.				
3.	If you are enrolled in school, in what class (grade) are you currently enrolled?		G4	G5	G6
4.	If you are not enrolled in school, what was the last year (grade) of school you completed?		G4	G5	G6
5.	Who attended/s your class?		Both boys and girls	Boys only	Girls only
6.	What is the highest level of schooling your father has completed?		No schooling	Finished primary	Vocational or Technical
					Finished secondary or college
			Don't know		
7.	What is the highest level of schooling your mother has completed?		No schooling	Finished primary	Vocational or Technical
					Finished secondary or college
			Don't know		
The next questions ask about difficulties you may have doing certain activities because of a HEALTH PROBLEM					
8.	Do you have difficulty seeing, even if wearing glasses?		No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
					Cannot do at all
9.	Do you have difficulty hearing, even if using a hearing aid?		No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
					Cannot do at all
10.	Do you have difficulty walking or climbing steps?		No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
					Cannot do at all

11.	Do you have difficulty remembering or concentrating?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all
12.	Do you have difficulty (with self-care such as) washing all over or dressing?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all
13.	Using your usual (customary) language, do you have difficulty communicating, for example understanding or being understood?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all

### 3.0 CIF DOMAIN: EQUALITY

CIF - EQUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = TEACHERS' GENDER SENSITIVITY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
14.	When boys tease girls, teachers at my school help resolve the conflict.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
15.	When girls tease boys, teachers at my school help resolve the conflict.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
16.	Who does your teacher ask questions of?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
17.	Who does your teacher encourage to participate in classroom activities?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
18.	Who does your teacher assign classroom chores to?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
19.	Who does your teacher allow to use the toilet during class?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
20.	When they do good work, who does your teacher reward or praise?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
21.	Who does your teacher allow to ask questions during class?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
22.	Who does your teacher verbally discipline?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
23.	Who does your teacher physically discipline?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls

**CIF- EQUALITY**
**CIF INDICATOR = CHILDREN'S PERCEPTION OF EDUCATIONAL EQUITY AND EQUALITY**

QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
24.	When my teacher calls on girls to answer questions they seem confident.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
25.	When my teacher calls on boys to answer questions they seem confident.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
26.	In my community both boys and girls can go to school.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
27.	Girls learn as much at school as boys do.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
28.	If you work in small groups at school, who are usually the leaders?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
29.	Who is intelligent?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
30.	Who is able to solve problems?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
31.	Who is good at school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
32.	Who is able to ask the teacher for help?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
33.	Who gains self-confidence from attending School?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
34.	Who become good problem solvers from attending school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
35.	Who gains knowledge from attending school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
36.	Who have a better chance of getting well-respected jobs after completing school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
37.	In my community boys and girls have an equal opportunity to attend school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly

CIF- EQUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = CHILDREN'S PERCEPTION OF EDUCATIONAL EQUITY AND EQUALITY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
38.	In my community it is normal for girls to complete primary school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
39.	In my community it is normal for boys to complete primary school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly

## 4.0 CIF DOMAIN: QUALITY

CIF - QUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = SUITABLE EDUCATIONAL ENVIRONMENT					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
40.	I am allowed to leave the classroom if I need to (for example, to go to the bathroom).	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
41.	I feel safe traveling to and from school.	I do not feel safe.	I feel somewhat safe.	I feel quite safe.	I feel very safe
42.	I feel safe at school.	I do not feel safe.	I feel somewhat safe.	I feel quite safe.	I feel very safe
43.	There is enough space in my classroom for all students.	There is not enough space.	There is enough space	There is lots of space	
44.	There are enough books in my classroom for all students.	There are no books.	There are not enough books.	There are enough books.	There are more than enough books.
45.	My school has separate toilets/latrines for girls and boys.	No	Yes		
46.	The girls' toilets/latrines in my school are open during the school day.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are locked	They are sometimes open	They are always open
47.	The boys' toilets/latrines in my school are open during the school day.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are locked	They are sometimes open	They are always open
48.	The girls' toilets/latrines in my school are clean.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are dirty	They are sometimes clean	They are always clean

49.	The boys' toilets/latrines in my school are clean.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are dirty	They are sometimes clean	They are always clean

#### CIF - QUALITY

##### CIF INDICATOR = RELEVANT EDUCATIONAL CONTENT

QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
50.	My teacher tells positive stories about girls	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
51.	My teacher tells positive stories about boys.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
52.	What I learn in school helps me in my daily life.	What I learn does not help me	What I learn helps me somewhat	What I learn helps me quite a bit	What I learn helps me very much

#### CIF - QUALITY

##### CIF INDICATOR = GIRL/CHILD-CENTRED PROCESSES

QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
53.	My parents or caregivers ask me about my schoolwork.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
54.	We work in small groups or pairs during class.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
55.	Girls act as leaders in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
56.	Boys act as leaders in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
57.	Girl's performance is praised in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
58.	Boys' performance is praised in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
59.	My teachers allow me to ask questions at school.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
60.	When I am absent from school, my teacher asks me why I was away.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

## 5.0 CIF DOMAIN: EMPOWERMENT

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = SUPPORTIVE STRATEGIC RELATIONS					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
61	Someone in my family helps me with my schoolwork.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
62	Someone helps me at home with my chores when I need to study for an exam.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
63	My parents or family members consider my opinions when they make decisions about my schooling.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
64	The teachers at my school encourage me.	Teachers do not encourage me	Teachers encourage me some of the time	Teachers encourage me most of the time	Teachers encourage me all of the time
65	Parents listen to boys and girls equally.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
66	Teachers at my school pay attention to the needs of girls.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
67	There are people in my family who help me if I have a problem.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
68	In my community adults listen to girls and boys equally.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
69	When making decisions about the local school, community leaders consider the needs of girls.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
70	In my community adults make decisions that help girls become leaders.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
71	In my community adults make decisions that help boys become leaders.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = GIRLS' AGENCY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
72	I feel confident when my teacher calls on me to answer a question.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
73	I like to share my ideas in small groups.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

74.	I will be able to decide how many years I go to school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
75.	151. In my community it is normal for girls to influence the decision of when they will marry.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
76.	What skills do you have that help you work with other people? Please answer in your own words.	This is an open-ended question			

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = STRUCTURAL ENVIRONMENT FOR GIRLS					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
77.	In your community, who are sports programs available for? .	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
78.	In my community it is normal for girls to play outside the home.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
79.	In my community it is normal for boys and girls to play together.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
80.	Both boys and girls in my family get care in a health clinic when they are sick.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
81.	In my community it is normal for girls to play sports	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
82.	I have opportunities to participate in organized sports or clubs.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
83.	I have access to transportation to get where I need to go.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
84.	I have access to a doctor or nurse when I am sick.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

## B. LCBE STUDENT SURVEY

### 1.0 INTRODUCTION AND CONSENT

#### Introduction Script

Greetings, my name is \_\_\_\_\_. I am working with CARE Afghanistan, CARE Afghanistan is a non-political, non-religious, non-profit and non-governmental organization.

We would like to learn about your classroom/school and your experience as part of this project. We use a survey paper (show your paper survey) to write down the answer you provide.

It will take about 45 minutes for us to complete together.

Your participation in this study is voluntary meaning that you can stop us anytime or ask us to skip any question you prefer not to respond to. Your responses will be kept confidential. We will not share your responses with your family, friends, or teachers.

**Do you have any questions for me about the interview? Do you agree to participate in the interview?**

**If YES, tick the box below that informed consent has been obtained AND ask them to sign or add fingerprint.**

**If NO, thank them for their time and notify your Field Team Leader immediately so they can suggest another student to interview.**

☐ Informed consent received.

Signature of interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_

Signature of interviewee: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_

#### Survey instructions script

Now I will explain how we will work together to complete this survey. I am going to read you a number of statements and after each one I will ask you choose the response that best matches your learning experiences.

I will read each statement out loud. After the statement I will read four possible responses. You will have time to think about what I have read and choose your response.

Remember: Please respond to the statements as you personally feel, not how your friends or others may respond. If you are unsure or feel confused, please just ask and I will help you understand the statement.

Shall we try an example together?

I will start by reading one practice statement and the response.

For this question, the four possible responses are: "rarely," "sometimes," "most of the time," and "almost always." *(You can use standardized gestures, agreed upon during training, to help demonstrate the meaning of each response, if appropriate.)*

If you have any questions after I finish reading the practice statement, please ask me.

Practice statement: *"Families in my community send their school-age daughters to school"*

Responses: rarely, sometimes, most of the time, almost always. *(Read practice statement and the responses again. If using gestures, repeat them again here.)*

Now please tell me your response to the practice statement.

**This is how I will read the statements and responses for the entire survey. Are there any questions?**

**Ok now we will begin!**

**BEFORE YOU START PLEASE DOUBLE-CHECK:**

- You have gained informed consent from the respondent.
- Only the data collector should be in the room with those taking the survey (e.g., the teacher, parent, or other community members or children should not be in the room or outside the room within hearing distance while the data collector is administering the survey).
- You have sought to interview the individual in private or where other students, teachers or family members cannot overhear or contribute answers.

## 2.0 DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES

DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES				
DATE: ____/____/____		PROVINCE:		
ENUMERATOR NAME:		DISTRICT:		
		VILLAGE:		
FORM ID				
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS		
85.	Sex of respondent	Female	Male	
86.	Are you currently enrolled in school?	Yes	No	
	If the answer is Yes go to Q3.			
	If the answer is No go to Q4.			
87.	If you are enrolled in school, in what class (grade) are you currently enrolled?	G7	G8	G9
88.	If you are not enrolled in school, what was the last year (grade) of school you completed?	G7	G8	G9
89.	Who attended/s your class?	Both boys and girls	Boys only	Girls only
90.	What is the highest level of schooling your father has completed?	No schooling	Finished primary	Vocational or Technical
				Finished secondary or college
		Don't know		
91.	What is the highest level of schooling your mother has completed?	No schooling	Finished primary	Vocational or Technical
				Finished secondary or college
		Don't know		
The next questions ask about difficulties you may have doing certain activities because of a HEALTH PROBLEM				
92.	Do you have difficulty seeing, even if wearing glasses?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
				Cannot do at all
93.	Do you have difficulty hearing, even if using a hearing aid?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
				Cannot do at all
94.	Do you have difficulty walking or climbing steps?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty
				Cannot do at all

95.	Do you have difficulty remembering or concentrating?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all
96.	Do you have difficulty (with self-care such as) washing all over or dressing?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all
97.	Using your usual (customary) language, do you have difficulty communicating, for example understanding or being understood?	No difficulty	Some difficulty	A lot of difficulty	Cannot do at all

### 3.0 CIF DOMAIN: EQUALITY

CIF- EQUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = CHILDREN'S PERCEPTION OF EDUCATIONAL EQUITY AND EQUALITY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
24	When my teacher calls on girls to answer questions they seem confident.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
25	When my teacher calls on boys to answer questions they seem confident.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
26	In my community both boys and girls can go to school.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
27	Girls learn as much at school as boys do.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
28	If you work in small groups at school, who are usually the leaders?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
29	Who is intelligent?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
30	Who is able to solve problems?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
31	Who is good at school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
33	Who gains self-confidence from attending School?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
34	Who become good problem solvers from attending school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
35	Who gains knowledge from attending school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
36	Who have a better chance of getting well-respected jobs after completing school?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
37	In my community boys and girls have an equal opportunity to attend school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
38	In my community it is normal for girls to complete primary school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly

CIF- EQUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = CHILDREN'S PERCEPTION OF EDUCATIONAL EQUITY AND EQUALITY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
39	In my community it is normal for boys to complete primary school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly

## 4.0 CIF DOMAIN: QUALITY

CIF - QUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = SUITABLE EDUCATIONAL ENVIRONMENT					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
40	I am allowed to leave the classroom if I need to (for example, to go to the bathroom).	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
41	I feel safe traveling to and from school.	I do not feel safe.	I feel somewhat safe.	I feel quite safe.	I feel very safe
42	I feel safe at school.	I do not feel safe.	I feel somewhat safe.	I feel quite safe.	I feel very safe
43	There is enough space in my classroom for all students.	There is not enough space.	There is enough space	There is lots of space	
44	There are enough books in my classroom for all students.	There are no books.	There are not enough books.	There are enough books.	There are more than enough books.
46	The girls' toilets/latrines in my school are open during the school day.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are locked	They are sometimes open	They are always open
48	The girls' toilets/latrines in my school are clean.	There are no toilets or latrines	They are dirty	They are sometimes clean	They are always clean

CIF - QUALITY					
CIF INDICATOR = RELEVANT EDUCATIONAL CONTENT					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
50	My teacher tells positive stories about girls	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

51.	My teacher tells positive stories about boys.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
52.	What I learn in school helps me in my daily life.	What I learn does not help me	What I learn helps me somewhat	What I learn helps me quite a bit	What I learn helps me very much

#### CIF - QUALITY

#### CIF INDICATOR = GIRL/CHILD-CENTRED PROCESSES

QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
53.	My parents or caregivers ask me about my schoolwork.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
54.	We work in small groups or pairs during class.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
55.	Girls act as leaders in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
57.	Girl's performance is praised in class	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
59.	My teachers allow me to ask questions at school.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
60.	When I am absent from school, my teacher asks me why I was away.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

## 5.0 CIF DOMAIN: EMPOWERMENT

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = SUPPORTIVE STRATEGIC RELATIONS					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
61	Someone in my family helps me with my schoolwork.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
62	Someone helps me at home with my chores when I need to study for an exam.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
63	My parents or family members consider my opinions when they make decisions about my schooling.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
64	The teachers at my school encourage me.	Teachers do not encourage me	Teachers encourage me some of the time	Teachers encourage me most of the time	Teachers encourage me all of the time
65	Parents listen to boys and girls equally.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
66	Teachers at my school pay attention to the needs of girls.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
67	There are people in my family who help me if I have a problem.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
68	In my community adults listen to girls and boys equally.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
69	When making decisions about the local school, community leaders consider the needs of girls.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
70	In my community adults make decisions that help girls become leaders.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
71	In my community adults make decisions that help boys become leaders.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = GIRLS' AGENCY					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
72	I feel confident when my teacher calls on me to answer a question.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
73	I like to share my ideas in small groups.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

74.	I will be able to decide how many years I go to school.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
75.	151. In my community it is normal for girls to influence the decision of when they will marry.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
76.	What skills do you have that help you work with other people? Please answer in your own words.	This is an open-ended question			

CIF – EMPOWERMENT					
CIF INDICATOR = STRUCTURAL ENVIRONMENT FOR GIRLS					
QUESTION		RESPONSE OPTIONS			
77.	In your community, who are sports programs available for?	Boys and Girls Equally	Girls more than Boys	Boys more than Girls	Neither Boys nor Girls
78.	In my community it is normal for girls to play outside the home.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
79.	In my community it is normal for boys and girls to play together.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
80.	Both boys and girls in my family get care in a health clinic when they are sick.	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
81.	In my community it is normal for girls to play sports	Disagree Strongly	Disagree somewhat	Agree somewhat	Agree strongly
82.	I have opportunities to participate in organized sports or clubs.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
83.	I have access to transportation to get where I need to go.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always
84.	I have access to a doctor or nurse when I am sick.	Rarely	Sometimes	Most of the time	Almost Always

## C. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: TEACHERS

<b>Introduction:</b>		Info sheet, consent form and outline of process			
<b>Province/District/Village:</b>					
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>					
<b>Date:</b>					
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>		YES		NO	
<b>Facilitator Signature: _____</b>					
<b>Type of Respondent:</b>		CBE Primary Teacher		CBE Lower Secondary Teacher	
<b>Sex of Teacher:</b>		Female		Male	
<b>Type of CBE class:</b>		Primary current	Primary graduated	Lower secondary current	Lower secondary graduated
<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>			
<b>ATTAINMENT</b>					
<b>Warm-up/background</b>	<b>1. Can you tell me about yourself?</b> <i>Prompt: what is your level of education, how long have you been teaching this CBE class? Are you from this village? How were you recruited to teach?</i>				
<b>Completion/persistence /retention</b>	<b>2. Do all your students attend class regularly?</b> <i>Prompt: If you are interviewing a PCBE teacher, is it the same for both boys and girls?</i>				
	<b>3. If there are students who do not attend regularly, why is that the case?</b> <i>Prompt: If PCBE teacher: Are there different reasons for boys and girls?</i>				
	<b>4. Have there been any students who have dropped out since you started teaching here?</b> <i>Prompt: If yes, for what reasons did students drop out? Are there different reasons for girls compared to boys?</i>				
	<b>5. How would you describe the performance of girls in your class compared to boys?</b> <i>Prompt:</i>				

	Can you me an example in terms of their ability to learn new concepts or skills such as in numeracy/literacy? Can you give me an example of their willingness to participate in class? Any difference between boys and girls?	
<b>EQUALITY</b>		
<b>Communities educational support</b>	<b>6. Do you meet with the parents of your students often? Do you feel that parents are supportive of the CBE school? Prompt: Can you give me an example of how they are/are not supportive?</b>	
	<b>7. How would you describe the attitudes of men and women in the community towards girl's education? Can you give me some examples? Prompt: are they supportive? Do they believe it is important for girls to have the skills to read and write? Why? Do they believe girls have the same right to attend school as boys?</b>	
	<b>8. Is it common practice for families to send school-age girls to school in your community? Prompt: Is it the same for primary as well as secondary school? What are the reasons girls would not continue going on to secondary school?</b>	
	<b>9. Do you think attitudes in the community towards girls education have changed over the last five years? Prompt: in what way have they changed? Are people more or less supportive of girls education? Why has it changed? Can you give me an example?</b>	
	<b>10. At what age do girls in your community get married? Has this changed over the last 5 years?</b>	

	<b>Why?</b> <i>Prompt: is there a difference between girls who go to school and those who do not? What is the relationship between going to school and marriage? Do girls have to choose or can they go to school even when they are married?</i>	
Teachers gender sensitivity	<b>11. Do you feel that you have the knowledge and skills to teach your classes in an inclusive way that engages both boys and girls?</b> <i>Prompt: Can you give me an example of how you have adapted materials or classes to ensure girls can participate equally?</i>	
	<b>12. Do you have any students with a disability in your class?</b> <i>Prompt: If yes, do you feel that they face additional challenges in accessing schools and classes like yours? Can you give me an example of the additional challenges? Can you give me an example of how you have adapted materials or classes to ensure they can participate equally?</i>	
QUALITY		
Relevant educational content	<b>13. Have you received subject-specific training through CARE?</b> <i>Prompt: What did you find most useful about the training? How has the training improved your practice as a teacher?</i>	
	<b>14. Do you have any students in your class who find learning numeracy/literacy more of a challenge than the others?</b> <i>Prompt: How do identify those students How do you support them to improve?</i>	

	<i>Can you give me an example of how you have supported a student?</i>	
	<b>15. Do you have adequate resources and materials to support your teaching?</b> <i>Prompt: do you find the training manuals and textbooks useful? Can you give me an example of how you have used them?</i>	
	<b>16. Does your school have a library?</b> <i>Prompt: If yes, do your students use the library regularly? What types of materials are used most often? Does the library support learning outside the classroom? Can you give me an example?</i>	
<b>Suitable educational environment</b>	<b>17. Does your school have safe learning environment?</b> <i>Prompt: are there girls and boys sanitation facilities available? Are they separate or are arrangements made to ensure they can use them separately? Is your classroom equipped for teaching – clean, dry, adequate lighting and ventilation/heating etc?</i>	
<b>EMPOWERMENT</b>		
<b>Supportive strategic relations</b>	<b>18. What kind of VEC supports your CBE School?</b> <i>Prompt: female VEC? Two separate VECs (male/female)? None?</i>	
	<b>19. In what way does the VEC support your CBE? What activities/tasks has the VEC conducted in the past three months?</b>	
	<b>20. How often do you discuss school issues with the village education committee?</b> <i>Prompt: Do you feel that the committee effectively represents the interests of the CBE school in the community? Can you give me an example?</i>	

	<p><b>21. Does your school have female teachers?</b> <i>Prompt: If yes, do you think this encourages the participation of girls in school? Do you think female teachers contribute to shifting community attitudes towards valuing girls education?</i></p>	
Girl's Agency	<p><b>22. Are there any women in your community or within the schooling system, who you consider to be a good leader that others respect and listen to?</b> <i>If yes, Prompt: can you tell me about her? What characteristics/skills does she have?</i></p>	
	<p><b>23. Do you think having women like this in the community can provide positive role-models for young girls? Can you give me an example?</b></p>	
	<p><b>24. Do you think that girls learn these skills being part of CBE classes? Can you give me an example of any students who have demonstrated leadership skills? How did they demonstrate leadership skills?</b></p>	
	<p><b>25. FOR FEMALE TEACHERS ONLY: how has the opportunity to teach at this school made a difference in your own life?</b> <i>Prompt: Has it provided employment opportunities that are socially/culturally appropriate? Improved your income? What have you been able to do as a result of your increased income that would have been difficult before?</i></p>	
Conclusion	<p><b>Thank you for your time....</b></p>	

	<b>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</b>	
--	---	--

## D. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: PARENTS

<b>Introduction:</b>		Info sheet, consent form and outline of process		
<b>Province/District/Village:</b>				
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>				
<b>Date:</b>				
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>		YES		NO
<b>Facilitator Signature: _____</b>				
<b>Type of Respondent:</b>		Parent of primary	Parents of Lower-Secondary	Parents of both primary and lower-secondary
<b>Sex of Respondent:</b>		Female		Male
<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>		
<b>ATTAINMENT</b>				
<b>Warm-up/background</b>	<b>1. How many of your children are going to school at the moment (girls versus boys)?</b> <i>Please provide numbers. To which schools are they going (MoE school, CBE school, madrassa)? Which schools are generally available in your area for primary and secondary education (girls versus boys)?</i>			
<b>Completion/persistence /retention</b>	<b>2. Do your children attend class regularly?</b> <i>Prompt: are there any challenges to your children attending school? Any differences in attendance between your daughters and your sons?</i>			
	<b>3. Have any of your children dropped out of school?</b> <i>Prompt: if yes, why did this happen? What could have prevented them from dropping out?</i>			
<b>EQUALITY</b>				

Communities educational support	4. Do you remember when the CBE school was started in your community? What was your initial reaction to it? Were you happy or concerned? <i>Prompt: What did you think about sending girls to school as well as boys? Why were you happy/concerned?</i>	
	5. What do you think now that the school has been open for a while? Have your opinions changed?	
	6. How would you describe the role of the CBE school for the community? What has changed in the community since the school was opened?	
	7. How would you describe the attitudes of men and women in the community towards girl's education? Can you give me some examples? <i>Prompt: are they supportive? Do they believe it is important for girl's to have the skills to read and write? Why? Do they believe girls have the same right to attend school as boys? Are there people in the community less supportive? Why do they think differently?</i>	
	8. Is it common practice for families to send school-age girls to school in your community? <i>Prompt: Is it the same for primary as well as secondary school? What are the reasons girls would not continue going on to secondary school?</i>	
	9. What about community/religious leaders in the community? Do they support the CBE school?	

	<i>Prompt: Are they also supportive of secondary school for girls? Why/why not? Can you give me an example?</i>	
	<b>10. Do you think attitudes in the community towards girls education have changed over the last five years?</b> <i>Prompt: in what way have they changed? Are people more or less supportive of girls education? Why has it changed? Can you give me an example?</i>	
	<b>11. At what age do girls in your community get married? Has this changed over the last 5 years? Why?</b> <i>Prompt: is there a difference between girls who go to school and those who do not? What is the relationship between going to school and marriage? Do girls have to choose or can they go to school even when they are married?</i>	
	<b>12. What kind of contact do you have with the teacher?</b> <i>Prompt: How often do you discuss school issues with him or her? What kind of issues are discussed?</i>	
<b>QUALITY</b>		
<b>Relevant educational content</b>	<b>13. Looking at your CBE school in detail, what do you think about the quality of the teaching?</b> <i>Prompt: Do you think the teacher is qualified? Motivated? Are there both female and male teachers at the school?</i>	

	<b>14. Do classes take place regularly?</b> <i>Prompt: If not, why not? Does the teacher follow up with you if your children do not attend?</i>	
	<b>15. What do you think about the materials your children use for school?</b> <i>Prompt: for example, do you see your children using their textbooks regularly? what you think about the library available at the school? Is it useful? Do your children use it? Have you used it? Can you share an example with me?</i>	
<b>Suitable educational environment</b>	<b>16. Do you feel your children are safe learning environment when they are at school?</b> <i>Prompt: do you feel the classroom is adequately built with enough space for students? Are you comfortable with the provision of sanitation facilities?</i>	
<b>EMPOWERMENT</b>		
<b>Supportive strategic relations</b>	<b>17. What kind of VEC supports your CBE School?</b> <i>Prompt: female VEC? Two separate VECs (male/female)? None?</i>	
	<b>18. In what way does the VEC support your CBE? What activities/tasks has the VEC conducted in the past three months?</b>	
	<b>19. How often do you discuss school issues with the village education committee?</b> <i>Prompt: Do you feel that the committee effectively represents the interests of the CBE school in the community? Can you give me an example?</i>	
<b>Girl's Agency</b>	<b>20. If you have daughters in school, what changes have you seen in them since they started school?</b> <i>Prompt: are they more confident? Do</i>	

	<i>they think about the future more often? Do they participate with family decision-making?</i>	
	<b>21. If you have daughters in school, what do they wish to do once they finish school?</b> <i>Prompt: have they done any para-professional training? Do they want to become a teacher, health worker? To continue with formal education?</i>	
	<b>22. If you have daughters in school, do they have female teachers? What do you think about the presence of female teachers in your community?</b> <i>Prompt: Does it make a difference to your daughters' participation in school? Does the female teacher act as a mentor for your daughters? Can you give me an example?</i>	
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>Thank you for your time....</b>  <b>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</b>	

## E. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: VEC MEMBERS

<b>Introduction:</b>		Info sheet, consent form and outline of process			
<b>Province/District/Village:</b>					
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>					
<b>Date:</b>					
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>		YES		NO	
<b>Facilitator Signature:</b> _____					
<b>Type of Respondent:</b>		All female VEC		Mixed VEC	
<b>Sex of Respondent:</b>		Female		Male	
<b>Type of CBE class being supported:</b>		Primary current	Primary graduated	Lower secondary current	Lower secondary graduated
<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>			
<b>ATTAINMENT</b>					
<b>Warm-up/background</b>	<b>1. Let me start with asking you to tell me a bit about your VEC? Prompt: How are you organized (how many members? what kind of members)? How were you selected as members of the VEC?</b>				
	<b>2. How often do you meet?</b>				
	<b>3. What are your main responsibilities?</b>				
<b>Completion/persistence /retention</b>	<b>4. How often do you monitor the CBE classes? How do you monitor them? Prompt: What do you usually do? What do you try and observe? Can you give me an example?</b>				
	<b>5. Do students attend school regularly? If there are students who do not attend regularly, why is that the case? Prompt: Are there different reasons for boys and girls?</b>				

	<p><b>6. Have there been any students who have dropped out since the CBE school started?</b>  <i>Prompt: If yes, for what reasons did students drop out? Are there different reasons for girls compared to boys?</i></p>	
	<p><b>7. How would you describe the performance of girls in the classes compared to boys?</b> <i>Prompt: Can you me an example in terms of their ability to learn new concepts or skills such as in numeracy/literacy? Can you give me an example of their willingness to participate in class? Any difference between boys and girls?</i></p>	
<b>EQUALITY</b>		
<b>Communities educational support</b>	<p><b>8. Do you meet with the parents of your students often? Do you feel that parents are supportive of the CBE school?</b> <i>Prompt: Can you give me an example of how they are/are not supportive? How do you try and convince people to send their children to school? What reasons do you give them for why they should? Can you give me an example?</i></p>	
	<p><b>9. How often do you discuss CBE school issues with parents or leaders in the community?</b> <i>Prompt: what type of issues do you discuss? Can you give me an example?</i></p>	
	<p><b>10. How would you describe the attitudes of men and women in the community towards girl's education? Can you give me some examples?</b>  <i>Prompt: are they supportive? Do they believe it is important for girls to have the skills to read and</i></p>	

	<i>write? Why? Do they believe girls have the same right to attend school as boys?</i>	
	<b>11. Is it common practice for families to send school-age girls to school in your community?</b> <i>Prompt: Is it the same for primary as well as secondary school? What are the reasons girls would not continue going on to secondary school?</i>	
	<b>12. Do you think attitudes in the community towards girls education have changed since the CBE school started?</b> <i>Prompt: in what way have they changed? Are people more or less supportive of girls education? Why has it changed? Can you give me an example?</i>	
	<b>13. At what age do girls in your community get married? Has this changed over the last 5 years? Why?</b> <i>Prompt: is there a difference between girls who go to school and those who do not? What is the relationship between going to school and marriage? Do girls have to choose or can they go to school even when they are married?</i>	
<b>EMPOWERMENT</b>		
<b>Supportive strategic relations</b>	<b>14. Can you tell about the last meeting your VEC had?</b> <i>Prompt: when was it? What type of issues did you discuss? What type of decisions did you make? Can you give me some examples?</i>	
	<b>15. In what way does the your VEC support the CBE? What activities/tasks has the VEC conducted in the past three months?</b>	
	<b>16. Do you think the VEC is valuable and contributes to the CBE school?</b> <i>Prompt: in what ways does it</i>	

	support the school? What have been the VECs achievements?	
	<b>17. What challenges does your VEC face?</b> <i>Prompt: Can you give me some examples? What could support you to overcome these challenges?</i>	
	<b>18. Does your school have female teachers?</b> <i>Prompt: If yes, do you think this encourages the participation of girls in school? Do you think female teachers contribute to shifting community attitudes towards valuing girls education?</i>	
Girl's Agency	<b>19. From you experience what do girl students wish to do when they finish school?</b> <i>Prompt: What are their plans? Do they share their thoughts with you?</i>	
	<b>20. Are there any women in your community or within the schooling system, who you consider to be a good leader that others respect and listen to?</b> <i>If yes, Prompt: can you tell me about her? What characteristics/skills does she have?</i>	
	<b>21. Do you think having women like this in the community can provide positive role-models for young girls? Can you give me an example?</b>	
	<b>22. Do you think that girls learn these skills being part of CBE classes? Can you give me an example of any students who have demonstrated leadership skills? How did they demonstrate leadership skills?</b>	

<b>Conclusion</b>	<p><b>Thank you for your time....</b></p> <p><b>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</b></p>	
-------------------	--	--

## F. SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: COMMUNITY LEADERS/RELIGIOUS LEADERS

<b>Introduction:</b>		Info sheet, consent form and outline of process	
<b>Province/District/Village:</b>			
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>			
<b>Date:</b>			
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>		YES	NO
<b>Facilitator Signature:</b> _____			
<b>Type of Respondent:</b>		Community leader	Religious Leader
<b>Sex of Respondent:</b>		Female	Male
<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>	
<b>ATTAINMENT</b>			
<b>Warm-up/background</b>	1. Do students attend school regularly? If there are students who do not attend regularly, why is that the case? <i>Are there different reasons for boys and girls?</i>		
<b>Completion/persistence /retention</b>	2. Have there been any students who have dropped out since the CBE school started? <i>Prompt: If yes, for what reasons did students drop out? Are there different reasons for girls compared to boys?</i>		
<b>EQUALITY</b>			
<b>Communities educational support</b>	3. Do you remember when the CBE school was started in your community? What was your initial reaction to it? Were you happy or concerned? <i>Prompt: What did you think about sending girls to school as well as boys? Why were you happy/concerned?</i>		
	4. What do you think now that the school has been open for a while? Have your opinions changed?		

	<p><b>5. How would you describe the role of the CBE school for the community? What has changed in the community since the school was opened?</b></p>	
	<p><b>6. How would you describe the attitudes of men and women in the community towards girl's education? Can you give me some examples?</b>  <i>Prompt: are they supportive? Do they believe it is important for girl's to have the skills to read and write? Why? Do they believe girls have the same right to attend school as boys? Are there people in the community less supportive? Why do they think differently?</i></p>	
	<p><b>7. Is it common practice for families to send school-age girls to school in your community?</b> <i>Prompt: Is it the same for primary as well as secondary school? What are the reasons girls would not continue going on to secondary school? How do you convince parents to send their girls to school?</i></p>	
	<p><b>8. Do you think attitudes in the community towards girls education have changed over the last five years?</b> <i>Prompt: in what way have they changed? Are people more or less supportive of girls education? Why has it changed? Can you give me an example?</i></p>	
	<p><b>9. At what age do girls in your community get married? Has this changed over the last 5 years? Why?</b> <i>Prompt: is there a difference between girls who go to school and those who do not? What is</i></p>	

	<i>the relationship between going to school and marriage? Do girls have to choose or can they go to school even when they are married?</i>	
	<b>10. What kind of contact do you have with the school?</b> <i>Prompt: How often do you discuss school issues with the teachers or principal? Do you feel there is good cooperation between you and the school? What kind of issues are discussed?</i>	
<b>QUALITY</b>		
<b>Relevant educational content</b>	<b>11. Looking at your CBE school in detail, what do you think about the quality of the teaching?</b> <i>Prompt: Do you think the teacher is qualified? Motivated? Are there both female and male teachers at the school?</i>	
	<b>12. Do classes take place regularly?</b> <i>Prompt: If not, why not?</i>	
	<b>13. What do you think about the materials and equipment available at the school?</b> <i>Prompt: For example, what you think about the library available at the school? Is it useful? Can you share an example with me?</i>	
<b>Suitable educational environment</b>	<b>14. Do you feel the children have a safe learning environment when they are at school?</b> <i>Prompt: do you feel the classroom is adequately built with enough space for students? Are you comfortable with the provision of sanitation facilities?</i>	
<b>EMPOWERMENT</b>		

Supportive strategic relations	15. What kind of support does the community provide to the CBE School?	
	16. What kind of VEC supports your CBE School? <i>Prompt: female VEC? Two separate VECs (male/female)? None?</i>	
	17. In what way does the VEC support your CBE? To your knowledge, what activities/tasks has the VEC conducted in the past three months?	
	18. How often do you discuss school issues with the village education committee? <i>Prompt: Do you feel that the committee effectively represents the interests of the CBE school in the community? Can you give me an example?</i>	
	19. Was there any case where you as a community leader became involved in an issue regarding the CBE School? <i>Prompt: if yes can you please share the example?</i>	
Conclusion	<p>Thank you for your time....</p> <p>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</p>	

## G: SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE: MINISTRY OF EDUCATION PROVINCIAL/DISTRICT

<b>Introduction:</b>		Info sheet, consent form and outline of process	
<b>Province/District:</b>			
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>			
<b>Date:</b>			
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>		YES	NO
<b>Facilitator Signature:</b> _____			
<b>Role of Respondent at the Ministry:</b>			
<b>Sex of Respondent:</b>		Female	Male
<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>	
<b>ATTAINMENT</b>			
<b>Warm-up/background</b>	1. Could you please tell me a bit about your role with the Ministry of Education and how you are involved with the CARE project?		
<b>EQUALITY</b>			
<b>Communities educational support</b>	2. How would you describe the role of the CBE schools for the community? What changes are happening in communities since these schools have been opened?		
	3. How would you describe the attitudes of men and women at the community-level towards girl's education? Can you give me some examples? <i>Prompt: are they supportive? Do they believe it is important for girl's to have the skills to read and write? Why? Do they believe girls have the same right to attend school as boys? Are there people in the community less supportive? Why do they think differently?</i>		

	<p><b>4. Is it common practice for families to send school-age girls to school?</b> <i>Prompt: Is it the same for primary as well as secondary school? What are the reasons girls would not continue going on to secondary school? How do you convince parents to send their girls to school?</i></p>	
	<p><b>5. Do you think attitudes in the community towards girls education have changed over the last five years?</b> <i>Prompt: in what way have they changed? Are people more or less supportive of girls education? Why has it changed? Can you give me an example?</i></p>	
<b>QUALITY</b>		
<b>Relevant educational content</b>	<p><b>6. What do you think about the quality of the teaching training that is being provided?</b> <i>Prompt: Do you think CBE teachers are well-qualified? Are they able achieve registration with the Ministry of Education? Do you think their performance has improved over time?</i></p>	
	<p><b>7. What do you think about the materials and equipment being made available to schools through the CARE program?</b> <i>Prompt: For example, what you think about the teacher instructional materials such as textbooks and manuals? And for the students – what do you think of the libraries available at the school? Sports and recreation materials? Computer labs?</i></p>	

	<p><b>8. What are your thoughts on the para-professional training being offered to 9<sup>th</sup> grade LSCBE students?</b> <i>Prompt: do you think such training provides young women a pathway to formal education? Do you think such training provides an opportunity for employment they might not otherwise have?</i></p>	
Suitable educational environment	<p><b>9. Do you feel the children have a safe learning environment when they are at school?</b> <i>Prompt: do you feel classrooms have been improved over time through refurbishment and are adequately built with enough space for students?</i></p>	
<b>EMPOWERMENT</b>		
Supportive strategic relations	<p><b>10. How do the CBE activities under the CARE program support or complement other initiatives or programs being implemented by the Ministry of Education?</b></p>	
	<p><b>11. How do you think the Ministry of Education benefits from working in partnership with CARE?</b> <i>Prompt: for example, do you think that including MoE staff and Hub school teachers in CBE teacher training is beneficial? How? Can you give me an example? For example, what are the benefits of the joint monitoring visits between CARE and MoE? Can you give me an example?</i></p>	
	<p><b>12. Does CARE actively share lessons learned and emerging best-practice on CBE with the Ministry of Education?</b> <i>Prompt: How does this happen?</i></p>	

	<i>Can you tell me about CARE's role in the MoE Working Group on CBE? Does this information contribute/influence to the development of policy and strategy within the ministry?</i>	
	<b>13. What do you think has been the most important or valuable contribution of the CARE program to promoting education, in particular girls education at the community-level? Why?</b>	
	<b>14. What challenges still remain in terms of proving education in remote areas? Resource challenges? Barriers related to community attitudes/views?</b>	
	<b>15. What would you suggest to improve the situation? What more can be done?</b>	
<b>Conclusion</b>	<p><b>Thank you for your time....</b></p> <p><b>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</b></p>	

## H. STORIES OF CHANGE GUIDE: COLLECTING STORIES ABOUT SIGNIFICANT CHANGES BY INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEW

<b>Introduction:</b>	Info sheet, consent form and outline of process	
<b>Province/District/Village:</b>		
<b>Name of Respondent:</b>		
<b>Name of Facilitator:</b>		
<b>Date:</b>		
<b>Verbal Consent received:</b>	YES	NO
<b>Facilitator Signature:</b> _____		
<b>Type of Respondent:</b>	Current LSCBE Student	Graduate LSCBE Student
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>		
<p>We are hoping to gather stories and experiences of students that have been part of the lower-secondary community-based school in your community. These stories can be about some of the individual and community changes that you have experienced or observed through your current or previous participation as a student in the community-based lower-secondary school.</p> <p>It should take about one hour. We may want to use your story and other information collected during our interview for a number of purposes including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to tell our donors and stakeholders about the significant changes that have happened to community members as a result of our programs</li> <li>• to help us understand what others think is good and not so good about our programs</li> <li>• to make improvements to our programs.</li> </ul> <p>If you are happy with this, we'll begin the interview and I will write your answers in my notebook. Are you happy to begin?</p>		
<b>QUESTIONS</b>	<b>NOTES</b>	
<p><b>Warm-up: Please tell me about yourself first – what lower-secondary grade are you in now? How many students are in your class? What is your favourite subject? Why?</b></p>		

<p><b>How did you come to continue your education after primary school?</b> <i>Prompt: What challenges did you face? How did you overcome them? What motivated you to continue education?</i></p>	
<p><b>What role did your family play in you continuing your education?</b> <i>Prompt: were they supportive of you continuing your education? Did you have to convince them that secondary school was important? How did you convince them?</i></p>	
<p><b>What do you think about the education you are receiving/received through the LSCBE? What do you think have been the most important lessons?</b></p> <p><i>Prompt: What lessons have you used in your daily life? What skills have you learnt that have proven to be useful in life?</i></p>	
<p><b>In your own words, can you describe the most important change for you personally that has come from being part of CARE's CBE lower secondary school.</b></p> <p><b>Please be as specific as possible and give examples.</b></p>	

<p><b>For graduate students: What did going to CARE's CBE primary/lower secondary school mean for you economically?</b></p> <p><i>How much do you earn now? How do you use your salary? What do you spend it on? What have you been able to do now that you have an income that would have been difficult before?</i></p>	
<p><b>How would you describe the attitudes of men and women in the community towards girls education? Prompt: are they supportive? Have their opinions on girls education changed since you were a small girl? If yes, what made people change their mind?</b></p>	
<p><b>What about the community leaders? Prompt: Who is important in your community? How did and do they see girls education? Did they try to influence people? How?</b></p>	
<p><b>What role did the CARE CBE school play in shaping people's minds about girls education? Please explain.</b></p>	
<p><b>Was there anybody in your community you inspired you? Who helped you and served as a mentor? If yes, please tell me about this person.</b></p>	
<p><b>Are you seen as a mentor by younger girls? Why?</b></p>	

<p><b>Tell me, what skills does a women need to have to be a leader in your community?</b> <i>Prompt: Are these the same as for men, or do women need to have different skills?</i></p>	
<p><b>Do you think that you learned about such leadership skills in school? What skills were taught there?</b> <i>Prompt: How? What about the peer groups? Did you participate in them? What did you learn there? Have you used this knowledge later?</i></p>	
<p><b>What about the Village Education Committee - were you a member? What did you learn there? Have you used this knowledge later?</b></p>	
<p><b>How do you see your future - What would you like to do in the future? What are your hopes? What kind of person do you hope to become?</b></p>	
<p><b>Thank you for your time....</b></p> <p><b>Do you have any questions you would like to ask me? Any other information you would like to share?</b></p> <p><b>REMEMBER TO TAKE A PHOTOGRAPH!!</b></p>	

## I: EVALUATION PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

I ..... give consent to the consultants on behalf of CARE to utilise the confidential information either myself and/or my child has provided about impressions and experiences of the Project to contribute to an evaluation report.

I understand that the information I provide will be used to inform the evaluation findings and possible recommendations about this and future projects funded by CARE International in Afghanistan.

This report will be finalised in October 2019. I understand that although I may be identified as having participated in the evaluation, any information I supply will be kept confidential and I will not be identified in the report, unless I am participating in a Story of Change Interview in which case the information I provide and my photograph may be used for the final report.

I understand that:

- My participation is voluntary and I can withdraw from the evaluation at any time.
- I can determine who may be present during the interview.
- Whether or not I participate in the evaluation will not affect any current or future relationships with CARE.
- The evaluators will seek to keep my information strictly confidential. No information in the report will be attributed to me, unless I am part of a Story of Change Interview.
- I can request any information collected from me to be withdrawn at any time up until the analysis stage.
- The information collected will not be used for any other purpose (than that set out in this consent form).
- If I withdraw, I can request that any information collected from me be returned or destroyed.
- The interview, with my permission, may be recorded, and may be transcribed.
- Digital recordings, notes, and summaries will be stored securely with the evaluators and will not identify me.
- I hereby **do/do not consent to the use of photos** taken during this evaluation for use in the evaluation report and related presentations.

I have been given the opportunity to ask questions. I give my consent to participate in this interview.

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of guardian if applicable: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_